



ALMA MATER STUDIORUM
UNIVERSITÀ DI BOLOGNA

ARCHIVIO ISTITUZIONALE
DELLA RICERCA

Alma Mater Studiorum Università di Bologna Archivio istituzionale della ricerca

Assessment of human health hazards associated with the dietary exposure to organic and inorganic contaminants through the consumption of fishery products in Spain

This is the final peer-reviewed author's accepted manuscript (postprint) of the following publication:

Published Version:

Assessment of human health hazards associated with the dietary exposure to organic and inorganic contaminants through the consumption of fishery products in Spain / Rodríguez-Hernández, Ángel; Camacho, María; Henríquez-Hernández, Luis A; Boada, Luis D; Ruiz-Suárez, Norberto; Valerón, Pilar F; Almeida González, Maira; Zaccaroni, Annalisa; Zumbado, Manuel; Luzardo, Octavio P. - In: SCIENCE OF THE TOTAL ENVIRONMENT. - ISSN 0048-9697. - ELETTRONICO. - 557-558:(2016), pp. 808-818.
[10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.03.035]

Availability:

This version is available at: <https://hdl.handle.net/11585/537148> since: 2017-05-15

Published:

DOI: <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.03.035>

Terms of use:

Some rights reserved. The terms and conditions for the reuse of this version of the manuscript are specified in the publishing policy. For all terms of use and more information see the publisher's website.

This item was downloaded from IRIS Università di Bologna (<https://cris.unibo.it/>).
When citing, please refer to the published version.

(Article begins on next page)

1
2
3
4
5

6 This is the final peer-reviewed accepted manuscript
7 of:

8 Rodríguez-Hernández Á, Camacho M, Henríquez-Hernández LA, Boada LD, Ruiz-Suárez N,
9 Valerón PF, Almeida González M, Zaccaroni A, Zumbado M, Luzardo OP. Assessment of human
10 health hazards associated with the dietary exposure to organic and inorganic contaminants
11 through the consumption of fishery products in Spain. Sci Total Environ. 2016 Jul 1;557-558:808-
12 18. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.03.035. Epub 2016 Apr 17. PMID: 27060748.

13 The final published version is available online at:
14 [10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.03.035](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.03.035)

15

16 Rights / License:

17 The terms and conditions for the reuse of this version of
18 the manuscript are specified in the publishing policy. For
19 all terms of use and more information see the publisher's
20 website.

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32 This item was downloaded from IRIS Università di Bologna
33 (<https://cris.unibo.it/>)

34 **When citing, please refer to the published version.**

35

36

37 **Assessment of human health hazards associated with the dietary**
38 **exposure to organic and inorganic contaminants through the**
39 **consumption of fishery products in Spain**

40

41 *Ángel Rodríguez-Hernández¹, María Camacho¹, Luis A. Henríquez-Hernández¹, Luis*
42 *D. Boada¹, Norberto Ruiz-Suárez¹, Pilar F. Valerón¹, Maira Almeida González¹,*
43 *Annalisa Zaccaroni², Manuel Zumbado¹, Octavio P. Luzardo^{1,*}*

44

45 ¹ Toxicology Unit, Research Institute of Biomedical and Health Sciences (IUIBS),
46 University of Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Instituto Canario de Investigación del Cáncer
47 (ICIC) and Spanish Biomedical Research Centre in Physiopathology of Obesity and
48 Nutrition (CIBEROBn). Plaza Dr. Pasteur s/n, 35016 - Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Spain

49

50 ² Large Pelagic Vertebrate Group, Veterinary Faculty, University of Bologna, Viale
51 Vespucci 2, Cesenatico (FC), 47042, Italy

52

53

54 * Corresponding Author:

55 Octavio Pérez Luzardo, Toxicology Unit, Department of Clinical Sciences, Universidad
56 de Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Plaza Dr. Pasteur s/n, 35016 Las Palmas de Gran
57 Canaria, Spain, Tel: +34 928 451 424; Fax: +34 928 451 461; E-mail:

58 octavio.perez@ulpgc.es

59

60

61 **Acknowledgements:**

62 This study has been supported by Programa Innova Canarias 2020 from Fundación
63 Universitaria de Las Palmas (FULP). The authors thank Mrs. María de los Reyes Suárez
64 Hanna for her technical assistance.

65

66 **Competing Financial Interests Declaration:**

67 There are no actual or potential conflicts of interest to declare for any author.

68

69 **Abstract**

70

71 In this work we have evaluated the potential carcinogenic and acutely toxic risks
72 associated to the exposure to highly prevalent organic and inorganic contaminants
73 through the consumption of fishery products by the Spanish population. The
74 concentrations of 8 organochlorine pesticides (OCPs), 18 polychlorinated biphenils
75 (PCBs), 7 polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (expressed as benzo[a]pyrene toxic
76 equivalents (B[a]P_{eq})), and three inorganic toxic elements [arsenic (As), cadmium (Cd),
77 and mercury (Hg)] were determined in 96 samples of the most consumed species of white
78 fish, blue fish, cephalopods and seafood species, which were acquired directly in markets
79 and supermarkets in the Canary Islands, Spain. The chemical concentration data were
80 combined with the pattern of consumption of these foodstuffs in order to calculate the
81 daily intake of these contaminants, and on this basis the risk quotients for carcinogenicity
82 and acute toxicity were determined for Spanish adults and children. Our results showed
83 that the daily intake of OCPs, PCBs and B[a]P_{eq}, which is associated to blue fish
84 consumption was the highest within the fish group. The estimated intake of pollutants can
85 be considered low or very low for the individual contaminants, when compared to
86 reference values, except in the case of HCB and As. All the estimated intakes were below
87 the reported Tolerable Daily Intakes. Considering the additive effects of multiple
88 contaminants, the risk of acute toxic effects can also be considered as low or very low.
89 However, our results reflect that the current consumption of white fish in adults and
90 children, and also the blue fish in the case of adults, poses a moderate carcinogenic risk
91 to Spanish consumers, mainly related to their concentrations of As. The conclusions of
92 this research may be useful for the design of appropriate risk communication campaigns.

93 **1. - INTRODUCTION**

94

95 Organic and inorganic contaminants, such as legacy pesticides, polychlorinated biphenyls
96 (PCBs), polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs), mercury (Hg), arsenic (As), or
97 cadmium (Cd) are commonly targeted contaminants for research and in monitoring
98 programs. In the last decades, efforts have been made to raise knowledge about the
99 adverse effects on humans and animals, worldwide distribution pattern, and new methods
100 are developed to analyze these compounds in very different matrices and various
101 environmental media (Luzardo et al., 2013b; Sharma et al., 2014). Thus, numerous studies
102 have revealed that these toxic compounds, individually and in combination, may
103 contribute to the development of severe health problems such as cancer, immune
104 suppression or genotoxic effects in humans, even with long-term low-dose exposure
105 (Bergman et al., 2012; Jarvis et al., 2014; WHO, 2003), and many of them have
106 demonstrated endocrine disrupting effects in both animals and humans (Camacho et al.,
107 2014; Kortenkamp et al., 2011). In fact, the use of organochlorine pesticides (OCPs) and
108 PCBs is now banned in most developed countries, but they are still widespread in the
109 environment (Almeida-González et al., 2012; Kakuschke et al., 2010; Luzardo et al.,
110 2014).

111

112 Although there are different routes of exposure for humans to these pollutants, it has been
113 established that ingestion of food contributes more than 90% of total human exposure,
114 and that the fatty fraction of food represents the main entrance to the human body
115 (Darnerud et al., 2006; Vazquez et al., 2015). In the last decade, studies on human dietary
116 exposure to persistent pollutants have been carried out in various countries over the world
117 and it has been reported that the dietary intakes vary considerably between countries. The
118 dietary intakes are mainly influenced by the specific dietary habits of each country

119 (Domingo and Bocio, 2007; Storelli et al., 2011). The daily intake of contaminants needs
120 to be calculated on the basis of the typical food basket consumed in the country obtained
121 from surveys on consumers. The dietary exposure to a wide range of persistent organic
122 and inorganic pollutants of Spanish consumers has been investigated by several authors
123 in the past years for different food groups, such as milk and cheese (Almeida-González
124 et al., 2012; Luzardo et al., 2012), eggs (Luzardo et al., 2013a), yogurt (Rodríguez-
125 Hernández et al., 2015c), meat and processed meat (Rodríguez-Hernández et al., 2015a;
126 Rodríguez-Hernández et al., 2015b), and seafood (Bocio et al., 2007; Domingo and
127 Bocio, 2007; Falcó et al., 2006). Also several basket market studies have been performed
128 in Spain including the major food groups (Bocio and Domingo, 2005; Bocio et al., 2005;
129 Falco et al., 2003; Llobet et al., 2003a; Llobet et al., 2003b; Llobet et al., 2003c), and
130 even the consumption of foods of animal origin has been investigated as a determinant of
131 contamination by OCPs and PCBs (Boada et al., 2014). However, to date only few studies
132 have estimated the carcinogenic risk associated to the exposure to contaminants
133 associated to certain food groups in the Spanish population (Rodríguez-Hernández et al.,
134 2015a; Rodríguez-Hernández et al., 2015b), and to our knowledge none has been
135 developed for the seafood group.

136

137 Fish is an important supplier of high quality nutrients such as omega 3 fatty acids, which
138 have been proven reduce the risk of stroke, lower blood pressure and improve arterial
139 integrity, and even decrease the risks of certain cancers (Kris-Etherton et al., 2002).
140 However, fish is also one of the main contributors of the total dietary intake of
141 environmental pollutants (Bocio et al., 2005; Falco et al., 2003; Llobet et al., 2003b;
142 Llobet et al., 2003c). Thus, on the one hand, the health benefits of sea foodstuff
143 consumption have been proven but on the other hand there also exist an increasing

144 concern of the potential risk arising from exposure to toxic pollutants through the intake
145 of fishery products. Because of the growing public concern about the health effects of
146 food borne diseases related to chemical pollutants, there exists the need carrying out
147 studies on particular food groups (such as fish), based on their current pattern of
148 consumption by a given population. In some guidance documents for environmental risk
149 assessment, a reference point from toxicity testing is divided by a default assessment
150 factor and the result compared to the predicted exposure by computing their ratio, which
151 is known as the risk quotient (RQ) (EFSA, 2015; USEPA, 2000). It has been proposed
152 that RQ is a good method to estimate the risk to carcinogenic and acutely toxic effects
153 associated to food contaminants in a population and that is useful to establish exposure
154 limits to those chemicals.

155

156 As fish is a staple food of the Spanish diet, with an average consumption of 26.4
157 kg/person/year (MAGRAMA, 2015) we have designed this study in which we assess the
158 toxic potential of the current pattern of consumption of this food group by the Spanish
159 population. We have acquired seafood samples directly at points of sale to the consumer,
160 and the sampling was designed to follow the Spanish consumers' preferences. We have
161 assessed two types of health risks associated with the consumption of seafood: the
162 carcinogenic risk, and the acute toxicity potential. In this research we have calculated the
163 RQs considering multiple contaminants in fishery products for both carcinogenic and
164 acutely toxic effects, and on this basis we calculated the number of healthy meals per
165 month for a safe consumption in the Spanish population. Obviously, the results of this
166 study need to be considered in the context of the proven health benefits of the nutrients
167 of fish, but may serve for the design of appropriate risk communication campaigns in
168 order to reduce the consumption of certain types of seafood with the aim of optimizing

169 the risk-to-benefit balance.

170

171 **2. - MATERIAL AND METHODS**

172

173 **2.1. Sampling**

174

175 We selected for this study the most consumed species of seafood: fish (white fish and
176 blue fish), cephalopods, crustaceans and bivalve molluscs in Spain, according to the data
177 available (AECOSAN, 2006; AECOSAN, 2011). A total of 93 samples from the main
178 commercial species (MAGRAMA, 2015; Martín Cerdeño, 2010) were randomly acquired
179 from multinational retailers settled in the Canary Islands (Spain) between September and
180 November of 2014.. The samples purchased were transported to the Laboratory of
181 Toxicology of the University of Las Palmas de Gran Canaria (ULPGC) and processed
182 immediately upon arrival at the laboratory. We processed and analyzed only the edible
183 parts of seafood (muscle + skin, depending on how the species are consumed). Each
184 sample was constituted by five individual subsamples for each species of fish and
185 cephalopods (fillets, small fishes, or parts of octopus and squids), and six subsamples of
186 each species of crustaceans and mollusks to give pooled samples (using a stainless steel
187 domestic food processor). **Thus, 5 to 6 of these composites were used to obtain the data**
188 **of** each species. After that, all samples were frozen at – 80°C (until analysis).

189

190 The species of white fish included in this study were: wreckfish (*Polyprion americanus*),
191 megrim (*Stephanoiepis hispidus*), sole (*Solea vulgaris*), seabass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*),
192 hake (*Merluccius merluccius*), toothed sparus (*Dentex dentex*), parrot fish (*Sparisoma*
193 *cretense*), gilt head fish (*Sparus aurata*) and iridescent shark (*Pangasius hypophthalmus*).

194 The selected species of blue fish were: tuna (*Thunnus thynnus*), salmon (*Salmo salar*),
195 sardine (*Sardina pilchardus*), and trout (*Salmo trutta*). Additionally, we included those
196 most consumed species of crustaceans, cephalopods, and mollusks: shrimp (*Parapenaeus*
197 *spp.*), prawn (*Penaeus spp.*), mussel (*Mytilus galloprovincialis*), octopus (*Octopus*
198 *vulgaris*), and squid (*Theutida spp.*).

199

200 **2.2. Chemicals, reagents and analytes of interest**

201

202 All the organic solvents (dichlorometane, hexane, ethyl acetate, and cyclohexane) were
203 of mass spectrometry grade (VWR International, PA, USA). Ultrapure (UP) water was
204 produced in the laboratory using a Milli-Q Gradient A10 apparatus (Millipore, Molsheim,
205 France). The inert desiccant (Celite ® 545) was purchased from Sigma-Aldrich (St.
206 Louis, USA). Bio-Beads SX-3 were purchased from BioRad Laboratories (Hercules,
207 USA). Standards of OCPs, PCB congeners, and internal standards (ISs, PCB 202,
208 tetrachloro-m-xylene, p,p'-DDE-d8, heptachloro epoxide cis, and phenanthrene-d10),
209 were purchased from Dr Ehrenstorfer, Reference Materials (Augsburg, Germany).
210 Standards of PAHs were purchased from Absolute Standards, Inc. (Connecticut, USA).
211 All standards were neat compounds. Stock solutions of each compound at 1 mg/mL were
212 prepared in cyclohexane and stored at -20 °C. Diluted solutions from 0.05 ng/mL to 40
213 ng/mL were used for calibration curves (9 points).

214

215 All samples were screened for the presence of the following anthropogenic contaminants:
216 (a) 8 OCPs: the four isomers of hexachlorocyclohexane (α -, β and γ -, and δ - HCH), p,p'-
217 DDT and its metabolites (p,p'-DDE, and p,p'-DDD) and hexachlorobenzene (HCB); (b)
218 a total of 18 congeners of PCBs: the six marker PCBs (M-PCBs), and the 12 dioxin-like

219 PCBs (DL-PCBs), which were numbered according to the International Union of Pure
220 and Applied Chemistry (IUPAC): IUPAC numbers # 28, 52, 77, 81, 101, 105, 114, 118,
221 123, 126, 138, 153, 156, 157, 167, 169, 180, 189; (c) the 7 PAHs listed as carcinogens by
222 the United States Environmental Protection Agency: benzo[a]anthracene, chrysene,
223 benzo[b]fluoranthene, benzo[k]fluoranthene, benzo[a]pyrene, dibenzo[a,h]anthracene
224 and indeno[1,2,3,-cd]pyrene. Finally, we also included the analysis of 3 inorganic toxic
225 elements, which have been reported to be very abundant in fish: arsenic (As), cadmium
226 (Cd), and mercury (Hg).

227

228 **2.3. Extraction and clean-up**

229

230 Prior to the extraction procedure, samples were lyophilized for 72 hours. For the
231 extraction of organic pollutants from fishery products samples, we firstly extracted the
232 fat because all these chemicals are completely lipid-soluble and therefore found bound to
233 the lipid fraction. 5 g of each lyophilized sample were spiked with the ISs mix (10 µg/ml)
234 in acetone to yield a final concentration of 20 ng/g and mixed with 30 grams of Celite®
235 to absorb all humidity. The method of extraction and purification followed that
236 recommended by the European Standard for the determination of pesticides and PCBs in
237 fatty food (EN, 1996a; EN, 1996b), whose validity has been previously proven in our
238 laboratory for fatty samples (Camacho et al., 2014; Camacho et al., 2013a; García-
239 Álvarez et al., 2014a). This method combines an automated Soxhlet extraction method
240 (FOSS Soxtec Avanti 2055) with a purification step using gel permeation
241 chromatography (GPC), and gives acceptable recoveries that range between 74.5 % and
242 104.7 %. Briefly, the Soxtec™ 2055 Auto Fat Extraction (Foss® Analytical, Hilleroed,
243 Denmark) apparatus consisted of an extraction unit, a control unit and a drive unit. The

244 samples, prepared as described above, were inserted into the extraction unit, 40 ml of
245 solvent (dichloromethane) were added to the extraction cups in a closed system and the
246 cups were heated with an electric heating plate. The three-step extraction consisted of
247 boiling, rinsing and solvent recovery. The recovered solvent was evaporated in a rotary
248 evaporator (Hei-VAP Advantage™, Heidolph Instruments®, Schwabach, Germany) at
249 40 °C to prevent analytes losses. Using a precision balance, the fat obtained was carefully
250 weighted into a zeroed glass tube in order to be able of correcting the results and express
251 them against fresh weight of product. 100 mg of the Soxhlet extracted fat were dissolved
252 in 2 ml of cyclohexane/ethyl acetate (1:1) and subjected to purification by gel permeation
253 chromatography (BioBeads SX-3) using cyclohexane/ethyl acetate (1:1) at a constant
254 flow of 2 ml/min as the eluent. The first 25 minutes of elution, containing the great
255 majority of lipids (> 98%), were discarded. The 25-90 minutes elution volume (130 ml),
256 containing all of the analytes that were co-extracted with the fat, was collected. The
257 sample was concentrated using a rotary evaporator, and finally the solvent was evaporated
258 to dryness under a gentle nitrogen stream. The analytes were re-dissolved in 1 ml of
259 cyclohexane without any further purification and these extracts in cyclohexane were used
260 for the gas chromatography/triple quadrupole mass spectrometry (GC-MS/MS) analysis.

261

262 For the analyses of inorganic contaminants, 0.5 g aliquots of lyophilized samples were
263 mineralized with 6 mL of nitric acid (HNO₃) and 50 µl of Yttrium (Y) was added as an
264 internal standard. Vessels were then placed inside a microwave oven (Milestone ETHOS
265 ONE) and heated up to 190°C for 50 minutes. All of the reagents used were of high
266 quality, for analysis of trace elements (Suprapur, Merck, Darmstadt, Germany). After
267 cooling, digested samples were filtered with 1 µm strainer and diluted to a final volume
268 of 50 mL with distilled water into a conical polypropylene tube.

269

270 **2.4. Procedure of chemical analysis, quality assurance (QA) and quality control**
271 **(QC)**

272

273 Gas chromatography analyses of organic contaminants were performed in a single run on
274 a Thermo Trace GC Ultra equipped with a TriPlus Autosampler and coupled to a Triple
275 Quadrupole Mass Spectrometer Quantum XLS (Thermo Fisher Scientific Inc., Waltham,
276 MA, USA), as previously described (Bucchia et al., 2015; Formigaro et al., 2014), and
277 identifications were done using an electron ionization (EI)-MS/MS based on the retention
278 time and the relative ion ratios of each of the analytes. Quantifications were performed
279 against calibration curves as mentioned above. The LOQs of organic pollutants ranged
280 from 0.008 to 0.028 ng/g wet weight, as previously described (García-Álvarez et al.,
281 2014b) (Supplementary Table 1).

282

283 All the measurements were performed in triplicate, and we used the means for the
284 calculations. In each batch of samples, four controls were included for every 18 vials (6
285 samples): a reagent blank consisting of a vial containing only cyclohexane; a vial
286 containing 2 ng/ml of each of the pollutants in cyclohexane; and an internal laboratory
287 quality control sample (QCs) consisting of fish oil spiked at 20 ng/ml of each of the
288 analytes, which was processed using the same method as the seafood samples. The results
289 were considered to be acceptable when the concentration of the analytes determined in
290 the QC sample was within 15% of the deviation of the theoretical value.

291

292 Inorganic elements (As, Cd, and Hg) were quantified with inductively coupled plasma-
293 optic emission spectrometry technique (ICP-OES) using a Perkin Elmer Optima 2100 DV

294 instrument coupled with a CETAC U5000AT + ultrasound nebulizer for mercury. A
295 calibration curve and two blanks were run during each set of analyses to check purity of
296 the chemicals, and the blank reading was subtracted from all of the experimental readings.
297 The sample readings (two replicates for each sample and three readings for each replicate)
298 were performed using axial plasma, which provides increased sensitivity, lower
299 background, and improved the limits of detection (LODs) compared to traditional radial
300 plasma. This sensitivity enhancement results in a 5- to 10-fold improvement in the
301 detection limits compared with radially viewed plasma. The concentration values were
302 obtained from the mean of each three readings. The accuracy of the method was verified
303 using reference materials (CRM 278: lyophilized mussel, Community Bureau of
304 Reference, BCR, Brussels). All values of reference materials were within the certified
305 limits. LODs, expressed by wet weight (w.w.), were 0.1 ng/g for As; 1.8 ng/g for Cd; and
306 0.061 ng/g for Hg. The LODs were determined following the protocol described by
307 Perkin Elmer ICP application study number 57.

308

309 **2.5. Dietary intake estimates and calculations**

310

311 For the assessment of the contaminants' exposure through the consumption of fishery
312 products, we first grouped the results of contaminants in food as white fish, blue fish,
313 cephalopods, and seafood (mean values, expressed in ng/g fresh product), and then
314 multiplied these values by the average daily consumption rate of each one of these types
315 of food (expressed in grams/day). Following the recommendations of the EFSA we have
316 used also the percentile 97.5th of consumption to calculate the estimated daily intakes
317 (EDIs) using the upper-bound approach. These assessments (middle-bound (MB) and
318 upper bound (UB)) were done for both adults and children (average body weight: 68.48

319 and 34.48 kg, respectively). A zero value was assigned to all the compounds below the
320 LOD, and for those compounds below the limit of quantification (LOQ) but above the
321 LOD, the value was assumed to be $\frac{1}{2}$ LOQ (Camacho et al., 2013b; Luzardo et al., 2013b).
322 Food consumption data of the Spanish population were obtained from the Spanish Diet
323 Model for the Determination of the Consumer's Exposure to Chemicals of the Spanish
324 Agency for Consumer Food Safety and Nutrition (AECOSAN, 2006; AECOSAN, 2011).

325

326 In this research, for the calculations we considered the total value of DDTs (Σ DDTs) as
327 the sum of the measured values of p,p'-DDT, p,p'-DDE and p,p'-DDD; the total value of
328 HCH residues (Σ HCH) as the sum of the 4 HCH isomers (α -, β -, γ - and δ -HCH); the HCB
329 as an independent contaminant; the value of the PCB congeners that are considered
330 markers of exposition (Σ M-PCB: #28, 52, 101, 138, 153 and 180); the value of the PCB
331 congeners that are similar to dioxins (Σ DL-PCBs: #77, 81, 105, 114, 118, 123, 126, 156,
332 157, 167, 169 and 189). For the risk estimation, we calculated the potential toxicity for
333 the DL-PCBs (in terms of toxic equivalence to dioxins; Σ TEQ_{DL-PCBs}) using the OMS
334 2005 TEQs (Van den Berg et al., 2006). Finally, we also considered the total content of
335 carcinogenic PAHs (Σ c-PAHs) following the EFSA recommendations (EFSA, 2008).
336 Benzo[a]pyrene is the most widely known and studied compound of this group due to its
337 importance as one of the most potent carcinogenic hazards. Thus, the carcinogenic risk
338 of a PAH mixture is often expressed by its BaP equivalent concentration (B[a]P_{eq}). Thus,
339 for the risk estimation, we used toxic equivalency factors (TEFs), which are established
340 for the carcinogenic PAHs (Nisbet and LaGoy, 1992), to express the results in the form
341 of benzo[a]pyrene toxic equivalents (B[a]P_{eq}).

342

343 **2.6. Risk characterization**

344

345 We applied a risk quotient (RQ) to estimate whether the intake of contaminated sea
346 foodstuff. We calculated this intake RQ as the ratio between the consumption of a given
347 foodstuff (in this case seafood expressed in grams/day, R_{fish}) and the maximum tolerable
348 consumption of that foodstuff (CR_{lim}), which is calculated taking into account their
349 concentrations of contaminants. We have used this index both, for the calculation of the
350 carcinogenic risk, and also for the risk of acutely toxic effects associated to the
351 consumption of that food.

352

353 Thus, in the present study, the carcinogenic effects of multiple contaminants were
354 evaluated using the methodology previously used for different food groups (Rodríguez-
355 Hernández et al., 2015a; Rodríguez-Hernández et al., 2015b; Yu et al., 2014), according
356 to the following formulas:

357

358 (Equation 1)

$$359 \quad RQ = \frac{R_{fish}}{CR_{lim\ single}} \text{ (for a single contaminant)}$$

360 (Equation 2)

361

$$362 \quad RQ = R_{fish} \cdot \sum_{m=1}^x \frac{1}{CR_{lim\ multiple}} \text{ (for multiple contaminant groups)}$$

363

364 (Equation 3)

365

$$366 \quad CR_{lim(single\ or\ multiple)} = \frac{ARL \cdot BW}{\sum_{m=1}^x C_m \cdot CSF_m}$$

367

368 Where CR_{lim} is the maximum allowable consumption rate for a particular fishery product
369 (kg/day), and may be calculated either for a single contaminant or for various chemicals
370 belonging to the same chemical group, and assuming they share the toxicological
371 properties; ARL is the maximum acceptable individual lifetime risk level, which is
372 dimensionless and a value of 10^{-5} (one-in-100.000) was used in this study, base on the
373 literature (Yu et al., 2014); BW is the body weight (kg); C_m is the median concentration
374 of contaminant m in a particular fishery product (mg/kg); and CSF_m is the cancer slope
375 factor of contaminant m for a carcinogenic hazard (mg/kg/day)⁻¹. In the case of multiple
376 contaminants with the same CSF, their concentrations in a particular type of seafood were
377 summed (from $m = 1$ to $m = X$).

378

379 In addition, we evaluated the acutely toxic effects of multiple contaminants using the
380 following equation:

381

382 (Equation 4)

383

384
$$CR_{lim} = \frac{BW}{\sum_{m=1}^X \frac{C_m}{RfD}}$$

385

386 where RfD_m is the reference dose of contaminant m for acute toxic effects (mg/kg/day).

387

388 The RfD and CSF values of contaminants for carcinogenic and toxic effects were taken
389 from the Integrated Risk Information System (IRIS) of the USEPA
390 (<http://www.epa.gov/IRIS/>).

391

392 According to the previous reports it is considered that if the RQ value is equal or less than
393 1 then it can be considered that the risk is low ($< 10^{-5}$) via fishery products consumption.
394 However, the population is considered to be at health risk when RQ is greater than 1. (Yu
395 et al., 2014).

396

397 **2.7. Meal suggestions for the consumption of seafood.**

398

399 Once we determined the concentrations of pollutants in seafood we considered very
400 useful for the consumer and the health authorities to calculate the maximum intake of
401 these foods that can be considered safe. The USEPA notes that daily fish consumption
402 limits may be more conveniently expressed as the allowable number of fish meals (of a
403 specified meal size) that may be consumed over a given time period (USEPA, 2000; Yu
404 et al., 2014). For the consumer to express this as the number of allowable meals per month
405 is more practical. Therefore, we calculated the number of allowable meals per month
406 considering multiple contaminants for carcinogenic and acute toxic effects according to
407 the following equations:

408

409 (Equation 5)

410

$$411 \quad C_{mm} = \frac{R_{fish} \cdot TP}{MS}$$

412

413

414

415 (Equation 6)

416

417
$$RC_{mm} = \frac{C_{mm}}{RQ}$$

418

419 where C_{mm} is the current number of meals per month for each type of fishery product;
420 MS is the meal size (225 g for fish, and 120 g for cephalopods and seafood); TP is the
421 averaged time period (month = 30.44 days); and RC_{mm} is the recommended maximum
422 number of serving of each food per month.

423

424 **2.8. Statistical analysis**

425

426 Database management and statistical analysis were performed with PASW Statistics v
427 20.0 (SPSS Inc., Chicago, IL, USA). Because the data did not follow a normal
428 distribution, the statistical analyses involved the use of non-parametric tests. The
429 differences of contaminants between two independent groups were tested with the Mann–
430 Whitney U-test and Kruskal Wallis test. P values of less than 0.05 (two-tailed) were
431 considered statistically significant.

432

433 **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

434

435 ***3.1. Occurrence of chemical pollutants in fishery products***

436

437 Table 1 shows the concentrations of the toxic contaminants included in this study in the
438 different groups of fishery products: blue fish, white fish, cephalopods and other seafood
439 (crustaceans and molluscs). We also present in this table the statistical comparison
440 between the two classes of fish, and also the comparison between cephalopods and
441 seafood. In addition, we also considered interesting to present the comparison between

442 total seafood (including cephalopods) in a graphical manner as supplementary material
443 (Suppl. Figure 1).

444

445 We found great differences in the levels of contaminants among the different groups of
446 fishery products (Table 1), and also among the different species within each group (data
447 not shown). This is logical, because the distribution of the pollutants in the aquatic
448 organisms is highly dependent on the environment that they live, as well as on other many
449 factors, such as the trophic levels, the feeding habits of the species, differences in
450 metabolism due to different abilities of biotransformation, the excretion rate of these
451 compounds from the body, etc... (Liao et al., 2016). Moreover, it is well know that most
452 of the contaminants included in this study are lipid soluble and therefore it is reasonable
453 to find a direct relationship between their concentration and the lipid content of each
454 species. Thus, as seen in Table 1, we found that blue fish (which contains at least 5% of
455 lipids in the edible part) has higher levels of organic pollutants than white fish: Σ DDTs
456 (median: 1.5 vs. 0.21 ng/g); Σ HCHs (median: 0 ng/g in both groups; mean: 0.4 vs. 0.1
457 ng/g); HCB (median: 0.6 vs. 0.1 ng/g); M-PCBs (median: 2.6 vs. 0.3 ng/g); Σ TEQ_{DL-PCBs}
458 (0.006 vs. 0.0009 pg/g), and B[a]P_{eq} (0.2 vs. 0.03 ng/g). These findings are consistent
459 with other studies that found that higher levels of contamination occur in blue fish
460 (Mezzetta et al., 2011). We also found that fish in general (blue and white fish) presented
461 higher levels of organic pollutants than cephalopods, molluscs, and crustaceans, which
462 may be also related with the lower percentage of fat of these foods. This is also consistent
463 with the data published previously (Bayarri et al., 2001; Carubelli et al., 2007). The only
464 group in which these differences were not observed was PAHs, (expressed as B[a]P_{eq}),
465 as we found that the levels in cephalopods were similar to those in blue fish. Other authors
466 have also previously reported high levels of PAHs in molluscs, even higher than in fish

467 (Martí-Cid et al., 2007), probably due to the fact that most edible sea molluscs are filter
468 feeders.

469

470 With regards to inorganic pollutants, we included in this study the determination of As,
471 Cd, and Hg due to the concerns on human health of these elements, and that it has been
472 reported these metals are the most abundant in sea foodstuff (EFSA, 2009a; EFSA,
473 2009b; EFSA, 2012). There are many studies, which have determined their contents in
474 the edible parts of commercial seafood species, since the monitoring of metal
475 concentrations in fish meat is very important to ensure compliance with food safety
476 regulations and consequent consumers' protection (Bosch et al., 2016). In the present
477 study the pattern of contamination observed for organic pollutants in which blue fish
478 species are the most contaminated is not maintained. Except in the case of Hg, we found
479 that cephalopods, crustaceans, and molluscs exhibited the highest levels of these elements
480 (Table 1), which probably relates with their different feeding habits. White fish also had
481 higher concentrations of As than those detected in blue fish species. We considered this
482 especially of concern since white fish is the most consumed fish by the Spanish
483 population, and several studies have shown that the intake of As, particularly the
484 inorganic forms of this metalloid, is related with an increase incidence of cancer (Carlin
485 et al., 2015; Di Lorenzo et al., 2015). Although we could not perform the speciation of
486 As and only the total content of As was measured, it is accepted that in the edible parts
487 of marine fishes, ~ 10% of As is generally present in inorganic forms (Rahman et al.,
488 2012). Assuming that this ratio is maintained in the samples of aquatic organisms
489 included in this study we considered only 10% of the values depicted in Table 1 in the
490 further risk assessment, which is detailed in the following sections.

491

492 ***3.2. Daily intake of toxic contaminants through the consumption of fishery products***

493

494 The estimation of the daily intake (EDI) of pollutants through the consumption of fishery
495 products was obtained by combining the results of contamination of the samples and the
496 pattern of consumption of these products as reported by the Spanish authorities (median
497 and percentile 97.5th, in ng/day) (AECOSAN, 2006; AECOSAN, 2011). The results of
498 these estimations (MB and UB approaches) for both adults and children are presented in
499 Table 2.

500

501 ***3.2.1 Organic contaminants***

502

503 According to our results the greater contribution to the EDI of organochlorine compounds
504 (in both adults and children) occurs through the consumption of blue fish (68.4% and
505 50.8%, respectively) followed by white fish (25.3 and 40.1%, respectively), seafood
506 (4.2% and 5.0%, respectively), and cephalopods (2.3 and 4.0%, respectively). This
507 pattern was observed for all the individual compounds, and this had been also reported
508 for these pollutants by several authors (Mezzetta et al., 2011; Moon et al., 2009).
509 According to our calculations the EDI of Σ M-PCBs was the highest, followed by Σ DDTs.
510 To adequately evaluate the exposure to contaminants by means of the consumption of a
511 given food group it is necessary to compare the values with the previously calculated
512 reference values, such as the Tolerable Daily Intake (TDI). Regarding this we have to
513 note that none of the OCPs exceeded their respective TDIs (JECFA, 2000), and even did
514 not surpass 1% of those values, nor in the MB nor in the UB approach (TDI Σ DDTs =
515 10000 ng/kg b.w., TDI Σ HCHs = 5000 ng/kg b.w., TDI HCB = 160 ng/kg/day) (ATSDR,
516 2002; Luzardo et al., 2013a). To be able of comparing the exposure to PCBs with some

517 reference values it is necessary to use the approximation of toxic equivalence to dioxins
518 as defined by the WHO (Van den Berg et al., 2006), as the TDI for PCBs has been set in
519 the context of dioxin exposure (2 pg WHO-TEQ/kg b.w/day (SCF, 2000)). Once the
520 results were transformed using the corresponding TEFs, our results indicate that the
521 exposure to dioxin-like PCBs through the consumption of fishery products only accounts
522 for 1.08% of that TDI in the worst scenario (adults, UB approach, Table 2).

523

524 Regarding to the other group of organic pollutants included in this research – the PAHs
525 – the EDI of $\Sigma B[a]P_{eq}$ was estimated to be 9.34 ng/day and 5.30 ng/day in Spanish adults
526 and children respectively, and fivefold when the UB approach is considered. Similarly to
527 organochlorine pollutants, blue fish species were the main contributors to the exposure to
528 these carcinogenic pollutants within this food group (57.4% in adults and 46.9% in
529 children, Table 2). Although the TDI for the carcinogenic PAHs has not yet officially
530 established, we used the TDI for $B[a]P_{eq}$ of 20 ng/kg b.w. day, as recommended for the
531 Contaminated Land Exposure Assessment of UK (CLEA-UK, 2008). The EDIs of
532 $B[a]P_{eq}$ calculated in this study account for less than 3% of this reference value in both
533 adults and children, in the worst-case scenario (Table 2).

534

535 *3.2.2. Inorganic contaminants*

536

537 When we consider the intake of inorganic contaminants, contrary to what is described
538 above, we found that white fish is the main contributor. Arsenic is considered one of the
539 most dangerous elements for health and all the studies conducted so far show that the
540 foods that are the richest in inorganic arsenic are seaweed, fish, other seafood and cereals
541 (EFSA, 2009b). According to our estimations the daily intake of total As through fishery

542 products could be as much as 1.96 µg/kg/day (adults, worst case scenario (UB approach),
543 Table 2), which would represent almost 94% of the established TDI (2.1 µg/kg/day,
544 (JECFA, 2010)), which is of very much concern. If we take into account that the most
545 dangerous As is that which is in inorganic form, and we assume that 10% of total As in
546 fishery products is inorganic As (Rahman et al., 2012), the average intake would represent
547 around 14%-60% of the estimated average inorganic As exposure from food and water
548 across 19 European countries (0.13 to 0.56 µg/kg b.w./day, (EFSA, 2009b)). Moreover,
549 the EFSA CONTAM Panel has identified a range of values for the 95% lower confidence
550 limit of the benchmark dose of 1% extra risk (BMDL₀₁) for each endpoint of a wide range
551 of key epidemiological studies (0.3 to 8 µg/kg/day, (EFSA, 2009b)), and recommended
552 that the overall range is used as reference instead of a single reference value. Thus, the
553 lowest values, which correspond with the risk of lung cancer, are well below the MB-EDI
554 of 0.78 µg/kg/day reported in this study, which would mean that theoretically the current
555 pattern of fish consumption in Spain would not be exempt of risk (even more if the UB
556 approach is taken into account, Table 2).

557

558 The Cd has also been extensively studied due to its toxic properties (EFSA, 2009a), being
559 considered primarily toxic to the kidney, where it accumulates over time and may cause
560 renal dysfunction. Besides, the International Agency for Research on Cancer has
561 classified Cd as a probable human carcinogen on the basis of occupational studies, and
562 recently epidemiological studies have revealed an increased risk of lung, endometrium,
563 bladder, and breast cancer in relation with the environmental exposure to this metal
564 (EFSA, 2009a; Menon et al., 2015; Vilahur et al., 2015; Weidemann et al., 2015).
565 However, basically all the carcinogenicity data available are related to inhalation
566 exposure, and there are no studies of orally ingested cadmium suitable for quantitation,

567 so we did not further considered this metal as a carcinogen in the present study.
568 Nevertheless, as many other toxic effects (other than cancer) have been described for Cd,
569 a Provisional Tolerable Weekly Intake (PTWI) of 7 µg/kg has been established.
570 According to our estimations the average intake in Spanish population through the
571 consumption of fishery products does not reach 2% of its PTWI (9% when the UB
572 approach is considered). The EFSA has determined from the analyses of more than
573 140000 food samples that seafood are the commodities where the highest Cd levels are
574 detected, and besides it has also been determined that only 3-5% of this metal is absorbed
575 after dietary exposure (EFSA, 2009a). Considering this and the estimations done in this
576 research, we can conclude that the dietary exposure to Cd in Spain is currently very low,
577 and very far away from being worrying.

578

579 Finally, regarding to the Hg, it has also been established the foods in the group “Fish and
580 other seafood” have the highest values of this highly toxic heavy metal in comparison to
581 all other food groups, although the different surveys available indicate that the total Hg
582 content varies widely among different fish species, and is highest in predatory fish
583 (JECFA, 2004; JECFA, 2006). The toxic properties of Hg are well known, especially for
584 kidney and the developing nervous system. Therefore the EFSA’s CONTAM Panel has
585 established a PTWI of 4 µg/kg (EFSA, 2012) for this metal. According to our results, the
586 dietary exposure to total Hg from fishery products of an average Spanish consumer is
587 0.37 µg/kg/week in adults and 0.53 µg/kg/week in children (Table 2). These values are
588 more than tripled for both age groups when the UB approach is considered. As is
589 estimated that approximately 90% of the total mercury in fish and shellfish is present in
590 the form of methyl mercury (MeHg) (EFSA, 2005), our results would indicate that
591 Spanish adults would be exposed to 0.33 µg/kg/week, and Spanish children to 0.48

592 $\mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{week}$ of this extremely toxic form of Hg, in the Mb approach (1.13 $\mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{week}$
593 and 1.47 $\mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{week}$, respectively in the UB approach). However, it should be also noted
594 that one of the major risks that have been associated to Hg, and in particular to MeHg, is
595 developmental toxicity, where a brief exposure to the foetus can lead to permanent
596 damage. Various organizations have estimated the daily intake of mercury (as MeHg) that
597 is unlikely to be harmful. The World Health Organization has estimated that 0.22
598 $\mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{day}$ is unlikely to be harmful, with pregnant women identified for concern (Wise,
599 2004). Considering this, our estimates indicate that in the upper bound approach a Spanish
600 pregnant woman could be exposed to 73% of this reference value (0.16 $\mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{day}$), only
601 via seafood consumption, and the children, which are high consumers of seafood would
602 almost reach this threshold (96%). These results can be considered of very much concern.

603

604 The estimates of this study regarding Hg are consistent with the exposure estimates in the
605 European Union (EU) as calculated by the EFSA using the middle bound approach, which
606 range from the lowest minimum of 0.14 $\mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{week}$ in very elderly to the highest
607 maximum of 5.05 $\mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{week}$ in adolescents. If we additionally consider that it has been
608 estimated that Hg in fish would represent approximately 37% of total dietary intake
609 (36.8% of food product coverage) (EFSA, 2012), a bulk calculation indicate that Spanish
610 adults would be exposed to 25% of the PTWI through their total diet (9.2% from fishery
611 products), and that this exposure would reach 35.7% of PTWI in the case of children
612 (13.2% from fishery products). Therefore, the estimated exposure to total Hg in Spain
613 from the diet alone would not exceed the PTWI, as it has also been reported for the rest
614 of EU's countries (EFSA, 2012).

615

616 ***3.3. Health risk assessment via multiple contaminants associated to the consumption***

617 *of fishery products in Spain*

618

619 Although according to the above calculations none of the individual TDIs are exceeded
620 for any of the contaminants, the consumption of fish implies the exposure of the consumer
621 to multiple contaminants, and antagonistic, synergistic, and additive interactions among
622 the contaminants can occur. For the adequate human health risk assessment the USEPA
623 recommends that the additive model be used for multiple contaminants that cause similar
624 toxicological effects (USEPA, 2000; Yu et al., 2014). Using the calculated acute reference
625 doses (RfDs) and cancer slope factors (CSFs) for the contaminants included in this study
626 (USEPA, 2014) we have considered two types of health risks: acute toxicity and
627 carcinogenic (genotoxic) potential of fish consumption. For each of these endpoints, we
628 first calculated the individual CR_{lim} to estimate the exposure limits to these chemicals
629 through the consumption of fishery products, as previously reported (Yu et al., 2014).
630 Secondly, from the calculated CR_{lims} we calculated the individual RQs. The RQ
631 evaluation has been proposed as a convenient method of estimating population risk and
632 to provide a plausible worst-case scenario for initial screening of potential risk (USEPA,
633 2000; Yu et al., 2014). Finally, the RQs of each type of pollutant were summed and
634 presented as the overall risk associated to each subgroup of food (blue fish, white fish,
635 cephalopods, and other seafood) (Figure 1).

636

637 *3.3.1. Acute toxicity potential of the consumption of fishery products*

638

639 When the acute toxic effects of the contaminants were considered, the maximum
640 allowable consumption rates (CR_{lims}) (Table 3) of blue fish in children were from 350
641 times higher (for $\sum TEQ_{DL-PCBs}$) to 5185 times higher (for $B[a]P_{eq}$) than the current

642 consumption rate of this type of food (Table 2), and these values were more than double
643 in adults. For white fish the CR_{lims} were from 7 times higher (for As) to 15801 times
644 higher (for B[a]P_{eq}); for cephalopods the CR_{lims} ranged from 25 (As) to 127000 times
645 higher (Σ HCHs); and for seafood from 12 (As) to 91145 times higher (HCB) than the
646 current consumption rates of these food subgroups by Spanish children. Again, in all the
647 cases the estimations of maximum allowable consumption for Spanish adults were more
648 than double than in children (Table 3). Therefore, the individual RQs ranged from 0 to
649 0.06 in adults and 0 to 0.13 in children for the individual contaminants (Table 3), and at
650 most 0.2 for all contaminants (white fish, children) (Figure 1A). Thus, as all the RQ
651 values were much lower than 1 we can conclude that the consumption of the fishery
652 products would not pose risk of producing acute toxicity associated to their content in
653 chemical contaminants.

654

655 *3.3.2. Carcinogenic potential of the consumption of fishery products*

656

657 In a similar manner we also calculated the maximum allowable consumption limits and
658 the RQs associated to the current consumption of this group, but considering the
659 carcinogenic potential (Table 4).

660

661 Based on the contamination and the consumption data of fishery products, our
662 calculations indicate that again all the CR_{lim} of the individual pollutants were higher than
663 the pattern of current consumption (which would not indicate obvious health risks due to
664 the intake or uptake of contaminants via fish consumption would be experienced) except
665 in the case of inorganic As (using the current CSF value of 1.5 mg/kg/day on IRIS,
666 (USEPA, 2014)), for which the current consumption of all the subgroups of fishery

667 products would exceed the maximum allowable rate. When we considered the additive
668 effect of all contaminants by food subgroups (Figure 1B) the RQs were higher than 1 for
669 blue fish, white fish, and seafood in Spanish adults, and for white seafood in Spanish
670 children, mainly due to the contribution of As. This means that the current dietary intake
671 of fishery products would represent a risk of carcinogenicity, especially associated to the
672 consumption of white fish. These results are consistent with those recently reported in the
673 Mediterranean region, where the highest risk of carcinogenicity of the fish consumption
674 pattern was associated with the content in As of these foods (Copat et al., 2013). In that
675 study Copat et al. (2013) suggested a modification of the pattern of consumption of these
676 foods, as we also do in the following section.

677

678 ***3.4. Meal recommendation for consuming fishery products***

679

680 The USEPA has suggested that the CR_{lim} for carcinogenic and acute toxic effects
681 (whichever value is lower) should be used to calculate the maximum number of meals of
682 fishery products per month, and thus be able of giving advise to consumers to protect the
683 human health (USEPA, 2000; Yu et al., 2014). As in this study we found that the CR_{lims}
684 for carcinogenic effects were lower than those of acute toxicity, we used these values to
685 calculate the maximum number of meals of each food subgroup that would no pose
686 obvious health risks due to the intake or uptake of contaminants via fish consumption
687 (this is, consumption which that would allow a $RQ \leq 1$ for all products). In Table 5 we
688 summarize these recommendations for adults and children (RC_{mm}), and compare these
689 recommended maximum number of meals with the current pattern of consumption (C_{mm}).
690 According to our calculations, and strictly considering the results of our study, the
691 Spanish population should reduce the consumption of fishery products in general terms,

692 but more importantly in adults. Since the white fish involves greater risk, as detailed in
693 this research, its consumption should be further reduced, to around one-third of the
694 current consumption rate (that is, no more than one meal every two weeks). Adults should
695 also slightly reduce consumption of blue fish and cephalopods, crustaceans and mollusks
696 (Table 5). However, it is also necessary to consider that the health benefits of the high
697 value nutrients from seafood have been deeply studied (PUFa as well as vitamin D₃,
698 iodine, vitamin B12, etc.), and Therefore, it is not advisable to recommend abruptly
699 reducing fish consumption (EFSA, 2014). Nevertheless, the results of this study should
700 be taken into account for the design of appropriate risk communication campaigns aimed
701 to reduce the consumption of certain types of seafood; the aim should be an optimal risk-
702 to-benefit balance.

703

704 **4. CONCLUSIONS**

705

706 In this research we have estimated the daily intake of contaminants through the
707 consumption of fishery products. When these intakes are individually considered we
708 found that none of the reference values (tolerated daily intakes) were exceeded, although
709 the case of As, HCB, and B[a]P_{eq} could be somewhat of concern. However, when we
710 estimated the risk associated to multiple contaminants acting together we found a
711 moderate risk of carcinogenicity. Therefore, a decrease in the consumption of fish and
712 seafood is recommended to avoid the carcinogenic risk associated to these pollutants,
713 especially in the case of white fish, whose consumption should be reduced to one-third
714 of the current level. It seems necessary to maintain surveillance programs that monitor
715 the trend of persistent pollutants in sea foodstuffs, and especially of the concentrations of
716 toxic elements, such as arsenic. The results of this study may be taken of utility for risk

717 managers in the design of appropriate risk communication campaigns aimed to reduce
718 the consumption of certain types of seafood with the aim of obtaining an optimal risk-to-
719 benefit balance of fish consumption.

720

721

722 **5. FIGURE CAPTIONS**

723

724 **Figure 1.** Hazard ratios of the contaminants for acutely toxic effects (A) and carcinogenic
725 effects (B) in adults and children via consumption of fishery products. The red line
726 indicates the threshold for toxic effect (RQ = 1).

727

728 **Supplementary Figure 1.** Comparison of the levels of organic pollutants (A) and
729 inorganic pollutants (B) in fish (blue + white fish) and seafood ((cephalopods + seafood)

730 * P < 0.05; ** P < 0.01; *** P < 0.005

731

732 **6. REFERENCES**

733

734 AECOSAN. Modelo de dieta española para la determinación de la exposición
735 del consumidor a sustancias químicas. 2006. Agencia Española de
736 Seguridad Alimentaria y Nutrición. Gobierno de España, 2006.

737 AECOSAN. ENIDE: National Survey of Dietary Intake (2009-2010). Results
738 on consumption data. 2011. Agencia Española de Seguridad
739 Alimentaria y Nutrición. Gobierno de España, 2011.

740 Almeida-González M, Luzardo OP, Zumbado M, Rodríguez-Hernández A, Ruiz-
741 Suárez N, Sangil M, Camacho M, Henríquez-Hernández LA, Boada LD.
742 Levels of organochlorine contaminants in organic and conventional
743 cheeses and their impact on the health of consumers: an independent
744 study in the Canary Islands (Spain). Food Chem Toxicol 2012; 50:
745 4325-32.

746 ATSDR. (Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry). Toxicological
747 profile for hexachlorobenzene. US Department of Health and Human
748 Services, Public Health Service, Atlanta, GA,. 2002.

749 Bayarri S, Baldassarri LT, Iacovella N, Ferrara F, di Domenico A. PCDDs,
750 PCDFs, PCBs and DDE in edible marine species from the Adriatic
751 Sea. Chemosphere 2001; 43: 601-10.

752 Bergman A, Heindel JJ, Jobling S, Kidd KA, Zoeller RT. World Health
753 Organization: State of the Science of Endocrine Disrupting
754 Chemicals - 2012. 2012. UNEP Monographs, 2012.

755 Boada LD, Sangil M, Álvarez-León EE, Hernández-Rodríguez G, Henríquez-
756 Hernández LA, Camacho M, Zumbado M, Serra-Majem L, Luzardo OP.
757 Consumption of foods of animal origin as determinant of
758 contamination by organochlorine pesticides and
759 polychlorobiphenyls: Results from a population-based study in
760 Spain. *Chemosphere* 2014; 114: 121-8.

761 Bocio A, Domingo JL. Daily intake of polychlorinated dibenzo-p-
762 dioxins/polychlorinated dibenzofurans (PCDD/PCDFs) in foodstuffs
763 consumed in Tarragona, Spain: a review of recent studies (2001-
764 2003) on human PCDD/PCDF exposure through the diet. *Environ Res*
765 2005; 97: 1-9.

766 Bocio A, Domingo JL, Falcó G, Llobet JM. Concentrations of PCDD/PCDFs
767 and PCBs in fish and seafood from the Catalan (Spain) market:
768 estimated human intake. *Environ Int* 2007; 33: 170-5.

769 Bocio A, Nadal M, Domingo JL. Human exposure to metals through the diet
770 in Tarragona, Spain: temporal trend. *Biol Trace Elem Res* 2005;
771 104: 193-201.

772 Bosch AC, O'Neill B, Sigge GO, Kerwath SE, Hoffman LC. Heavy metals in
773 marine fish meat and consumer health: a review. *J Sci Food Agric*
774 2016; 96: 32-48.

775 Bucchia M, Camacho M, Santos MR, Boada LD, Roncada P, Mateo R, Ortiz-
776 Santaliesra ME, Rodriguez-Estival J, Zumbado M, Oros J,
777 Henriquez-Hernandez LA, Garcia-Alvarez N, Luzardo OP. Plasma
778 levels of pollutants are much higher in loggerhead turtle
779 populations from the Adriatic Sea than in those from open waters
780 (Eastern Atlantic Ocean). *Sci Total Environ* 2015; 523: 161-169.

781 Camacho M, Boada LD, Oros J, Lopez P, Zumbado M, Almeida-Gonzalez M,
782 Luzardo OP. Monitoring organic and inorganic pollutants in
783 juvenile live sea turtles: Results from a study of *Chelonia mydas*
784 and *Eretmochelys imbricata* in Cape Verde. *Sci Total Environ* 2014;
785 481C: 303-310.

786 Camacho M, Luzardo OP, Boada LD, Lopez Jurado LF, Medina M, Zumbado M,
787 Oros J. Potential adverse health effects of persistent organic
788 pollutants on sea turtles: Evidences from a cross-sectional study
789 on Cape Verde loggerhead sea turtles. *Sci Total Environ* 2013a;
790 458-460C: 283-289.

791 Camacho M, Oros J, Boada LD, Zaccaroni A, Silvi M, Formigaro C, Lopez
792 P, Zumbado M, Luzardo OP. Potential adverse effects of inorganic
793 pollutants on clinical parameters of loggerhead sea turtles
794 (*Caretta caretta*): Results from a nesting colony from Cape Verde,
795 West Africa. *Mar Environ Res* 2013b.

796 Carlin DJ, Naujokas MF, Bradham KD, Cowden J, Heacock M, Henry HF, Lee
797 JS, Thomas DJ, Thompson C, Tokar EJ, Waalkes MP, Birnbaum LS, Suk
798 WA. Arsenic and Environmental Health: State of the Science and
799 Future Research Opportunities. *Environ Health Perspect* 2015.

800 Carubelli G, Fanelli R, Mariani G, Nichetti S, Crosa G, Calamari D,
801 Fattore E. PCB contamination in farmed and wild sea bass
802 (*Dicentrarchus labrax* L.) from a coastal wetland area in central
803 Italy. *Chemosphere* 2007; 68: 1630-5.

804 CLEA-UK. Contaminated Land Exposure Assessment Model (CLEA-UK).
805 Available at: [http://www.devon.gov.uk/northhamburrowsreport-
806 appendix-g.pdf](http://www.devon.gov.uk/northhamburrowsreport-appendix-g.pdf). Accessed 7 November, 2014.

807 Copat C, Arena G, Fiore M, Ledda C, Fallico R, Sciacca S, Ferrante M.
808 Heavy metals concentrations in fish and shellfish from eastern
809 Mediterranean Sea: consumption advisories. *Food Chem Toxicol* 2013;
810 53: 33-7.

811 Darnerud PO, Atuma S, Aune M, Bjerselius R, Glynn A, Grawe KP, Becker
812 W. Dietary intake estimations of organohalogen contaminants
813 (dioxins, PCB, PBDE and chlorinated pesticides, e.g. DDT) based
814 on Swedish market basket data. *Food Chem Toxicol* 2006; 44: 1597-
815 606.

816 Di Lorenzo G, Federico P, De Placido S, Buonerba C. Increased risk of
817 bladder cancer in critical areas at high pressure of pollution of
818 the Campania region in Italy: A systematic review. *Crit Rev Oncol*
819 *Hematol* 2015; 96: 534-41.

820 Domingo JL, Bocio A. Levels of PCDD/PCDFs and PCBs in edible marine
821 species and human intake: a literature review. *Environ Int* 2007;
822 33: 397-405.

823 EFSA. Opinion of the scientific panel on contaminants in the food chain
824 on a request from the European Parliament related to the safety
825 assessment of wild and farmed fish. *EFSA journal* 2005; 236: 1-118.

826 EFSA. Polycyclic Aromatic Hydrocarbons in Food. Scientific Opinion of
827 the Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain. *The EFSA Journal*
828 2008; 724: 1-114.

829 EFSA. Cadmium in Food. Scientific Opinion of the Panel on Contaminants
830 in the Food Chain *EFSA journal* 2009a; 980: 1-139.

831 EFSA. Scientific opinion on Arsenic in Food. *EFSA journal* 2009b; 7: 1351-
832 1550.

833 EFSA. Scientific Opinion on the risk for public health related to the
834 presence of mercury and methylmercury in food. *EFSA journal* 2012;
835 10: 2985-3226.

836 EFSA. Scientific Opinion on health benefits of seafood (fish and
837 shellfish) consumption in relation to health risks associated with
838 exposure to methylmercury. *EFSA journal* 2014; 12: 1-80.

839 EFSA. Guidance on Uncertainty in EFSA Scientific Assessment EFSA
840 Scientific Committee (Draft). *The EFSA Journal* 2015.

841 EN. European Norm 1528-2. Fatty food - Determination of pesticides and
842 polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) - Part 2: Extraction of fat,
843 pesticides and PCBs, and determination of fat content. European
844 Committee for Standardization 1996a.

845 EN. European Norm 1528-3. Fatty food. Determination of pesticides and
846 polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs). Clean-up methods. European
847 Committee for Standardization 1996b.

848 Falco G, Domingo JL, Llobet JM, Teixido A, Casas C, Muller L. Polycyclic
849 aromatic hydrocarbons in foods: human exposure through the diet
850 in Catalonia, Spain. *J Food Prot* 2003; 66: 2325-31.

851 Falcó G, Llobet JM, Bocio A, Domingo JL. Daily intake of arsenic,
852 cadmium, mercury, and lead by consumption of edible marine species.
853 *J Agric Food Chem* 2006; 54: 6106-12.

854 Formigaro C, Henríquez-Hernández LA, Zaccaroni A, García-Hartmann M,
855 Camacho M, Boada LD, Zumbado M, Luzardo OP. Assessment of current
856 dietary intake of organochlorine contaminants and polycyclic
857 aromatic hydrocarbons in killer whales (*Orcinus orca*) through
858 direct determination in a group of whales in captivity. *Sci Total*
859 *Environ* 2014; 472: 1044-51.

860 García-Álvarez N, Boada LD, Fernández A, Zumbado M, Arbelo M, Sierra E,
861 Xuriach A, Almunia J, Camacho M, Luzardo OP. Assessment of the
862 levels of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons and organochlorine
863 contaminants in bottlenose dolphins (*Tursiops truncatus*) from the
864 Eastern Atlantic Ocean. *Mar Environ Res* 2014a; 100: 48-56.

865 García-Álvarez N, Martín V, Fernández A, Almunia J, Xuriach A, Arbelo
866 M, Tejedor M, Boada LD, Zumbado M, Luzardo OP. Levels and profiles
867 of POPs (organochlorine pesticides, PCBs, and PAHs) in free-
868 ranging common bottlenose dolphins of the Canary Islands, Spain.
869 *The Science of the total environment* 2014b; 493: 22-31.

870 Jarvis IW, Dreij K, Mattsson A, Jernstrom B, Stenius U. Interactions
871 between polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons in complex mixtures and
872 implications for cancer risk assessment. *Toxicology* 2014; 321C:
873 27-39.

874 JECFA. Joint FAO/WHO meetings on pesticide residues 2000. Expert Committee
875 on Food Additives, FAO Plant Production and Protection Paper 163/59
876 JECFA 2000; 5: 28.

877 JECFA. Methylmercury. In: Safety evaluation of certain food additives
878 and contaminants. Report of the 61st Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee
879 on Food Additives. Geneva, World Health Organization,
880 International Programme on Chemical Safety. WHO Technical Report
881 Series 922 pp 132-139.
882 http://whqlibdoc.who.int/trs/WHO_TRS_922.pdf. 2004.

883 JECFA. Methylmercury. Summary and conclusions of the 67th Joint FAO/WHO
884 Expert Committee on Food Additives. Geneva, World Health
885 Organization, International Programme on Chemical Safety. WHO
886 Technical Report Series 940 (in press).
887 <http://www.who.int/ipcs/food/jecfa/summaries/summary67.pdf>.
888 2006.

889 JECFA. Summary report of the seventy-second meeting of JECFA JECFA 2010;
890 72: 1-16.

891 Kakuschke A, Valentine-Thon E, Griesel S, Gandrass J, Perez Luzardo O,
892 Dominguez Boada L, Zumbado Pena M, Almeida Gonzalez M, Grebe M,
893 Profrock D, Erbsloeh HB, Kramer K, Fonfara S, Prange A. First
894 health and pollution study on harbor seals (*Phoca vitulina*) living
895 in the German Elbe estuary. *Mar Pollut Bull* 2010; 60: 2079-86.

896 Kortenkamp A, Martin O, Faust M, Evans R, Mckinlay R, Orton F, Rosivatz
897 E. State of the Art Assessment of Endocrine Disrupters, Final
898 Report. Available at: Accessed

899 Kris-Etherton PM, Harris WS, Appel LJ, American Heart Association.
900 Nutrition C. Fish consumption, fish oil, omega-3 fatty acids, and
901 cardiovascular disease. *Circulation* 2002; 106: 2747-57.

902 Liao PY, Liu CW, Liu WY. Bioaccumulation of mercury and polychlorinated
903 dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans in salty water organisms.
904 *Environ Monit Assess* 2016; 188: 12.

905 Llobet JM, Bocio A, Domingo JL, Teixido A, Casas C, Muller L. Levels of
906 polychlorinated biphenyls in foods from Catalonia, Spain:
907 estimated dietary intake. *J Food Prot* 2003a; 66: 479-84.

908 Llobet JM, Domingo JL, Bocio A, Casas C, Teixido A, Muller L. Human
909 exposure to dioxins through the diet in Catalonia, Spain:
910 carcinogenic and non-carcinogenic risk. *Chemosphere* 2003b; 50:
911 1193-200.

912 Llobet JM, Falco G, Casas C, Teixido A, Domingo JL. Concentrations of
913 arsenic, cadmium, mercury, and lead in common foods and estimated
914 daily intake by children, adolescents, adults, and seniors of
915 Catalonia, Spain. *J Agric Food Chem* 2003c; 51: 838-42.

916 Luzardo OP, Almeida-Gonzalez M, Henriquez-Hernandez LA, Zumbado M,
917 Alvarez-Leon EE, Boada LD. Polychlorobiphenyls and organochlorine
918 pesticides in conventional and organic brands of milk: occurrence
919 and dietary intake in the population of the Canary Islands (Spain).
920 *Chemosphere* 2012; 88: 307-15.

921 Luzardo OP, Rodríguez-Hernández A, Quesada-Tacoronte Y, Ruiz-Suárez N,
922 Almeida-González M, Henríquez-Hernández LA, Zumbado M, Boada LD.
923 Influence of the method of production of eggs on the daily intake
924 of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons and organochlorine
925 contaminants: an independent study in the Canary Islands (Spain).
926 *Food Chem Toxicol* 2013a; 60: 455-62.

927 Luzardo OP, Ruiz-Suarez N, Almeida-Gonzalez M, Henriquez-Hernandez LA,
928 Zumbado M, Boada LD. Multi-residue method for the determination
929 of 57 persistent organic pollutants in human milk and colostrum
930 using a QuEChERS-based extraction procedure. *Anal Bioanal Chem*
931 2013b; 405: 9523-36.

932 Luzardo OP, Ruiz-Suárez N, Henríquez-Hernández LA, Valerón PF, Camacho
933 M, Zumbado M, Boada LD. Assessment of the exposure to
934 organochlorine pesticides, PCBs and PAHs in six species of
935 predatory birds of the Canary Islands, Spain. *Sci Total Environ*
936 2014; 472: 146-53.

937 MAGRAMA. Informe del Consumo de Alimentos en España 2014. 2015.

938 Ministerio de Agricultura, Alimentación y Medioambiente. Gobierno
939 de España, 2015.

940 Martí-Cid R, Bocio A, Llobet JM, Domingo JL. Intake of chemical
941 contaminants through fish and seafood consumption by children of
942 Catalonia, Spain: health risks. *Food Chem Toxicol* 2007; 45: 1968-
943 74.

944 Martín Cerdeño VJ. Consumo de pescado en España. In: Mercasa, editor.
945 Alimentación en España 2009. Producción, Industria, Distribución
946 y Consumo. Mercasa, Madrid, España, 2010.

947 Menon AV, Chang J, Kim J. Mechanisms of Divalent Metal Toxicity in
948 Affective Disorders. *Toxicology* 2015.

949 Mezzetta S, Cirilini M, Ceron P, Tecleanu A, Caligiani A, Palla G,
950 Sansebastiano GE. Concentration of DL-PCBs in fish from market of
951 Parma city (north Italy): estimated human intake. *Chemosphere*
952 2011; 82: 1293-300.

953 Moon HB, Kim HS, Choi M, Yu J, Choi HG. Human health risk of
954 polychlorinated biphenyls and organochlorine pesticides resulting
955 from seafood consumption in South Korea, 2005-2007. *Food Chem*
956 *Toxicol* 2009; 47: 1819-25.

957 Nisbet IC, LaGoy PK. Toxic equivalency factors (TEFs) for polycyclic
958 aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs). *Regulatory toxicology and*
959 *pharmacology* : RTP 1992; 16: 290-300.

960 Rahman MA, Hasegawa H, Lim RP. Bioaccumulation, biotransformation and
961 trophic transfer of arsenic in the aquatic food chain. *Environ Res*
962 2012; 116: 118-35.

963 Rodríguez-Hernández A, Boada LD, Almeida-González M, Mendoza Z, Ruiz-
964 Suárez N, Valerón PF, Camacho M, Zumbado M, Henríquez-Hernández
965 LA, Luzardo OP. An estimation of the carcinogenic risk associated
966 with the intake of multiple relevant carcinogens found in meat and
967 charcuterie products. *Sci Total Environ* 2015a; 514: 33-41.

968 Rodríguez-Hernández A, Boada LD, Mendoza Z, Ruiz-Suárez N, Valerón PF,
969 Camacho M, Zumbado M, Almeida-González M, Henríquez-Hernández LA,
970 Luzardo OP. Consumption of organic meat does not diminish the
971 carcinogenic potential associated with the intake of persistent
972 organic pollutants (POPs). *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int* 2015b.

973 Rodríguez-Hernández A, Camacho M, Boada LD, Ruiz-Suárez N, Almeida-
974 González M, Henríquez-Hernández LA, Zumbado M, Luzardo OP. Daily
975 intake of anthropogenic pollutants through yogurt consumption in
976 the Spanish population. *Journal of Applied Animal Research* 2015c;
977 43: 373-383.

978 SCF. Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Food (SCF) on the risk
979 assessment of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in food. Update based
980 on new scientific information available since the adoption of the
981 SCF opinion of 22nd November 2000. 2000.

982 Sharma BM, Bharat GK, Tayal S, Nizzetto L, Cupr P, Larssen T. Environment
983 and human exposure to persistent organic pollutants (POPs) in
984 India: A systematic review of recent and historical data. *Environ*
985 *Int* 2014; 66C: 48-64.

986 Storelli MM, Barone G, Perrone VG, Giacominielli-Stuffler R.
987 Polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), dioxins and furans (PCDD/Fs):
988 Occurrence in fishery products and dietary intake. *Food Chemistry*
989 2011; 127: 1648-1652.

990 USEPA. Guidance for Assessing Chemical Contaminant Data for Use In Fish
991 Advisories. Volume 2: Risk Assessment and Fish Consumption Limits
992 - Third Edition.
993 [http://water.epa.gov/scitech/swguidance/fishshellfish/techguidan](http://water.epa.gov/scitech/swguidance/fishshellfish/techguidance/risk/volume2_index.cfm)
994 [ce/risk/volume2_index.cfm](http://water.epa.gov/scitech/swguidance/fishshellfish/techguidance/risk/volume2_index.cfm) 2000.

995 USEPA. Integrated Risk Information System (IRIS). Available at:
996 <http://www.epa.gov/IRIS/>. Accessed 27 October, 2014.

997 Van den Berg M, Birnbaum LS, Denison M, De Vito M, Farland W, Feeley M,
998 Fiedler H, Hakansson H, Hanberg A, Haws L, Rose M, Safe S, Schrenk

999 D, Tohyama C, Tritscher A, Tuomisto J, Tysklind M, Walker N,
1000 Peterson RE. The 2005 World Health Organization reevaluation of
1001 human and Mammalian toxic equivalency factors for dioxins and
1002 dioxin-like compounds. *Toxicol Sci* 2006; 93: 223-41.
1003 Vazquez M, Calatayud M, Jadan Piedra C, Chiocchetti GM, Velez D, Devesa
1004 V. Toxic trace elements at gastrointestinal level. *Food Chem*
1005 *Toxicol* 2015; 86: 163-75.
1006 Vilahur N, Vahter M, Broberg K. The Epigenetic Effects of Prenatal
1007 Cadmium Exposure. *Curr Environ Health Rep* 2015; 2: 195-203.
1008 Weidemann DK, Weaver VM, Fadzowski JJ. Toxic environmental exposures and
1009 kidney health in children. *Pediatr Nephrol* 2015.
1010 WHO. Health risks of persistent organic pollutants from long-range
1011 transboundary air pollution. 2003, 2003.
1012 Wise RA. Dopamine, learning and motivation. *Nat Rev Neurosci* 2004; 5:
1013 483-94.
1014 Yu Y, Wang X, Yang D, Lei B, Zhang X, Zhang X. Evaluation of human health
1015 risks posed by carcinogenic and non-carcinogenic multiple
1016 contaminants associated with consumption of fish from Taihu Lake,
1017 China. *Food Chem Toxicol* 2014; 69: 86-93.
1018