

ARCHIVIO ISTITUZIONALE DELLA RICERCA

Alma Mater Studiorum Università di Bologna Archivio istituzionale della ricerca

Techno-economic performance of HCl and SO2 removal in waste-to-energy plants by furnace direct sorbent injection

This is the final peer-reviewed author's accepted manuscript (postprint) of the following publication:

Published Version:

Dal Pozzo A., Lazazzara L., Antonioni G., Cozzani V. (2020). Techno-economic performance of HCl and SO2 removal in waste-to-energy plants by furnace direct sorbent injection. JOURNAL OF HAZARDOUS MATERIALS, 394, 1-13 [10.1016/j.jhazmat.2020.122518].

Availability:

This version is available at: https://hdl.handle.net/11585/790984 since: 2021-01-24

Published:

DOI: http://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2020.122518

Terms of use:

Some rights reserved. The terms and conditions for the reuse of this version of the manuscript are specified in the publishing policy. For all terms of use and more information see the publisher's website.

This item was downloaded from IRIS Università di Bologna (https://cris.unibo.it/). When citing, please refer to the published version.

(Article begins on next page)



HIGHLIGHTS

Techno-economic performance of HCI and SO₂ removal in waste-toenergy plants by furnace direct sorbent injection

Alessandro Dal Pozzo, Lorenzo Lazazzara, Giacomo Antonioni, Valerio Cozzani * LISES - Dipartimento di Ingegneria Civile, Chimica, Ambientale e dei Materiali, Alma Mater Studiorum - Università di Bologna, via Terracini n.28, 40131 Bologna, Italy

* corresponding author, Tel. +39-051-2090240, Fax +39-051-2090247, e-mail: valerio.cozzani@unibo.it

- Furnace injection of a dolomitic sorbent in WtE plants was tested
- Full-scale test runs were carried out to assess sorbent performance
- A model of acid gas removal efficiency was calibrated
- The dolomitic sorbent reacts at high temperature with acid gases
- The cost-effectiveness of dolomite sorbent injection was assessed

Abstract

2 3

1

4

5 With the impending release of Best Available Techniques (BAT) conclusions on waste 6 incineration, existing European waste-to-energy (WtE) plants will be required to achieve a 7 higher efficiency in the removal of several target pollutants, such as acid gases (above all, HCl and SO₂). The direct injection of a sorbent in the furnace as a primary deacidification 8 9 stage may be a cost-effective option to achieve the required performances. The present study investigated the furnace injection of a specific dolomitic sorbent, with the aim of 10 identifying the techno-economic optimum for the sorbent feed rate considering different 11 scenarios of flue gas composition. A full-scale test run campaign was carried out on two WtE 12 plants and a phenomenological model linking HCl and SO₂ conversion to reactant feed rate 13 14 was developed. The model allowed assessing the cost-effectiveness of dolomitic sorbent 15 furnace injection for WtE plants equipped with either a single or a two-stage acid gas 16 treatment system. The addition of dolomitic sorbent resulted particularly suitable for WtE plants equipped with a single stage treatment coping with a high SO₂ concentration in the 17 flue gas, where the injection of dolomitic sorbent can increase the redundancy of flue gas 18 treatment with a reduction of the total operating costs. 19

1 Techno-economic performance of HCI and SO₂ removal in waste-to-2 energy plants by furnace direct sorbent injection 3

4

5 Alessandro Dal Pozzo, Lorenzo Lazazzara, Giacomo Antonioni, Valerio Cozzani*

6 LISES - Dipartimento di Ingegneria Civile, Chimica, Ambientale e dei Materiali, Alma

7 Mater Studiorum - Università di Bologna, via Terracini n.28, 40131 Bologna, Italy

- 8
- 9 10

(*) corresponding author, Tel. +39-051-2090240, Fax +39-051-2090247, valerio.cozzani@unibo.it

11 12

Revised Version

e-mail:

13

14 Abstract

15 With the impending release of Best Available Techniques (BAT) conclusions on waste incineration, existing European waste-to-energy (WtE) plants will be required to achieve a 16 17 higher efficiency in the removal of several target pollutants, such as acid gases (above all, HCl and SO₂). The direct injection of a sorbent in the furnace as a primary deacidification 18 stage may be a cost-effective option to achieve the required performances. The present 19 study investigated the furnace injection of a specific dolomitic sorbent, with the aim of 20 21 identifying the techno-economic optimum for the sorbent feed rate considering different 22 scenarios of flue gas composition. A full-scale test run campaign was carried out on two WtE plants and a phenomenological model linking HCl and SO₂ conversion to reactant feed rate 23 24 was developed. The model allowed assessing the cost-effectiveness of dolomitic sorbent furnace injection for WtE plants equipped with either a single or a two-stage acid gas 25 treatment system. The addition of dolomitic sorbent resulted particularly suitable for WtE 26 plants equipped with a single stage treatment coping with a high SO₂ concentration in the 27 28 flue gas, where the injection of dolomitic sorbent can increase the redundancy of flue gas 29 treatment with a reduction of the total operating costs.

30

Keywords 31

- 32 Waste-to-energy; Flue gas treatment; Acid gas removal; Sorbent; Furnace injection.
- 33
- 34

35 **1. Introduction**

Acid gases such as HCl and SO₂ are typical pollutants formed in waste combustion, whenever chlorine and sulphur are present in the waste feed [1]. Control of their emission in waste-to-energy (WtE) facilities is performed by reaction with neutralising agents, supplied either as absorbent solutions in wet scrubbing equipment or as powdered alkaline sorbents in dry injection systems [2-6].

Given the recent trends in waste generation and management [7,8], overall Cl and S content in the waste feed of European WtE plants is increasing, due to the increasing amounts of industrial wastes fed to these disposal systems. On the other hand, WtE installations are subject to the strictest emission limits among all combustion facilities [9] and the release of the new Best Available Techniques (BAT) Reference Document for waste incineration [10] will further raise the bar, introducing new, ambitious emission targets.

The adoption of multi-stage treatment systems for the removal of acid gases, *i.e.* the combination of more than one unit for acid gas treatment, will be needed in many situations to obtain the required removal efficiency.

For retrofitting applications, the introduction of an additional acid gas removal stage should ideally require minimal impact on plant layout and limited investment costs. Furnace sorbent injection (FSI), *i.e.* the introduction of a powdered solid reactant for the capture of acid gases directly in the combustion chamber, is a method that meets both criteria [11,12]. The reactant is injected directly in the flow path of the flue gas by pneumatic conveying. Then, the reacted particles are deposited on the surface of the heat exchange equipment, thus a dedicated separation equipment is generally not required [13].

FSI was first introduced as a desulfurisation technique in coal combustion [14,15]. The 57 sorbent, typically limestone, is blended with coal or injected with staged air [16]. Once 58 59 introduced in the furnace at high temperature, limestone is calcined to calcium oxide (CaO), 60 with the development of a porous structure that increases its reactivity towards acid gases. SO₂ removal efficiencies in the range 40-70% are expected [17,18]. Petrini et al. [19], Mura 61 62 and Lallai [20] and Partanen et al. [21] demonstrated experimentally the suitability of high temperature reaction with limestone also for HCl capture. However, the reactivity of 63 limestone at high temperature is hindered by pronounced sintering [22]. The onset of 64 65 sintering for calcium carbonate occurs at T ~ 500 °C [23], whereas the injection near to the combustion area exposes the sorbent at temperatures ranging from 800 to 1200 °C. Upon 66 sintering, the porous structure of the sorbent collapses and the surface area decreases, 67 68 leading to a reduced sorption activity. Alternative Ca-based sorbents, as organic calcium salts [24,25] or, specifically, calcium magnesium acetate [26,27] have been proposed with 69 the aim of achieving higher acid gas removal efficiency thanks to superior surface areas. 70

71 More recently, commercial sorbents derived from dolomite rock have been introduced, with 72 the aim of overcoming the limitations of limestone. The presence of magnesium confers a higher resistance to sintering [28] and reduces the clogging and fouling that the deposition of 73 74 limestone residues typically causes to boilers [29]. Biganzoli et al. [30] offered a first 75 quantitative assessment of the full-scale acid gas removal performance of a dolomitic 76 sorbent, carrying out a test campaign in four Italian WtE facilities. They observed that a furnace sorbent injection at a feed rate of 6 kg/twaste yielded a reduction of acid gas 77 78 concentration downstream of the boiler in the range 7–37% for HCl and 34–95% for SO₂.

79 The aim of the present study is to collect extended and detailed quantitative information on 80 the performance of acid gas removal based on dolomitic sorbent direct furnace injection, 81 quantifying the relationship between reactant feed rate and acid gas removal efficiency. The 82 effectiveness of reactant injection towards HCl and SO₂ was systematically investigated by 83 full-scale test runs carried out in two Italian WtE facilities. The experimental data were used 84 to develop a specific phenomenological model for removal efficiency with respect to sorbent 85 feed and initial acid gas concentrations. The model was used to assess the economics of the 86 process, also considering the other acid gas treatment stages and the composition of the 87 inlet flue gas stream.

- 88
- 89

90 2. Materials and methods

91

92 2.1 The dolomitic sorbent

The solid reactant tested in the experimental campaign, commercially known as Depurcal and supplied by Unicalce SpA (Italy), is obtained via the calcination and slaking of dolomite rock. The reactant, referred to as dolomitic sorbent (DS) in the following, is mainly composed of calcium hydroxide (Ca(OH)₂), magnesium hydroxide (Mg(OH)₂) and magnesium oxide (MgO). According to patent information [29], an average composition on mass basis of the DS is the following: 58.2% Ca(OH)₂, 22.3% Mg(OH)₂, 19.2% MgO and 0.3% impurities (SiO₂, Fe₂O₃, Al₂O₃).

100

101 2.2. Reference WtE plants

102 The experimental assessment of DS performance was carried out in two Italian WtE facilities, here referred to as plant A and plant B. The key features of the two plants are 103 104 summarised in Table 1, while the layout of their acid gas treatment systems is sketched in 105 Figure 1. With respect to acid gas removal, plant A presents a two-stage treatment system 106 (Fig. 1a), consisting in the injection of calcium hydroxide, Ca(OH)₂, and sodium bicarbonate, 107 NaHCO₃, respectively in two consecutive sections of reaction and filtration. Hence, the introduction of a FSI of the dolomitic sorbent realises a three-stage acid gas removal system. 108 Conversely, plant B is equipped with a single acid gas treatment stage fed with sodium 109 110 bicarbonate (Fig. 1b). Here, the FSI of the dolomitic sorbent introduces a second stage of acid gas removal. 111

The acid gas treatment lines of the two selected facilities represent two of the most common configurations for WtE flue gas treatment [31] and are both listed among the best available techniques for waste incineration [10]. The reactions between the solid sorbents and the acid

- gases are illustrated in section S4 of the Supplementary Material.
- 116
- 117 **Table 1.** Main features of the WtE plants considered in the study.

	Plant A	Plant B
Nominal capacity (t _{waste} /h)	16	9.5
Average flue gas flow rate (Nm ³ /h)	110′000	65′000
Range of HCl concentration in the untreated flue gas (mg/Nm ³)	600-1000	800-1400
Range of SO ₂ concentration in the untreated flue gas (mg/Nm ³)	10-100	10-100
Acid gas treatment line	Ca(OH) ₂ + FF + NaHCO ₃ + FF	NaHCO₃ + FF



126

Figure 1. Configurations of acid gas treatment in the two plants used for the experimental tests: a) two-stage system $(CaOH)_2 + NaHCO_3)$, which becomes a three-stage system with the furnace injection of dolomitic sorbent, and b) single stage system (NaHCO₃), which becomes a two-stage system with the furnace injection of dolomitic sorbent. The points where measurement of flue gas composition is available are highlighted.

127 **2.3 Test configurations and protocols**

Figure 1 shows the feed point of the sorbent in the two plants. The dolomitic sorbent was 128 injected to the top of the combustion chamber by means of a screw feeder that allowed the 129 130 control of the feed rate. The injected DS reacted with the acid pollutants both while entrained 131 in the flue gas stream and after deposition on the surface of the boiler. The concentration of the acid pollutants (primarily, HCl and SO₂) in the flue gas was measured by Fourier-132 transform infrared (FTIR) spectrometry at the boiler outlet. In both plants, the FTIR device 133 installed at the boiler outlet was part of a continuous emission monitoring system (CEMS) 134 compliant with the Quality Assurance Level 3 (QAL3, see EN 14181 [32,33]) required by the 135 EU Industrial Emissions Directive [34]. 136

137

138 2.3.1 Test runs in specific operating conditions

The relationship between DS feed rate and HCI/SO₂ removal was analysed quantitatively by 139 140 dedicated test runs. The test runs were carried out injecting the reactant at incremental steps of constant feed rate for defined time intervals. The steps of feed rate tested were: 40, 60, 141 90, 100 and 200 kg/h for plant A, ranging from to 0.36 to 1.8 kg/10³ Nm³; 40, 120 and 200 142 kg/h for plant B, ranging from 0.62 to 3.1 kg/10³ Nm³. The injection of reactant was stopped 143 for 40 min between each feed rate step to allow monitoring the acid gas concentrations in 144 the untreated gas and to avoid any residual effect of the injected DS in the previous step of 145 146 feed rate on the following step. Table 2 provides the list of all the tests completed.

Data analysis was carried out considering the trend of acid gas concentration at the boiler
outlet during the tests. Figure 2 shows the supply of different DS feed rates and the effect on
HCI and SO₂ concentrations at the boiler outlet during one of the test runs. The conversion

of HCl or SO₂ related to each step of DS feed rate was calculated from the difference in acid
 gas concentration before and after the start of DS injection:

152

(1)

where Cacid gas, w/o DS is the concentration measured in the minute before DS injection and Cacid 153 gas, w DS is the pseudo-stationary concentration measured during DS injection after the 154 transient of concentration decrease was concluded. Similarly, the conversion of acid gases 155 related to each step of DS feed rate was also calculated when DS injection was stopped. In 156 157 these cases, Cacid das.w DS was taken as the concentration measured in the minute before the interruption of DS injection, while Cacid gas, w/o DS was the pseudo-stationary concentration 158 measured after DS injection was interrupted and the concentration increase transient was 159 concluded. 160

A screening protocol was established to accept the experimental data, given the uncertainty due to fluctuations in acid gas concentration formed in combustion flue gas. The exclusion of outliers (i.e. data for which an abrupt variation of HCI and SO₂ generated by waste combustion either covers or magnifies the effect of DS injection) was performed during model fitting by least trimmed squares regression [35], as described in section 3.1.

166

167 **Table 2.** Test runs performed and steps of reactant feed rate.

		'			'				
DS feed	Plant A					Plant B			
rate (kg/h)				Te	st id.				Test id.
	1A	2A	3A	4A	5A	6A	7A	8A	1B
40	√	✓	√	√	√	√	√	√	√
60 ^a	√	✓	√	√	√	√	√	√	
90						√	√	√	
100	√	✓	√	√	√				
120									√
200	√	√	√	√	√				√

168 ^a the feed rate at 60 kg/h was imposed before and after each test run, as it was the selected constant

169 rate for the 3-month experimental campaign described in section 2.3.2



Figure 2. (a) Feed rate of dolomitic sorbent, and corresponding (b) HCl and (c) SO₂ outlet concentration during test 3A. The symbols I and O indicate respectively the time intervals with and without DS injection. Dots are 5-min moving average values of measured concentration.

2.3.2 Test run in normal operating conditions 182

In plant A, the injection of DS was also tested for 3 consecutive months during normal 183 operation of the facility. DS was fed to the flue gas treatment line at a constant feed rate of 184 60 kg/h (0.55 kg reactant/10³ Nm³ of flue gas, considering the average flow rate reported in 185 Table 1). The values of HCl and SO₂ concentration at the boiler outlet, continuously 186 monitored by the FTIR device during the test period, were collected and compared to the 187 188 same data measured in the previous 3 months of operation without DS injection. The 189 comparison was made considering for the two periods the distribution of the hourly averages 190 of concentration values. The overall 3-month average concentration in the period \overline{C}_{period} and the related standard deviation σ_{period} were calculated starting from the hourly average 191 concentrations, as follows: 192



194

195

196 The total cumulative mass flow of HCl and SO₂ at the boiler outlet over the 3 months was 197 also compared between the two periods.

The main objective of this analysis was to assess the global effect of the dolomitic sorbent in 198 reducing the average concentration of acid gases exiting the combustion chamber. This 199 200 comparison is based on the underlying assumption that the average concentration of acid pollutants in the raw flue gas upstream of DS injection during the 3 months of DS injection is 201 approximately the same as that measured at the boiler outlet in the previous 3 months 202 203 without DS injection. This assumption is valid only if there is no significant seasonal effect in 204 waste composition that varies the raw HCI and SO₂ concentration between a 3-month period and the following. The validity of this assumption was checked by comparing the 205 concentration data at boiler outlet for the same two 3-month periods in the previous year 206 (referred to in the following as 'control year'), when no DS testing was carried out. As 207 208 discussed in section 4.1, no appreciable variation of acid gas concentration at boiler outlet was found between the two 3-month periods of the control year. 209

210 211

3. Models 212

213

214 3.1 Modelling of the performance of dolomitic sorbent

When the sorbent is injected in the combustion chamber of a WtE plant, at temperatures 215 higher than 800 °C, the hydroxides decompose releasing water vapor and forming meso and 216 macropores in the material [30]. 217

218

(4)

The development of the porous structure promotes the reactivity of the sorbent towards acid 219 220 gases. The possible reactions with HCl and SO₂ are the following:

- 223
- 224

However, it is generally assumed that MgO is chemically inert to acid gases at the 225 temperatures of interest (800-1000 °C), on the basis of experimental findings at laboratory 226 [21] and pilot scale [15]. A wide literature on the high-temperature CO₂ sorption by dolomitic 227 compounds provides similar evidence [23,36]. In addition, a thermodynamic analysis of 228 reactions 5-8, shown in section S1 of the Supplementary Material, confirms that, at 229 temperatures higher than 900°C, only the reactions between acid gases and the Ca-based 230 231 phase of the sorbent present a negative Gibbs free energy of reaction. Therefore, in the 232 activated dolomitic sorbent after reaction 4, it is considered that CaO is the reactive 233 compound towards acid gases, while MgO acts almost exclusively as structural agent, preventing the collapse of the porous structure developed in reaction 4, as suggested by 234 Biganzoli et al. [30]. 235

A phenomenological model for the description of the acid gas removal process by solid sorbents was used to generalise the information obtained from the test runs. The modelling approach is described comprehensively in a previous study [37]. The model correlates the removal efficiency of an acid pollutant i (X_i) to the stoichiometric ratio SR of sorbent j at a generic time:

241

where SR can be assessed as the ratio of the actual feed rate of the sorbent to the feed rate theoretically required to convert all the acid pollutant *i* in the inlet gas stream over a time interval of interest. The exponent *n* is an empirical parameter that lumps together the effect of all the variables influencing the gas-solid reaction (reactivity of the sorbent, operating conditions such as temperature and humidity, fluid-dynamics of the system). As such, the value of *n* needs to be calculated from the test run data and is specific of the facility.

248 In the present study, least trimmed squares fitting was used to calculate the values of 249 interest of $n_{i,j}$ using the experimental data from the test runs. The model in Eq. 9 was log-250 linearised as follows:

251 —

Linear regression was then used to fit the model to the test run data and the least trimmed squares procedure [35] for outlier exclusion was applied until a satisfactorily high value of R^2 was obtained for the fitted model ($R^2 > 0.99$ for HCl, $R^2 > 0.95$ for SO₂).

255 In order to apply the model to the dolomitic sorbent, it was assumed that its sorption capacity towards acid gases is entirely ascribed to the Ca-based fraction (i.e. Ca(OH)₂ that 256 257 decomposes to CaO upon furnace injection), while the Mg-based compounds (MgO, $Mg(OH)_2$) have only the role to avoid the high-temperature sintering of the material and do 258 not participate to the gas-solid reactions, as discussed above. Therefore, the SR was 259 defined on the basis of the Ca content in the sorbent. According to the typical composition of 260 the sorbent reported in section 2.1, the weight fraction of $Ca(OH)_2$ in the DS is 0.58. A 261 weight fraction of 0.42 is obtained when considering the amount of CaO formed from 262 hydroxide dehydration at high temperature after DS injection in the furnace. It was thus 263

(9)

(10)

(7)

(8)

- 264 possible to express the data from test runs in terms of SR_{CaO} and the related acid gas 265 conversions $X_{HCI,CaO}$ and $X_{SO2,CaO}$.
- In particular, the mass feed rates of sorbent injected in the test
 runs, SR_{CaO} as follows:
- 268 _____ (11)

- In order to model the overall performance of the multi-stage acid gas removal process implemented by both plant A and plant B, Eq. 9 was applied as well to the other stages of acid gas removal. Details on the models and on the procedure for model calibration are reported in section S4 of the Supplementary Material.
- 276

3.2 Modelling approach for the optimisation of acid gas removal

The cost-effectiveness of the introduction of DS injection in the acid gas removal process can be evaluated estimating the overall operating costs of the process given the initial and final acid gas concentrations. In a multi-stage treatment system, the required overall removal efficiency can be obtained by different distributions of reactants in the removal stages. Therefore, the objective of the optimisation is to assess the share of acid gas removal by DS injection that minimises the overall operating costs of the process.

The performance model of section 3.1 was used to simulate the removal efficiencies of each step in the acid gas abatement line. Simulations were performed for both plant A and plant B. To take into account the variability of acid gas load, six different cases of raw flue gas composition, listed in Table 3, were considered. The six cases cover the typical range of HCl and SO₂ concentrations in the untreated flue gas for the WtE plants that hosted the experimental campaign (see Table 1). The average flue gas flow rate of each plant (see Table 1) and a concentration at stack of 2 mg/Nm³ of HCl were considered in all the cases.

291

Table 3. Cases of raw flue gas composition considered in the optimisation study.

	C _{HCI}	C _{SO2}
	(mg/Nm ³)	(mg/Nm ³)
Low CI, low S	600	10
Medium CI, low S	1000	10
High CI, low S	1400	10
Low CI, high S	600	200
Medium Cl, high S	1000	200
High Cl, high S	1400	200

293

Different configurations of the multi-stage treatment system were explored varying the HCI conversion in the different stages, while keeping equal the overall efficiency of HCI removal

in the system:

297

(12)

where N is the total number of abatement stages (2 for plant B, 3 for plant A), and $X_{HCI,j}$ is HCI conversion in stage j. The value of $X_{SO2,overall}$ could not be kept constant as well, as different repartitions of abatement between the stages were explored in the simulations, because each sorbent has a different relative reactivity towards HCl and SO₂. Nonetheless, given the significantly lower amount of SO₂ compared to HCl in the raw flue gases considered in Table 3, the concentration of SO₂ at stack resulted similar and lower than 1 mg/Nm³ in all the simulations.

The consumption of reactants associated to the acid gas conversion in each abatement stage can then be calculated considering the reaction stoichiometry (Eqs. 4-6 for the dolomitic sorbent, Eqs. S5-S9 in section S4 of the Supplementary Material for the other reactants) and the model correlation provided by Eq. 9. Given the acid gas conversion and the required consumption of reactants, the mass rate and composition of the solid process residues generated in each stage can be quantified by means of a mass balance.

311 The overall operating cost of acid gas treatment was thus estimated as:

312

(13)

where C_{reactants} and C_{residues} are the costs respectively associated to the purchase of reactant 313 and the management of process residues for each treatment stage. The values adopted for 314 the unit costs are listed in Table 4. These numbers are average values for the Italian 315 316 context. For a detailed overview on the cost data of dry acid gas treatment operations the reader is referred to Dal Pozzo et al. [37]. Here, it is worth recalling that the management 317 of process residues is associated to two different fates and costs. Streams of residues 318 319 that are mixed with fly ash coming from the combustion chamber and potentially 320 carrying hazardous materials in traces (heavy metals, organochlorinated compounds) 321 are to be sent to dedicated landfill sites [38,39]. Hence, recalling the schemes in Figure 1, this is the case for the residues of dolomitic sorbent, calcium hydroxide, and 322 sodium bicarbonate, if no upstream dedusting equipment is installed (see Fig. 1b). 323 324 Conversely, the process residues generated by the reaction between sodium bicarbonate and acid pollutants can be sent to dedicated recycling facilities [40] if a fabric filter is 325 326 installed upstream of NaHCO₃ injection to collect separately the fly ash (see Fig. 1a).

327

328	Table 4.	Values of the	unit costs ado	pted in the stud	ly for the considerea	cost entries.
-----	----------	---------------	----------------	------------------	-----------------------	---------------

Cost entry	Unit cost (€/t)
Reactants	
Dolomitic sorbent	100
Calcium hydroxide	50
Sodium bicarbonate	240
Management of process residues	
Disposal (residues mixed with fly ash)	200
Recycling (Na residues separated from fly ash)	170

329 330

4. Results and discussion

332

4.1 Test run in normal operating conditions: effect of DS injection on the concentration of HCl and SO₂ leaving the furnace

- 335 The test run in normal operating conditions conducted at plant A had the aim of
- 336 assessing the effect of a fixed feed rate of DS injection on the flue gas composition leaving the

- furnace/boiler. The outcome of the test run on plant A in normal operating conditions was evaluated comparing the hourly data of HCl and SO_2 concentrations in the gas at the boiler outlet (first sampling point in Figure 1a) for the two 3-month periods with and without DS injection, as described in the sampling protocol of section 2.3.2.
- The hourly concentration data measured at the boiler outlet in each 3-month period were put in ascending order and multiplied with their respective hourly flue gas flowrate data, in order to obtain a curve of cumulative mass flow of the acid pollutants exiting the boiler.
- Fig. 3a shows the cumulative mass flow of HCl at the boiler outlet for the two reference periods. The total mass flow of HCl leaving the combustion chamber measured in the 3 months of DS injection amounted to 164.7t, compared to 218.2t for the 3 months without DS injection. A 25% reduction of the HCl mass flow released in the reference period is thus observed as a consequence of DS injection.
- 349 More specifically, the cumulated mass flow curves in Fig. 3a trace how the hourly data of 350 HCl concentration measured at the boiler outlet contributed to the total mass flow in the two 3-month periods. The concentration of HCI measured at the sampling point fluctuates over 351 time as a natural consequence of the variable CI content of the waste burnt in the furnace: in 352 353 this plant, Fig. 3a shows that during the 3-month period without DS injection the HCI concentration varied mostly from 400 to 1500 mg/Nm³ with peaks up to 3000 mg/Nm³. In the 354 3 months of DS injection this range of variation moved towards lower values (the cumulated 355 mass flow curve with DS injection is shifted leftward compared to that for the period without 356 DS injection). This is further clarified by the distributions of the hourly averages of HCI 357 concentration at the boiler outlet for the two reference periods shown in Fig. 3b. The hourly 358 359 values of HCl concentration recorded at the boiler outlet during the two 3-month periods were subdivided in the 5 classes of the figure. For each class, the frequency of occurrence 360 of concentration values within that class range is reported as percent of the total hourly 361 362 concentration data in the 3-month period. The furnace injection of DS clearly resulted in a shift of the distribution of HCI concentration towards lower values. With DS injection, the 363 frequency of concentrations higher than 800 mg/Nm³ is more than halved, while the 364 occurrence of concentrations in the interval 400-600 mg/Nm³ is approximately tripled. 365
- The overall 3-month average of the hourly HCl concentration data at the boiler outlet with DS 366 injection resulted of 702 mg/Nm³, compared to a value of 897 mg/Nm³ for the 3-month 367 period without DS injection. This corresponds to an average 22% reduction of the HCl load 368 369 leaving the combustion chamber thanks to the DS effect. Furthermore, also the standard 370 deviation of the hourly HCl concentration data exhibited a noticeable decrease: a value of 287 mg/Nm³ was obtained during DS injection, with respect to a value of 323 mg/Nm³ in the 371 period without DS injection. A reduction of the standard deviation means that the hourly HCI 372 concentration values at the sampling point were less dispersed during DS injection and, 373 374 thus, less peaks at high HCl concentration were present compared to the period without DS iniection. 375
- 376 To confirm that all the aforementioned effects were owing to the DS injection and not to a change of other operating conditions between the two 3-month periods, an identical analysis 377 378 was carried out for the same 3-month periods in the previous year of operation of the plant, when no DS testing was performed. The results are shown in section S2 of the 379 380 Supplementary Material. No appreciable difference in the mass flow of HCI and in the distribution of HCI concentration was observed between the first and the second period of 381 the control year. A difference lower than 2% is present among the 3-month average HCI 382 383 concentrations for the two periods. Therefore, it is reasonable to assume that the reduction of the average HCl concentration in the flue gas observed in Fig. 3a and 3b is due to the 384

- addition of DS and not to a variation in the overall average composition of the wastefeed between the periods.
- 387 The results observed with reference to SO_2 are similar to those obtained for HCI. Fig.
- 388 3c shows that the cumulative mass flow of SO_2 in the 3 months of DS injection was 389 equal to 5.3t, a 37% reduction compared to the 8.4 t calculated for the 3-month period
- 390 without DS injection.
- 391 It is evident that during DS injection, as observed for HCl, lower SO_2 concentrations at
- 392 the sampling point appeared more frequently than in the reference period without DS
- injection. As shown in Fig. 3d, more than 60% of the hourly SO₂ concentration data
- measured in the period with DS injection show values lower 15 mg/Nm³, while the
- 395 occurrences in all the frequency classes higher than 15 mg/Nm³ diminish systematically 396 compared to the period without DS injection.
- The overall 3-month average of the hourly SO_2 concentration data at the boiler outlet in the 398 3-month period with DS injection resulted of 22.7 mg/Nm³, compared to a value of 31.4 399 mg/Nm³ without DS injection (a 28% reduction). Again, also the standard deviation of the 400 hourly SO_2 concentration data was noticeably lower during DS injection: 40.6 mg/Nm³ vs. 401 52.6 mg/Nm³.
- For the control year (see section S2 in the Supplementary Material), no significant difference 402 in the global 3-month average concentration was recorded: the average SO₂ concentration 403 at the boiler outlet was 32.1 mg/Nm³ in the first period and 31.0 mg/Nm³ in the 404 second period. The total mass flow of SO₂ measured in the 3 months varied less than 2% 405 between the two periods. Again, it is confirmed that in normal operation the overall 406 407 conditions at the boiler outlet remains generally constant between contiguous 3-month 408 periods, thus the observed reduction of HCl and SO₂ mass flow for the 3 months of 409 DS testing can be reasonably ascribed to the effect of DS injection.
- 410



412

Figure 3. Analysis of the effect of DS injection: a) cumulative mass flow of HCl at the boiler outlet in period 1 (without DS injection) and in period 2 (with DS injection); b) distribution of the hourly averages of HCl concentration at the boiler outlet in the two periods; c) cumulative mass flow of SO₂ at the boiler outlet in the two periods; d) distribution of the hourly averages of SO₂ concentration at the boiler outlet in the two periods.

418 **4.2 Test runs in specific operating conditions: effect of DS feed rate**

419 As introduced in section 2.3.1, the test runs at specific operating conditions were carried 420 out varying the feed rate of the DS injected in the furnace. The objective of this specific 421 set of test runs was to collect data with a finer time resolution than the macroscopic 422 analysis of section 4.1 and to provide a quantitative evaluation of the relation between feed rate of reactant and removal efficiency of the acid pollutants. The test runs allowed 423 collecting data on the difference in HCI and SO₂ concentration measured at the sampling 424 point before and after DS injection at different feed rates, hence obtaining a dataset 425 of HCl and SO₂ conversion at different SR of dolomitic sorbent injection. Tables S2 and 426 S3 in section S3 of the Supplementary Material report the complete datasets obtained, 427 428 which were used to calibrate the phenomenological model developed for acid gas 429 conversion. The detailed results of all the test runs are also provided in section S3 of the Supplementary Material. 430

431

432 **4.3 Model results**

The datasets related to plant A and plant B obtained from the test runs were used to calibrate the phenomenological model presented in section 3.1 and to determine the values of parameter *n* for the two acid pollutants. As mentioned in section 3.1, the least trimmed squares method was adopted for concurrent outlier exclusion and model fitting. The following values of *n* were obtained for plant A: 1.38 for HCl and 5.26 for SO₂. The corresponding values of *n* obtained for plant B are: 1.36 for HCl and 7.29 for SO₂.

The fitting of calibration data points for plant A is shown in Fig. 4a and 4b, for HCl and

441 SO₂ sorption respectively. Only the sample points after outlier removal are reported,

442 while the complete dataset is presented in section S3 of the Supplementary Material. An

- additional data point representing the average performance of the dolomitic sorbent during
- the 3-month campaign analysed in section 4.1 is also reported in the figure, showing a quite good alignment with the data from the test run campaign. Fig. 4c and 4d reports
- 446 the fitting of data points for plant B.
- 447 In relative terms, the dolomitic sorbent shows a markedly higher sorption capacity
- towards SO₂ than towards HCl. Hence, the DS behaves differently than the reactants
- injected at low temperatures (calcium hydroxide and sodium bicarbonate), which exhibit a
- 450 higher reactivity towards HCI (see data in section S4 of the Supplementary Material).
- 451 In absolute terms, the reactivity of the DS via furnace injection towards SO₂ is
- 452 significantly higher than that of calcium hydroxide via low-temperature injection in the flue gas ductwork. Conversely, the DS appears less reactive than calcium hydroxide with respect to HCI.



Figure 4. Phenomenological model results (continuous line) compared to calibration data for
plant A: a) HCl removal, b) SO₂ removal; and plant B: c) HCl removal, d) SO₂ removal.
The dotted line corresponds to stoichiometric efficiency.

457

458 The model results for plant A and plant B were compared to each other in Fig. 5. The 459 tests on plant B had the main intent to confirm the general trends identified on plant A. Indeed, the model curve obtained fitting the data points available for plant B appears quite 460 similar to the model curve obtained for plant A. Clearly enough, the semi-empirical nature 461 of the model implies that its calibration parameter, n, is site-specific, thus valid only for the 462 description of the performance of the plant where the model was calibrated via test runs. 463 However, the results in Fig. 5 confirm that the model has the potential to fit (after a 464 specific tuning) experimental results across different WtE facilities, with different 465 capacity, layout and average acid gas loads. 466

467 Fig. 5 also compares the model results of this study with data of DS performance collected

- 468 in four WtE plants by Biganzoli et al. [30], the only other report on DS furnace
- 469 injection available in the literature, to the best of our knowledge. The data of ref. [30] were obtained

by calculating the SR of DS injection from the information on reactant feed rate and acid gasconcentrations given by the authors, under the assumptions of section 3.1.

472 At least for HCl, there is a fairly good agreement between the model results and the 473 experimental data set by Biganzoli et al. [30], even if no specific tuning of the model was 474 made. This further supports the comparability of HCl removal efficiency data by DS furnace 475 injection across different WtE facilities.

With respect to SO₂, the data by Biganzoli et al. [30] exhibit a much wider scatter than those presented in Fig. 4b, arguably owing to the uncertainty associated to the lower and more variable loads of this pollutant formed in waste combustion across different WtE plants. In that regard, a merit of the test runs of the present study is to offer a robust and ample set of homogeneous data on SO₂ removal by DS injection obtained in a single WtE plant (Fig. 4b).

481 In general, the analysis of the results in Fig. 5 support the robustness of the experimental 482 and modelling approach adopted in the present study.

483 In addition, the data of Fig. 4 are of clear interest for WtE operators, because only full-scale testing can assess the performance of sorbent in presence of specific process conditions 484 485 (e.g. fluid-dynamics of the process in the furnace/boiler environment, interference between 486 gas species, morphological evolution of sorbent particles injected in the furnace) that are not easily reproducible at laboratory scale. For instance, laboratory data available for the 487 dolomitic sorbent [29], collected in a fixed bed reactor at 900 °C, showed a conversion of 488 SO_2 in the range 78-82% (tests in SO_2/N_2 atmosphere, SO_2 inlet concentration of 1070 489 mg/Nm³, SR_{CaO} = 2) and a conversion of HCl in the range 67-72% (tests in HCl/N₂) 490 atmosphere, HCl inlet concentration of 1430 mg/Nm³, SR_{CaO} = 2). The present full-scale 491 results demonstrated that the conversion of HCI that should be expected in a real furnace is 492 493 lower than the laboratory results (here, a $SR_{CaO} = 2$ corresponds to a HCl conversion slightly 494 lower than 40%; see Fig. 4). Conversely, the conversion of SO₂ registered at full-scale is 495 higher than that observed at laboratory scale (here, a $SR_{CaO} = 2$ corresponds to a SO_2 conversion higher than 90%; see Fig. 4), presumably owing to the significantly lower 496 concentration of SO₂ typically measured at plant (< 200 mg/Nm³) compared to the value 497 498 adopted in laboratory, and a possible synergic effect on SO₂ sorption given by the presence of HCl or its product of reaction CaCl₂ [41,42]. It is thus clear that the quantification of 499 500 removal efficiencies at full scale is necessary to obtain reliable data for the economic 501 assessment.



503

Figure 5. Results of phenomenological models for plant A and plant B compared to literature data for: a) HCl, b) SO₂. The models were used without calibration to the specific operating conditions of plants where literature data were obtained.

509 **4.4 Optimisation of multi-stage acid gas removal processes**

510 The developed phenomenological model allows addressing the minimisation of the operating 511 costs of multi-stage acid gas removal processes. In the following, the cost-effectiveness of 512 introducing a FSI of dolomitic sorbent was preliminarily assessed for both plants A and B, 513 given the process constraints of section 3.2 and using the specific calibration data obtained 514 for the model. In the economic assessment, only the costs for the procurement of sorbents 515 and the management of residues were considered, being the most important operating cost 516 entries in determining process economics [37,43].

517

518 4.4.1 Two-stage optimisation: dolomitic sorbent + NaHCO₃ (plant B)

The search for the optimal repartition of acid gas abatement between DS and sodium 519 bicarbonate feed for a plant equipped with a furnace injection of dolomitic sorbent and a 520 subsequent in-duct injection of NaHCO₃ (see the scheme of plant B, in Fig. 1b) was 521 performed varying the conversion of HCI at the DS stage, while keeping constant the HCI 522 concentration at stack. The results are shown in Fig. 6 in terms of overall operating cost (€ 523 per Nm³ of treated flue gas) as a function of HCl conversion by the dolomitic sorbent, for the 524 different cases of flue gas composition introduced in Table 3. The minimum of each curve 525 represents the optimal operating point for the corresponding inlet flue gas composition. 526 Clearly enough, the cost associated to the operation of the acid gas removal system without 527 DS injection is that corresponding to $X_{HCI,dolomitic sorb} = 0\%$. 528



Figure 6. Operating costs of the dolomitic sorbent + $NaHCO_3$ two-stage system as a function of HCl conversion in the DS stage for the six cases of flue gas composition in Table 3: a) low content of Cl; b) medium content of Cl; c) high content of Cl. Open circles: minimum cost.

530

536 The curves for the six scenarios considered for flue gas composition exhibit a common behaviour. There is a region where variation of costs is limited (X_{HCI,dolomitic sorb} < 30%), while 537 costs start increasing steeply at higher X_{HCI,dolomitic sorb} values. As shown by the open circles, 538 an optimum is always present and it corresponds to a X_{HCI,dolomitic sorb} value of 16 and 23%, 539 respectively for the low S and high S scenarios. The cost savings of the optimal operating 540 541 point of the DS + NaHCO₃ configuration with respect to the single stage NaHCO₃ injection 542 are of about 6% for the low S cases. For the high S cases, instead, the savings range from 543 10% to 13%. The cost-effectiveness of the DS injection at higher SO₂ concentration and 544 higher S/CI ratio in the inlet flue gas stems from the higher relative reactivity of the dolomitic sorbent towards SO₂ compared to sodium bicarbonate. 545

Figure 7 details the contribution of the different entries to the overall operating cost for the 546 scenarios of medium CI and low or high S in the flue gas. The single stage NaHCO₃ system 547 and the DS + NaHCO₃ configuration at the optimal operating point are compared. The 548 addition of DS reduces the total cost related to reactant procurement, as the expense for DS 549 and NaHCO₃ in the two-stage system is 11 and 20% lower than the expense for NaHCO₃ 550 551 alone in the single stage configuration, respectively for the low and high S cases. 552 Conversely, when DS injection is present, the cost associated to the management of 553 process residues increases of 5 and 10% for the low and high S cases. This is due to the combined effect of a higher unit cost for the management route of DS residues (see Table 4) 554 and the weight gain associated with acid gas capture: considering the sorption of HCl, a 555 mole of dolomitic sorbent, upon dehydration and chloridisation (Eqs. 1 and 2), exhibits a 556 22% mass increase, while a mole of sodium bicarbonate, after thermal activation and 557 chloridisation, undergoes a 69.5% net weight loss. On the whole, the net effect of DS 558 injection at the optimal feed rate is the slight reduction of operating costs shown in Fig. 6, 559 560 resulting from lower costs for reactants and higher costs for residues handling.



562

Figure 7. Contribution of the different cost entries to the overall operating costs of acid gas
removal for the single stage bicarbonate system (no furnace injection) and for the two-stage
system with DS injection at the optimal operating point (optimum). Medium Cl and: a) low S,
b) high S compositions were considered for flue gas.

569 4.4.2 Three-stage optimisation: dolomitic sorbent + $Ca(OH)_2$ + $NaHCO_3$ (plant A)

For an acid gas treatment line as that of plant A, already presenting two stages of sorbent injection (calcium hydroxide and sodium bicarbonate), the introduction of DS injection forms a three-stage system. As such, the system exhibits two degrees of freedom in the selection of acid gas removal repartition between the stages, at a fixed overall HCl removal efficiency. Therefore, the evolution of the overall operating cost (\in per Nm³ of treated flue gas) was explored as a function of HCl conversion in both the DS injection stage and the Ca(OH)₂ injection stage, as shown in the contour plots of Fig. 8.

As for the two-stage system, the optimal operating point of the three-stage system, 577 pinpointed by a circle dot in the panels of Fig. 8, includes an injection of dolomitic sorbent, 578 corresponding to 9-10% X_{HCI dolomitic sorb} for the low S cases and to 16-20% X_{HCI dolomitic sorb} for 579 the high S cases. However, the cost savings associated to the three-stage optimum are in all 580 scenarios lower than 10%, compared to the two-stage optimum of the Ca(OH)₂/NaHCO₃ 581 system, which corresponds to values in the range 47-50% X_{HCI,Ca(OH)2} when X_{HCI,dolomitic sorb} is 582 set to zero. Actually, a properly operated Ca(OH)₂/NaHCO₃ two-stage system is already an 583 optimised system compared to the single stage injection of sodium bicarbonate [37], thanks 584 to the use of cheaper calcium hydroxide (see again table 4) for the reduction of the acid gas 585 concentration entering the bicarbonate stage. Thus, the margin for further cost reduction is 586 587 lower.

Nonetheless, in operational terms, maintaining the optimal operating point of the Ca(OH)₂/NaHCO₃ two-stage system is not an easy task for the control system of a flue gas treatment line, as the concentration of inlet acid pollutants fluctuates widely and frequently. Therefore, DS injection can help because it enlarges the operational region where costs are within +10% of the optimum. As an example, focusing on panel 8b, the window of operating costs within +10% of the optimum, without DS injection, is comprised between $X_{HCI,Ca(OH)2}$ ranging from 35 to 55%, while for a DS injection corresponding to $X_{HCI,dolomitic sorb} = 20\%$, it is possible to remain within +10% of the minimum operating costs even for $X_{HCI,Ca(OH)2}$ ranging from 20 to 65%. Therefore, the addition of a dolomitic sorbent stage flattens the cost variation related to the repartition of acid gas removal between the treatment stages, possibly limiting the deviation from optimal operation.

Table 5 summarises the findings of sections 4.4.1 and 4.4.2, listing the specific feed rates of dolomitic sorbent that correspond to the optimal $X_{HCl,dolomitic sorb}$ identified for the configurations of plant A and plant B in the six cases of flue gas composition. It is recalled that the conversion of HCl is linked to the SR of sorbent by the model of Fig. 4, calibrated on the plant-specific test runs, and the SR of sorbent is linked to the mass feed rate of sorbent by Eq. 11.

605

Table 5. Specific feed rate of dolomitic sorbent ($kg/10^3$ Nm³ of flue gas) corresponding to the optimal $X_{HCl, dolomitic sorb}$ shown in Fig. 6 and 8.

s of	System			
jas	DS + Ca(OH) ₂	DS + Ca(OH) ₂ + NaHCO ₃		
sition	Optimal DS feed rate (kg/10 ³ Nm ³)	Optimal DS feed rate (kg/10 ³ Nm ³)		
Low S	0.39	0.20		
High S	1.04	0.53		
Low S	0.65	0.33		
High S	1.43	0.79		
Low S	0.90	0.46		
High S	1.75	1.05		
	s of jas sition Low S High S Low S High S Low S High S	s of jasSysDS + Ca(OH)2SitionOptimal DS feed rate (kg/10³ Nm³)Low S0.39High S1.04Low S0.65High S1.43Low S0.90High S1.75		

608

609

610



Figure 8. Operating costs of the dolomitic sorbent + $Ca(OH)_2$ + $NaHCO_3$ three-stage system as a function of HCl conversion in the DS and $Ca(OH)_2$ stages, for the six cases of flue gas composition in Table 3.

617 *4.4.3 Effect of unit cost variability*

The economic analysis in sections 4.4.1 and 4.4.2 is clearly influenced by the adopted unit cost values for the considered cost entries. To assess the effect of different unit costs than those listed in Table 4 on the economic optimisation, two scenarios were explored:

- an unfavourable scenario for the DS, named 'costly DS, cheap NaHCO₃', in which the costs for the procurement of DS and the disposal of process residues are 20% higher than the values in Table 4, while the costs for the procurement of sodium bicarbonate and the costs for the recycling of Na-based process residues are 20% lower than the values in Table 4;
- a favourable scenario for the DS, named '*cheap DS, costly NaHCO₃*', in which vice
 versa the costs for the procurement of DS and the disposal of process residues are
 20% lower than the values in Table 4, while the costs for the procurement of sodium
 bicarbonate and the costs for the recycling of Na-based process residues are 20%
 higher than the values in Table 4.
- The ±20% range assumed is a conservative interval of variation, considering the 631 relatively low differences in unit costs reported by several technical and scientific 632 633 sources (see the overview of cost data by Dal Pozzo et al. [37]). The overall operating costs estimated for the systems without DS injection and for 634 the systems with DS injection at the optimal operating point were compared for the different 635 636 cost scenarios, as shown in Fig. 9. The comparison was carried out for both the two-637 stage and the three-stage system, with reference to medium CI and high or low S flue gas 638 composition cases.
- The first evidence is that the 'costly DS, cheap NaHCO₃' scenario always generates 639 lower overall operating costs, while the upper end of the operating costs range corresponds 640 to the the 'cheap DS, costly NaHCO₃' scenario. This finding is obvious for the cases with 641 no DS injection. For the cases with optimal DS injection, it results from the much higher 642 NaHCO₃ feed with respect to the DS feed rate in the optimal repartition of feed rate 643 644 between stages, that results in a higher fraction of the total costs (as shown in Fig. 7). In the 'costly DS, cheap NaHCO₃' scenario, the slight cost savings ensured by DS 645 injection, discussed in sections 4.4.1 e 4.4.2, are further reduced, and the operating 646 costs of the systems with and without DS injection are almost equivalent. The exception 647 is the case of the DS + NaHCO₃ system in presence of a flue gas composition with high 648 still results in a 7% 649 S. for which the injection of DS cost reduction. Vice versa, in the 'cheap DS, costly NaHCO₃' scenario the gap between the operating 650 costs with and without DS injection is enlarged. The addition of DS results in savings, 651 ranging from 9 to 16% for the NaHCO₃ system and from 5 to 12% for the Ca(OH)₂/NaHCO₃ 652 653 system (lower and upper end of the range are for the flue gas compositions with 654 low and high S, respectively). Overall, these results clarify that, even in presence of uncertainty in the unit costs, 655 the introduction of a DS injection stage reduces the variation of the total operating 656 costs, as evident from the reduction of the cost brackets in Fig. 9. In the cost 657 scenario that is unfavourable for DS, the overall costs of the system with or without DS 658 injection are the same, while in the cost scenario that is favourable for DS, its injection 659 generates appreciable savings. Therefore, from the viewpoint of WtE operators, adding a 660 furnace injection of DS can increase the robustness of the entire acid gas treatment line. 661 662



Figure 9. Operating costs of acid gas removal in the different cost scenarios indicated in the legend. Comparison between no DS injection and DS injection at the optimum, for the DS + NaHCO₃ two-stage system and for the DS + $Ca(OH)_2$ + NaHCO₃ three-stage system with DS injection at the optimal operating point (optimum). Medium CI and: a) low S, b) high S compositions were considered for flue gas.

669

670 **5. Conclusions**

671

672 A quantitative analysis of the HCl and SO₂ removal performance of a dolomitic sorbent injected in the combustion chamber of WtE plants was carried out. Data 673 obtained via dedicated test runs at full plant scale and their interpretation by 674 means of a phenomenological model allowed deriving a non-linear relationship 675 between the stoichiometric ratio of sorbent feed rate and the resulting conversion of acid 676 pollutants. At the typical concentrations of HCl and SO₂ expected in WtE flue gas, a SR of 677 sorbent equal to 1 was found to achieve a mean 27% HCl conversion and 83% SO₂ 678 conversion, while a SR of 2 resulted in conversions of HCl and SO₂ respectively equal to 679 37% and 98%. 680

Since the introduction of a furnace injection of DS can be considered as an 681 additional deacidification stage to the existing acid gas treatment line of a WtE facility, the 682 developed model was used to identify the optimal feed rate of DS, *i.e.* the feed rate that 683 minimises the overall operating costs of the line, for a WtE plant already equipped with a 684 single or a two-stage acid gas treatment system. An optimum is generally present because 685 the DS injected at high temperature, as opposed to calcium hydroxide or sodium 686 bicarbonate injected at low temperature, has a higher relative reactivity towards 687 688 SO₂ than HCl, hence it is complementary to the low-temperature sorbents, and it is cheaper than sodium bicarbonate, hence it is suitable as a pre-treatment step to limit the 689 consumption of the more expensive reactant.

In particular, for WtE plants operating with furnace DS injection plus a single
downstream acid gas removal stage, the optimal operating point consists in demanding a
conversion of HCl in the range 16-23% from DS injection. Such an optimised feed rate of
DS can achieve a reduction of operating costs, which was estimated as high as 13% when
the concentration of SO₂ in the raw flue gas is relevant.

For WtE plants operating with furnace DS injection plus a downstream two-stage acid 695 gas treatment system, the optimal feed rate of DS corresponds to a conversion of HCI 696 697 in the range 9-20%, depending on the SO₂ concentration in the flue gas. The savings that may be obtained thanks to the use of DS were estimated to be limited (less than 10% 698 reduction of operating costs even for flue gas with high SO₂ concentration). However, the 699 700 DS injection can still be a valid addition in order to stabilise the operation of the multistage acid gas removal process, smoothing the variability of acid gas load coming from 701 702 the combustion chamber.

- The advantages of DS injection are confirmed even in the presence of uncertainties in the unit costs considered in the economic analysis. Overall, the dolomitic sorbent injection emerges as a useful technology to control acid gas emissions, particularly as a
- cost-effective retrofitting option to single-stage removal processes.
- 707

708 Acknowledgments

Plant operators involved in test runs at the two WtE facilities are gratefully acknowledged forthe support in the execution of the test run campaign.

711

712 **References**

- P. Lu, Q. Huang, A.C. Bourtsalas, N.J. Themelis, Y. Chi, J. Yan, Review on fate of
 chlorine during thermal processing of solid wastes, J. Environ. Sci. 78 (2019) 13-28.
- M. Bal, T.T. Reddy, B.C. Maikap, Removal of HCl gas from off gases using self priming venturi scrubber, J. Haz. Mat. 364 (2019) 406-418.
- A. Dal Pozzo, R. Moricone, A. Tugnoli, V. Cozzani, Experimental Investigation of the
 Reactivity of Sodium Bicarbonate toward Hydrogen Chloride and Sulfur Dioxide at
 Low Temperatures, Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 58 (2019) 6316-6324.
- [4] K.-D. Kim, S.-M. Jeon, N. Hasolli, K.-S. Lee, J.-R. Lee, J.-W. Han, H.-T. Kim, Y.-O.
 Park, HCI removal characteristics of calcium hydroxide at the dry-type sorbent reaction accelerator using municipal waste incinerator flue gas at a real site, Korean J. Chem. Eng. 34 (2017) 747-756.
- 724[5]C. Li, Z. Jia, X. Ye, S. Yin, Simulation on deacidification performance of waste725incinerator flue gas by rotating spray drying, Energy 152 (2018) 652-665.
- [6] J. Vehlow, Air pollution control systems in WtE units: An overview, Waste Manage.
 37 (2015) 58-74.
- A.L. Brooks, S. Wang, J.R. Jambeck, The Chinese import ban and its impact on
 global plastic waste trade, Sci. Adv. 4 (2018) eaat0131.
- W. Wang, N.J. Themelis, K. Sun, A.C. Bourtsalas, Q. Huang, Y. Zhang, Z. Wu,
 Current influence of China's ban on plastic waste imports, Waste Disposal Sust.
 Energy 1 (2019) 67-78.
- J. Van Caneghem, K. Van Acker, J. De Greef, G. Wauters, C. Vandecasteele,
 Waste-to-energy is compatible and complementary with recycling in the circular
 economy, Clean Technol. Environ. Policy 21 (2019) 925-939.

- 736[10]European IPPC Bureau, Best Available Techniques (BAT) Reference Document for737WasteIncineration.Technicaldraft,2018.Availableat:738eippcb.jrc.ec.europa.eu/reference/BREF/WI/WI_BREF_FD_Black_Watermark.pdf739(last accessed: 18/11/2019).
- [11] S. Belosevic, I. Tomanovic, N. Crnomarkovic, A. Milicevic, D. Tucakovic, Numerical
 study of pulverized coal-fired utility boiler over a wide range of operating conditions
 for in-furnace SO₂/NO_x reduction, Appl. Thermal Eng. 94 (2016) 657-669.
- [12] L. Shi, G. Liu, B.S. Higgins, L. Benson, Computational modeling of furnace sorbent
 injection for SO₂ removal from coal-fired utility boilers, Fuel Proc. Technol. 92 (2011)
 372-378.
- [13] B.G. Miller, Formation and Control of Sulfur Oxides, in: Clean Coal Engineering
 Technology. 2nd ed. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann, 2017, pp 467-506.
- [14] M.J. Miller, Retrofit SO₂ and NO_X control technologies for coal-fired power plants.
 Environ. Prog. 5 (1986) 171-177.
- [15] L.J. Muzio, G.R. Often, Assessment of Dry Sorbent Emission Control Technologies
 Part I. Fundamental Processes, JAPCA 37 (1987) 642-654.
- [16] J. Cheng, J. Zhou, J. Liu, Z. Zhou, Z. Huang, X. Cao, X. Zhao, K. Cen, Sulfur
 removal at high temperature during coal combustion in furnaces: a review, Prog.
 Energy Combust. Sci. 29 (2003) 381-405.
- [17] W.Z. Khan, B.M. Gibes, SOx emissions from a fluidized-bed combustor with and
 without limestone addition, Energy 21 (1996) 105-113.
- J. Zhou, J. Cheng, X. Cao, J. Liu, X. Zhao, Z. Huang, K. Cen, Experimental research
 on two-stage desulfurization technology in traveling grate boilers, Energy 26 (2001)
 759 759-774.
- [19] S. Petrini, H. Eklund, I. Bjerle, HCI-Absorption durch Kalkstein (in German),
 Aufbereitungstechnik 6 (1979) 309–311.
- G. Mura, A. Lallai, Reaction kinetics of gas hydrogen chloride and limestone, Chem.
 Eng. Sci. 49 (1994) 4491-4500.
- J. Partanen, P. Backman, R. Backman, M. Hupa, Absorption of HCl by limestone in
 hot flue gases. Part I: the effects of temperature, gas atmosphere and absorbent
 quality, Fuel 84 (2005) 1664-1673.
- R.H. Borgwardt, Sintering of nascent calcium oxide, Chem. Eng. Sci. 44 (1989) 53-60.
- A.M. Kierzkowska, R. Pacciani, C.R. Müller, CaO-Based CO₂ Sorbents: From
 Fundamentals to the Development of New, Highly Effective Materials,
 ChemSusChem 6 (2013) 1130-1148.
- [24] B. Shemwell, Y.A. Levendis, G.A. Simons, Laboratory study on the high-temperature
 capture of HCl gas by dry-injection of calcium-based sorbents, Chemosphere 42
 (2001) 785-796.
- A.A. Patsias, W. Nimmo, B.M. Gibbs, P.T. Williams, Calcium-based sorbents for
 simultaneous NOx /SOx reduction in a down-fired furnace, Fuel 84 (2005) 18641873.
- [26] B. Courtemanche, Y.A. Levendis, Control of the HCI Emissions from the Combustion
 of PVC by In-Furnace Injection of Calcium-Magnesium-Based Sorbents, Environ.
 Eng. Sci. 15 (1998) 123-135.
- Y.A. Levendis, W. Zhu, D.L. Wise, G.A. Simons, Effectiveness of calcium magnesium
 acetate as an SO_X sorbent in coal combustion, AIChE J. 35 (1993) 30-36.

- [28] J.M. Valverde, P.E. Sanchez-Jimenez, L.A. Perez-Maqueda, Ca-looping for
 postcombustion CO₂ capture: A comparative analysis on the performances of
 dolomite and limestone, Appl. Energy 138 (2015) 202-215.
- R. Moreschi, R. Marras, International patent n° WO/2014/080373, 2014. Available at: https://patentscope.wipo.int/search/en/detail.jsf?docId=WO2014080373&tab=PCTBI
 BLIO (accessed 03/09/2019).
- [30] L. Biganzoli, G. Racanella, L. Rigamonti, R. Marras, M. Grosso, High temperature
 abatement of acid gases from waste incineration. Part I: Experimental tests in full
 scale plants, Waste Manage. 36 (2015) 98-105.
- A. Dal Pozzo, D. Guglielmi, G. Antonioni, A. Tugnoli, Environmental and economic
 performance assessment of alternative acid gas removal technologies for waste-to energy plants, Sustainable Prod. Consumption 16 (2018) 202-215.
- 795 [32] CEN, EN 14181:2014—Stationary source emissions—quality assurance of 796 automated measuring systems, Brussels (2014).
- T.O.M. Smith, R.A. Robinson, M.D. Coleman, Modelling European quality assurance
 procedures for analysers monitoring emissions under the EU's Industrial Emissions
 Directive, Accreditation and Quality Assurance 24 (2019) 443-449.
- 800[34]European Parliament, Directive 2010/75/EU on industrial emissions (integrated801pollution prevention and control), Off J Eur Union L 334 (2010) 17–119.
- 802 [35] P.J. Rousseeuw, Least Median of Squares Regression, J. Am. Stat. Assoc. 79
 803 (1984) 871–880.
- R. Filitz, A.M. Kierzkowska, C.R. Müller, Highly Efficient CO₂ Sorbents: Development
 of Synthetic, Calcium-Rich Dolomites, Environ. Sci. Technol. 46 (2012) 559-565.
- [37] A. Dal Pozzo, G. Antonioni, D. Guglielmi, C. Stramigioli, V. Cozzani, Comparison of
 alternative flue gas dry treatment technologies in waste-to-energy processes, Waste
 Manage. 51 (2016) 81-90.
- [38] A. Dal Pozzo, A. Armutlulu, M. Rekhtina, C.R. Müller, V. Cozzani, CO₂ Uptake
 Potential of Ca-Based Air Pollution Control Residues over Repeated Carbonation–
 Calcination Cycles, Energy Fuels 32 (2018) 5386-5395.
- [39] M. Margallo, M.B.M. Taddei, A. Hernandez-Pellon, R. Aldaco, A. Irabien,
 Environmental sustainability assessment of the management of municipal solid waste
 incineration residues: a review of the current situation, Clean Technol. Environ.
 Policy 17 (2015) 1333-1353.
- [40] L. Ninane, J.F. Adam, C. Humblot, Method for Producing an Aqueous Industrial
 Sodium Chloride Solution, U.S. Patent 5478447, 1995.
- [41] T. Chin, R. Yan, D. T. Liang, J.H. Tay, Hydrated Lime Reaction with HCl under
 Simulated Flue Gas Conditions, Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 44 (2005) 3742-3748.
- R. Han, F. Sun, J. Gao, S. Wei, Y. Su, Y. Qin, Trace Na₂CO₃ Addition to Limestone
 Inducing High-Capacity SO₂ Capture, Environ. Sci. Technol. 51 (2017) 12692-12698.
- [43] P. Quicker, M. Rotheut, Y. Noel, M. Schulten, U. Athmann, Treating WTE Plant Flue
 Gases with Sodium Bicarbonate, Power 158 (2014) 59-63.
- 824
- 825

Supplementary Material Click here to download Supplementary Material: SupplementaryMaterial_Depurcal_JHM.docx

Declaration of interests

 \boxtimes The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

□The authors declare the following financial interests/personal relationships which may be considered as potential competing interests:

CREDIT AUTHOR STATEMENT

Techno-economic performance of HCI and SO₂ removal in waste-toenergy plants by furnace direct sorbent injection

Alessandro Dal Pozzo, Lorenzo Lazazzara, Giacomo Antonioni, Valerio Cozzani * LISES - Dipartimento di Ingegneria Civile, Chimica, Ambientale e dei Materiali, Alma Mater Studiorum - Università di Bologna, via Terracini n.28, 40131 Bologna, Italy

* corresponding author, Tel. +39-051-2090240, Fax +39-051-2090247, e-mail: valerio.cozzani@unibo.it

Alessandro Dal Pozzo: conceptualization, methodology, investigation, formal analysis, writing - original draft.

Lorenzo Lazazzara: investigation, formal analysis

Giacomo Antonioni: methodology, formal analysis

Valerio Cozzani: conceptualization, methodology, supervision, writing - review and editing

STATEMENT OF NOVELTY

Techno-economic performance HCI and SO₂ removal in waste-to-energy plants by furnace direct sorbent injection

Alessandro Dal Pozzo, Lorenzo Lazazzara, Giacomo Antonioni, Valerio Cozzani *

LISES - Dipartimento di Ingegneria Civile, Chimica, Ambientale e dei Materiali, Alma Mater Studiorum - Università di Bologna, via Terracini n.28, 40131 Bologna, Italy

* corresponding author, Tel. +39-051-2090240, Fax +39-051-2090247, e-mail: valerio.cozzani@unibo.it

Direct furnace injection of a dolomitic sorbent may be a viable cost-effective technique to improve removal of acid gases in waste-to-energy plants, required by the oncoming new release of Best Available Techniques conclusions. However, apart from laboratory-scale results, no full-scale data is reported in the literature to assess the actual performance of such technology and optimal operational parameters. The present study, based on a full-scale campaign, carried out a first, systematic assessment of the effectiveness of adding furnace sorbent injection to different flue gas treatment processes, establishing a quantitative correlation between feed rate of reactant and resulting HCl/SO₂ conversion.