

# ARTI MUSICES

HRVATSKI MUZIKOLOŠKI ZBORNIK  
CROATIAN MUSICOLOGICAL REVIEW

*Arti music.*, god. 51, br. 1, str. 1-218, Zagreb 2020.

<http://doi.org/10.21857/yrvqtpn79>

## SADRŽAJ — CONTENTS

Predgovor / Foreword ( <i>Lucija KONFIC</i> ) .....	5-6
IZVORNI ZNANSTVENI ČLANCI – RESEARCH PAPERS	
<i>Daniela PERKOVIĆ: Kantual fra Pavla Vučkovića mlađeg iz 1768. godine:</i> <i>repertoarno-povijesni prikaz rukopisa</i> .....	7-28
Summary: Chant Book by Franciscan Pavao Vučković Junior (1768): Historical and Repertorial Presentation of the Manuscript .....	28
<i>Monika JURIĆ JANJIK: »La strada della virtù«: o funkcijama glazbe u djelu</i> <i>Sretan grad (1553.) Frane Petrića</i> .....	29-45
Summary: »La strada della virtù«: Functions of Music in Frane Petrić's <i>La città felice (1553)</i> .....	45
<i>Dalibor DAVIDOVIĆ: Svršetak Porina</i> .....	47-63
Summary: <i>Porin's Ending</i> .....	63
<i>Ivana KLAJZNER: »Rasuta baščina«: slučaj Hrvatskog pjevačkog društva »Kolo«</i> .....	83-94
Summary: »Scattered Heritage«: The Case of the Croatian Singing Society »Kolo« .....	94
PRETHODNA PRIOPĆENJA – PRELIMINARY PAPERS	
<i>Tina BOHAK ADAM: Performances of Slovenian Bass Julij Betetto (1885-1963)</i> <i>in Croatia</i> .....	65-82
Sažetak: Nastupi slovenskog basa Julija Betetta (1885. – 1963.) u Hrvatskoj.....	82

---

 PREGLEDNI RADOVI – REVIEW PAPERS

<i>Carla CUOMO – Giuseppina LA FACE: Music Pedagogy in Relation to Musicology and Educational Sciences: Three Areas of Intervention .....</i>	95-109
Sažetak: Glazbena pedagogija u odnosu na muzikologiju i obrazovne znanosti: tri područja intervencije .....	109

## PRVI MUZIKOLOŠKI KORACI – FIRST MUSICOLOGICAL STEPS

<i>Ana EREŠ: Tajni život »Wopaternija«: susret prošlosti, sadašnjosti i budućnosti u dodiru zvuka .....</i>	111-130
Summary: The Secret Life of »Wopaterni«: Encounter of the Past, the Present and the Future within the Touch of Sound.....	130

## SAŽECI DOKTORSKIH RADOVA – SUMMARIES OF PhD THESES

<i>Zdravko DRENJANČEVIĆ: The Elements of Traditional Slavonian Music in the Pieces of 20th-Century Art Music Composers .....</i>	131-136
<i>Jelka VUKOBRATOVIĆ: Music Labour of Local Musicians in the Social Life of Križevci, Croatia .....</i>	137-139

RECENZIJE, PRIKAZI I INFORMACIJE O PUBLIKACIJAMA –  
REVIEWS AND INFORMATION ON PUBLICATIONS

<i>Nada Bezić: Tematski popis skladbi Blagoja Berse, Zagreb: Hrvatski glazbeni zavod, 2018, 547 str., notni primjeri, ISBN 978-953-99277-7-4 (Koraljka KOS).....</i>	141-144
<i>Sanja Majer-Bobetko: Hrvatska glazbena historiografija od početka 20. stoljeća do 1945. godine, Zagreb: Hrvatsko muzikološko društvo, 2019, 287 str., ISBN 978-953-6090-62-4 (Rozina PALIĆ-JELAVIĆ).....</i>	144-147

## IZVJEŠĆA – REPORTS

<i>Ljubljana – Međunarodni muzikološki simpozij Syntagma Musicum 1619 – 2019, 8. – 9. 4. 2019. (Dora LOVREČIĆ, Andrea GRDENIĆ) .....</i>	149-151
<i>Zadar – The First Baltic-Adriatic Summer School on Digital Humanities, BAL-ADRIA 2019, 16. – 22. 6. 2019. (Lucija KONFIC, Sara RIES) .....</i>	151-152
<i>Halle (Saale) – Zwischen Alcina und Theodora. Frauengestalten in den Werken Händels und seiner Zeitgenossen. Internationale Wissenschaftliche Konferenz Anlässlich der Händel-Festspiele in Halle (Saale). Martin-Luther-Universität Halle-Wittenberg; Stiftung Händel-Haus Halle; Georg-Friedrich-Händel-Gesellschaft. 1., 3. – 5. 7. 2019. (Ivan ČURKOVIĆ) .....</i>	152-156
<i>Reichenau an der Rax, Austrija – 7. Konferencija isaScience: Just P(l)ay! Music as Labour, 7. – 11. kolovoza 2019. (Tanja HALUŽAN).....</i>	156-158
<i>Bukurešt, Rumunjska – International Musicological Conference Musical and Cultural Osmoses in the Balkans, National University of Music, 2. – 6. 9. 2019. (Stanislav TUKSAR).....</i>	158-160

<i>Zagreb – Međunarodni i interdisciplinarni simpozij Glazba, umjetnosti i politika: revolucije i restauracije u Europi i Hrvatskoj 1815. – 1860., 16. – 19. 10. 2019. (Sara RIES)</i> .....	161-163
<i>Graz – Kunstuniversität Graz, Zentrum für Genderforschung: Musikerinnen in der Region. Handlungsräume und ihre Akteurinnen in der Steiermark, 28. – 29. 10. 2019. (Vjera KATALINIĆ)</i> .....	164-166
<i>Zadar - Okrugli stol Franz von Suppè – baština kao kulturni potencijal, 15. 11. 2019. (Mirko JANKOV)</i> .....	166-168
<i>Bukurešt – National University of Music Bucharest, International Conference Elites and Their Musics: Music and Music-Making in the 19th-Century South-Eastern Europe Salons, 21. – 23. 11. 2019. (Vjera KATALINIĆ)</i> .....	168-170
<i>Zagreb – Okrugli stol Predmetno označivanje iz područja glazbe, 22. 11. 2019. (Željka RADOVINIĆ)</i> .....	170-173
<i>Lisabon – DESIR Winter School Shaping New Approaches to Data Management in Arts and Humanities, 10. – 13. 12. 2019. (Sara RIES)</i> .....	174
<i>Innsbruck – Transkribus User Conference 2020, 6. – 7. 2. 2020. (Sara RIES)</i> .....	175
<i>Zagreb – Okrugli stol projekta CROMUSCODEX70 Europski kontekst i srednjovjekovna glazba u povijesnim hrvatskim zemljama, 5. 3. 2020. (Daniela PERKOVIĆ)</i> .....	175-179
<i>Djelatnost Hrvatskog muzikološkog društva u 2018. i 2019. godini (Stanislav TUKSAR)</i>	180-184
<i>Djelatnost Odsjeka za povijest hrvatske glazbe Zavoda za povijest hrvatske književnosti, kazališta i glazbe HAZU u 2018. i 2019. godini (Vjera KATALINIĆ)</i> .....	185-207
<i>Djelatnost Odsjeka za muzikologiju Muzičke akademije Sveučilišta u Zagrebu u akademskoj godini 2018/2019. (Ivan ĆURKOVIĆ)</i> .....	208-215
<b>IN MEMORIAM</b>	
<i>Gorana Doliner (Sarajevo, 7. kolovoza 1945. – Zagreb, 8. ožujka 2020.) (Sanja MAJER-BOBETKO)</i> .....	217-218



## MUSIC PEDAGOGY IN RELATION TO MUSICOLOGY AND EDUCATIONAL SCIENCES: THREE AREAS OF INTERVENTION

CARLA CUOMO

*Department of Arts  
Bologna University  
via Barberia 4  
40123 BOLOGNA, Italy*

UDK / UDC: 37:78

DOI: <http://doi.org/10.21857/>

Pregledni članak / Review Paper

Primljeno / Received: 17. 2. 2020.

Prihvaćeno / Accepted: 27. 3. 2020.

GIUSEPPINA LA FACE

*Alma Mater Professor  
Bologna University  
40123 BOLOGNA, Italy*

### *Abstract*

There has long been an unnatural separation in the Western world between the pedagogic-didactic field and musicology, and the contemporary situation has not substantially changed. Musicology and pedagogic-didactic studies have chosen, and proceeded along, parallel paths which do not converge.

The conceptual starting point is an awareness of two problems: on the one hand, musicology runs the risk of becoming self-referential if it does not open itself up to a vital relationship with the political aspects of education; on the other hand, the educational sciences develop models of music education the content of which

is not updated on the basis of musicological knowledge. This disconnection causes the *making* of music to prevail over *knowing* music, instead of the two dimensions being integrated.

This article describes the results of an Italian research project carried out by an Italian University Network for Music Education.

**Keywords:** Educational Sciences; Music Education; Musicology; Music Pedagogy; University Network for Music Education

**Ključne riječi:** obrazovne znanosti; glazbeno obrazovanje; glazbena pedagogija; sveučilišna mreža za glazbeno obrazovanje

## *Introduction*

This paper outlines principal lines of investigation pursued by Italian scientific research in the field of music pedagogy and didactics. The research is being conducted by the DAR – Department of Arts at Bologna University in collaboration with »Il Saggiatore musicale«, which is not only an association of musicologists but also a national teacher-training organization. The research involves an international group of musicologists engaged in epistemologically re-founding music pedagogy. It has been carried out in the framework of a network involving ten Italian universities and linked to the *Transmission of Knowledge as a Primary Aim in Music Education* Study Group at the International Musicological Society (IMS), coordinated by Giuseppina La Face. This process has been unfolding for at least fifteen years, and from the outset it was aimed at tackling two problematic and interconnected issues: (1) the relationship between musicology and music pedagogy; (2) the relationship between music pedagogy and the educational sciences. All of these areas would benefit greatly from maintaining close reciprocal ties, but such is not always the case. Therefore, to encourage stronger relationships between musicology, music pedagogy and educational sciences, Italian research has focused on the following three areas:

1. Political institutional relationships;
2. Relationships between schools and universities;
3. Impact on the academic community.

After providing a brief historical overview of the relationship between musical knowledge and its transmission in Western educational systems from antiquity to the present day, this article presents the methodology used in the Italian research conducted by the above-mentioned institutions and the model of musical education developed as part of this research project. Continuing the focus on this model, the article explains and discusses the pedagogical and didactic musical concepts, rooted in musicology and educational sciences, that underpin our framework. Finally, it presents the research results achieved on both the epistemological and the political-institutional levels while also highlighting the directions in which the research itself has developed.

### *A concise history of the relationships between musicology, music pedagogy and the educational sciences*

historically, musicology and music pedagogy enjoyed an uninterrupted relationship until at least the modern age. In ancient times, in fact, music was included in the *Septem artes liberales*, the scientific and educational system for instructing men from the highest ranks of society, those »free« of the need to engage in the kind of physical effort characterizing the mechanical arts based on manual labour.

Only free men received this form of higher education focused on learning to speak and reason. Music, as a number-based science, was considered an *ars* belonging to the set of mathematical disciplines comprising the *Quadrivium*, and as such was positioned at the foundations of intellectual education. Hans Heinrich Eggebrecht has explained the medieval concept of *ars*: »not art in the modern sense, but knowledge and study, scientific formulation, the didactic processing of subjects (*scientia, disciplina, doctrina*). [...] This concept emphasized knowledge, comprehension, and understanding and was connected to didactic precepts and rules: 'ars vero dicta est, quod artis praeceptis regulisque consistat'«. <sup>1</sup> Given the undisputed authoritativeness of music as a science, and thus form of understanding and knowledge, it was necessary to prioritize the theoretical level over the didactic one. The German scholar also pointed out that, when music shifted from the liberal arts system to the fine arts one at the beginning of the modern age, this transition led to terminological changes in the musical lexicon. This vocabulary became increasingly technical-practical because it was no longer aimed at scientific reasoning, but rather at highlighting the quality of the effect of music on the human senses. From the 18th century onwards, therefore, a rupture developed in the relationship between scientific musical knowledge and its transmission, that is, between musicology and music pedagogy. It was the move to include music among the »fine arts« that led to music teaching being carried out in the technical field of composition or performance. Beginning with the birth of the *Musikwissenschaft* in the second half of the 19th century, music science and music teaching and learning drifted even further apart. Music teaching and learning remained confined to the field of technical and practical specialisation that was widespread at various levels, from professional roles to the musical amateurism typical of middle-class society. Musicology, on the other hand, developed as a theoretical, reflexive study of musical phenomena. These phenomena were no longer understood as a means of achieving transcendence – as they had been viewed in ancient Greek cosmology and metaphysics and later in the theological approach of the Christian Middle Ages – but instead taken at face value, in terms of their own characteristics and intrinsic value. Beginning in the second half of the 20th century, musicology first specialized in the study of musical structures before expanding to also take into account the social context, but it substantially failed to address the issue of the scholastic transmission of knowledge. This divorce between the pedagogic-didactic field and musicology still persists even today. <sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Hans Heinrich EGGBRECHT: »Ars musica«. Storia di un concetto medievale, in: Fabio Alberto GALLO (ed.): *Musica e Storia tra Medioevo e età moderna*, Bologna: Il Mulino, 1986, pp. 109-116 (translated from this Italian translation; original edition: »Ars musica». *Musikanschauung des Mittelalters und ihre Nachwirkungen*, *Die Sammlung*, XII, 1957, pp. 306-313, 315, 317, 320).

<sup>2</sup> Arnfried EDLER, Siegmund HELMS and Helmuth HOPF: *Musikpädagogik und Musikwissenschaft*, Wilhelmshaven: Noetzel, 1987; Giuseppina LA FACE: Keynote Address: Musicology and Music

The discipline of music pedagogy, for its part, is young just like musicology but of even more recent coinage. It developed in the 20th century together with the spread of public schooling, or at least the focus on a type of education that also targets the working class. It is significant that, since its birth, this discipline has stemmed not from musicology but rather from the attention that some composers gave to children's musical learning: examples include Émile Jaques Dalcroze, Carl Orff, Zoltán Kodály, Maurice Martenot. Despite acting as music education pioneers, these composers could not have conceptualized music education as a 'discipline' in its own right within the more general education of human beings: since they themselves possessed a specialized training background, their »methods« were calibrated to encourage the acquisition of specific musical skills, nurtured in part through movement (Jaques Dalcroze and Orff) or painting (Martenot), and at any rate linked to other artistic endeavours. Turning our gaze to Italy, for instance, one example of this phenomenon is Maria Montessori. Although Montessori was a physician rather than a pedagogue, she was a great pioneer of *tout court* education and the founder of a pedagogical methodology in which training in musical listening plays a prominent role. More broadly, pedagogues in 20th-century Italy determined that music should be included in the general educational framework. And yet, the fact that these planners lacked specific musical training prevented them from laying the foundations for the kind of scientific music pedagogy that would have been consistent with the development of educational and didactic research.

The second problematic issue is the link between music pedagogy and educational sciences: although some pedagogical approaches do consider the themes and problems of public music education, with only a few exceptions in the Western world to date such investigations have not been developed on rigorous epistemological bases. By rigorous bases we mean foundations that are connected with both musicology and educational sciences at the same time. This phenomenon is evident when observing curricula for the training of music teachers in both Europe and the United States. In the Anglo-American system, this training occurs in music education departments that do not include any musicological courses. Such courses are instead found in music departments, which also include performative subjects and in any case are not connected in any way with departments of education. In Europe, there are some countries that follow this approach: countries such as Italy, France and Germany thus clearly distinguish between musicological training, which is offered at the university level – where even its departments are separate from educational sciences departments – and practical music training, which is instead offered at conservatories or academies of music. These distinc-



tions have favoured the development of a music pedagogy that is deficient in terms of musical scientific knowledge and lags behind the evolution of the very concept of 'pedagogy' in the 'education and training sciences', in that the latter disciplines have succeeded in overcoming the exclusively historical and philosophical structure of the former through a widely interdisciplinary approach. Especially at school, the value of musical education in overall human education is unanimously recognized, and all the more so in the European Union. Indeed, EU regulatory documents specify that the construction of European identity and citizenship should be based on musical competences as well. These are included under the eighth point of key competences for life-long learning, relating to »cultural awareness and expression«.<sup>3</sup>

Italian research has emphasized that musicology runs the risk of becoming self-referential if it fails to engage with music pedagogy; for their part, educational sciences could not develop musical educational models without taking into account specialized musical knowledge. Without such engagement, both musicology and educational sciences would thus remain separate from the political aspects of education, aspects which are highly important for avoiding cultural impoverishment and musical cultural illiteracy in particular, notably ignorance of music history. Therefore, Italian researchers have tried to build a solid epistemological basis for music pedagogy, a basis rooted on the one hand in musicology and on the other in educational sciences.

### *Description of the research*

DAR – Department of Arts et Bologna University and »Il Saggiatore musicale« conducted scientific research in music pedagogy and didactics beginning in the early 2000s.<sup>4</sup> In those years, scholars worked intensely on two fronts: pure research and applied research.

Pure research aimed at updating and redefining the model of musical education in order to bring it into line with societal advancements and changes in educational needs. On the theoretical and methodological level, pure research investigated the processes of music teaching and learning on the basis of cultural-historical and cognitivist-type psychological theories<sup>5</sup> and of general pedagogical and didactic

<sup>3</sup> Recommendation of the European Parliament and Council, 2006.

<sup>4</sup> Giuseppina LA FACE BIANCONI, Carla CUOMO, Elisabetta PASQUINI (eds.): *Musicologia e Pedagogia musicale. Resoconti delle ricerche in corso (2014)*, Bologna: Bononia University Press, 2018.

<sup>5</sup> Lev Semënovič VYGOTSKIJ: *Myšlenie i reč'*, Moskva-Leningrad: Gosudarstvennoe Social'no-Ekonomičeskoe Izdatel'stvo, 1934 (en. tr. *Thought and Language*, edited and translated by Eugenia Hanfamn and Gertrude Vakar, New York and London: John Wiley and Sons, Boston: The M.I.T. Press, 1962); *Istorija razvoitija višših psihiceskih funktij*, Moskva: Akadjemija p'edagogičjeskih nauk, 1960 (en. tr. *The History of the Development of Higher Mental functions*, transl. by Maria J. Hall; prologue by Jo-

theories with a problematicist<sup>6</sup> and pragmatist nature,<sup>7</sup> conceived in a disciplinary perspective thanks to the input of international musicology.<sup>8</sup> This investigation proceeded along two main lines: top-down and bottom-up. In the first case, the research group developed a disciplinary model in theory and tested it in various didactic systems, each one different from the other. In the second case, through the use of clinical experimental protocols, the researchers observed, monitored and evaluated existing teaching practices to assess their functional or dysfunctional aspects. The two research perspectives were closely integrated with each other in keeping with a *practice-theory-practice* circle so as to develop a model of music education aimed at ensuring the historical and cultural learning of music.<sup>9</sup>

The applied research gradually translated the results of the pure research on the ground through a rich array of initiatives involving substantial, intense efforts to establish, maintain and cultivate inter-institutional relations, seeing as those of us involved in pedagogy cannot avoid engaging directly with society, alongside a substantial engagement in terms of organizing various activities. This applied research was aimed at spreading the model of music education developed by our pure research through institutional, scientific and cultural relations to the national, European and international levels. The project also sought to disseminate the model we have developed through relations with countless schools and teachers, promoting training courses for teachers, educational projects for students, and also artistic performance events showcasing the fruit of the various training and music education activities. We outline the most politically relevant initiatives here below (La Face, *Project results*).

seph Glick, ed. of the English translation Robert W. Reiber, New York, London: Plenum, 1997); Jerome BRUNER: *On Knowing. Essays for the Left Hand*. Cambridge (Mass.): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1964; *Toward a Theory of Instruction*, Cambridge (Mass.): Harvard University Press, 1966; *The Culture of Education*, Cambridge (Mass.): Harvard University Press, 1996.

<sup>6</sup> Giovanni Maria BERTIN: *Educazione alla ragione*, Roma: Armando, 1968; Franco FRABBONI: I fondamenti teoretici del problematicismo, in: M. GATTULLO et al. (ed.): *Educazione e ragione. Scritti in onore di Giovanni Maria Bertin*, 2 vol., Firenze: La Nuova Italia, 1985, pp. 63-68; Franco FRABBONI and Franca PINTO MINERVA: *Manuale di pedagogia generale*, Roma-Bari: Laterza, 2001; Massimo BALDACCI: *Trattato di pedagogia generale*, Roma: Carocci, 2012; Berta MARTINI: *Didattiche disciplinari. Aspetti teorici e metodologici*, Bologna: Pitagora, 2000; *Formare ai saperi. Per una pedagogia della conoscenza*, Milano: FrancoAngeli, 2005.

<sup>7</sup> John DEWEY: *How We Think*, Boston, New York, Chicago: Heath & Co, 1910; *Democracy and Education: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Education*, New York: Macmillan, 1916; *Experience and Education*, New York: Kappa Delta, 1938; *Logic, The Theory of Inquiry*, New York: Holt, 1938.

<sup>8</sup> Giuseppina LA FACE, Keynote Address: Musicology and Music Pedagogy: An Unnatural Divorce, pp. 157-163; Italian Musicologists and the challenge of music pedagogy, pp. 1-18.

<sup>9</sup> Carla CUOMO: *Dall'ascolto all'esecuzione. Orientamenti per la Pedagogia e la Didattica della musica*, Milano: FrancoAngeli, 2018, pp. 29-33.

### *The model of music education*

Our scientific research in this case began from the observation that scholastic and extra-scholastic musical education models in Italy – also reflecting broader trends in music education more generally – tend to be based on weak conceptual formulations which identify music education *sic et simpliciter* with musical entertainment or music therapy, i.e. formulations that exalt the emotional aspects more than the cognitive ones, or the productive aspects to the detriment of the epistemic ones, thus privileging »making« over »knowing« music.<sup>10</sup> The model of music education developed here instead integrates these two facets of music, positioning them on equal footing and, above all, making them interdependent in teaching and learning: knowledge is the basis of understanding and understanding consists in granting meaning to an experience. Thought itself is formed and becomes intelligent if it learns to understand through reflective experience, as Dewey pointed out.<sup>11</sup> The fundamental scientific operation, therefore, consisted in defining objects, languages and methods of music pedagogy at the intersection of musicology and the educational sciences. The sets of knowledge offered by these two scientific fields, namely historical-critical-aesthetic musical knowledge, which also includes technical-practical knowledge, and psycho-pedagogical didactic knowledge, make up the store of specialized knowledge that teachers must possess.

The model of musical education developed as part of this project thus has a two-fold aim. Pedagogically, it is aimed at 'understanding' music in history and culture. Didactically, it is aimed at defining strategies and methodologies for transposing *learned knowledge* (evaluating texts, reconstructing contexts, analysing scores, investigating the mechanisms of patronage and music reception, examining theoretical systems and practical models for performing and composing) into *didactic knowledge*, that is, into a form of knowledge that is filtered by education while at the same time nurturing it.

In order to clarify the scope of this approach, it is necessary to specify what musical comprehension means and to identify both the theoretical consequences and the educational implications of having defined this as the model's goal.

We use »musical comprehension« to indicate a »reading« of the musical text in the sense that Carl Dahlhaus clarified.<sup>12</sup> It is a fundamentally historical approach which mediates between aesthetics and history in that it reconstructs history »as a nexus of traditions between the various aesthetic and technical-compositional con-

<sup>10</sup> Giuseppina LA FACE BIANCONI: Il cammino dell'Educazione musicale: vicoli chiusi e strade maestre, in: Giuseppina LA FACE BIANCONI and Franco FRABBONI (eds.): *Educazione musicale e Formazione*, Milano: FrancoAngeli, 2008, pp. 13-25.

<sup>11</sup> John DEWEY: *How We Think; Democracy and Education: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Education*.

<sup>12</sup> Carl DAHLHAUS: *Grundlagen der Musikgeschichte*, Köln: Volk, 1977; Che significa e a qual fine si studia la storia della musica, *Il Saggiatore musicale*, XII (2005), pp. 219-230.

figurations that have allowed art to establish itself as art«. <sup>13</sup> Effectively understanding the configurations the German musicologist is referring to entails two aspects. One is a historical-chronological understanding based on a succession of musical works, an approach that follows what might be described as a horizontal timeline. At the same time, however, there is another aspect, namely a circular vertical understanding or, rather, what might be described as a spiral understanding that delves deeply into each musical piece, tracing »the imprint of the reception of earlier works (understood, however, as works in their entirety, not as mere sums of musical techniques)«. <sup>14</sup> To do so requires a great deal of knowledge. La Face Bianconi synthesizes the pedagogical didactic articulation of this musicological concept in these terms: as the ability to grasp the structure of a piece of music through critical, and therefore reflective, listening; to relate it to the context of its production and fruition, understand its functions, perceive its relations with other sets of knowledge, and discover its »meaning«. <sup>15</sup>

On the theoretical level, the fact that the model is aimed at fostering the historical and cultural understanding of music reinforces the formative potential of music education, i.e. the potential for the cognitive-affective development of students, and the school discipline thus maximizes its functions. These formative functions of the model have been specified here in *Project results* (1). <sup>16</sup>

On the didactic level, musical pedagogical aims are pursued through three practices for knowledge transposition: the didactics of listening, the didactics of production (performance, composition, improvisation), and the didactics of the history of music. The concept of transposition represents the site of mediation between musicology and music pedagogy: it implies the adaptive transformation of specialized knowledge in the relationship between the teacher, the student and knowledge itself. This concept implies a distinction between the scientific and didactic forms of knowledge. <sup>17</sup> In fact, in these didactic forms there is a difference between scientific knowledge (*savoir savant*), knowledge to be taught (*savoir à enseigner*) and taught knowledge (*savoir enseigné*). <sup>18</sup> Additionally, we understand practices of didactic transposition not in the empirical applicationist sense, but as

<sup>13</sup> Carl DAHLHAUS: *Che significa e a qual fine si studia la storia della musica*, p. 230 (translated from the Italian translation).

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>15</sup> Giuseppina LA FACE BIANCONI: *Il cammino dell'Educazione musicale: vicoli chiusi e strade maestre*, p. 14.

<sup>16</sup> See also Giuseppina LA FACE BIANCONI: *Il cammino dell'Educazione musicale: vicoli chiusi e strade maestre*; Giorgio PAGANNONE: *Funzioni formative e didattiche della musica*, in: Antonella NUZZACI and Giorgio PAGANNONE (eds.): *Musica, Ricerca, Didattica. Profili culturali e competenza musicale*, Lecce: Pensa, 2008, pp. 113-156; Carla CUOMO: *Dall'ascolto all'esecuzione. Orientamenti per la Pedagogia e la Didattica della musica*, pp. 65-68.

<sup>17</sup> Berta MARTINI: *Didattiche disciplinari. Aspetti teorici e metodologici*, p. 38.

<sup>18</sup> Yves CHEVALLARD: *La transposition didactique du savoir savant au savoir enseigné*, Grenoble: La Pensée Sauvage, 1985.

theoretical areas of a thought accompanying the development of precise strategies and methodologies of music learning-teaching.<sup>19</sup> In terms of method, the three practices are positioned in a relationship of continuity, that is, of circularity or uninterrupted connection from one to the other.<sup>20</sup>

At the same time, the three practices are distinguished by certain specificities. The first, the didactics of listening, is the foundation of the music didactics described here in that it leads to strategies of attention and memorization and educates students to objective, that is to say critical and reflective, listening, which is considered the basis for educating cognitive processes.<sup>21</sup> This practice is closely linked to the third practice, the didactics of music history, which is to be understood as educating students in researching sources through the problematization and contextualization of historical data, so as to include music in the larger history of culture.<sup>22</sup>

The second, the didactics of production, is focused on technical procedural aspects; when linked to the other two, however, it represents an excellent field of work on metacognitive processes, to educate thinking to think about itself: *music making*, that is, playing, composing or improvising, becomes a form of *learning*, then a *knowledge* and, thus, *thinking* in an autonomous way so that students become capable of directing their own learning.<sup>23</sup> The three practices, related to each other through close interconnection on the methodological level, come together to form 'musical expertise'. This is the result of the integration between 'thinking music' in an appropriate and correct way on a theoretical and analytical-musical level, as well as on a philological and critical historical level, and 'thinking in music', an activity which implies the mastery of musical knowledge and therefore the development of mental habits on a linguistic-communicative and technical-proce-

<sup>19</sup> Berta MARTINI: La trasposizione didattica: concetto-chiave della didattica della musica, first part of Berta Martini, Carla Cuomo, Maria Rosa De Luca, Trasposizione didattica del sapere musicale: aspetti di contenuto e di metodo, in: Giuseppina LA FACE BIANCONI and Anna SCALFARO (eds.): *La musica tra conoscere e fare*, Milano: FrancoAngeli, 2011, pp. 123-129.

<sup>20</sup> Carla CUOMO: Didattica dell'ascolto e didattica della produzione musicale: ipotesi di continuità, in: Franz COMPLOI (ed.): *Musikerziehung. Erfahrungen und Reflexionen*, Brixen: Weger, 2005, pp. 61-74.

<sup>21</sup> Giuseppina LA FACE: Le pedate di Pierrot. Comprensione musicale e didattica dell'ascolto, in: F. COMPLOI (ed.): *Musikalische Bildung. Educazione musicale*. Brixen: Weger, 2005, 40-60; La didattica dell'ascolto, *Musica e Storia*, 3 (2006), pp. 511-541.

<sup>22</sup> Maria Rosa DE LUCA: Un approccio didattico alla costruzione del sapere storico-musicale, third part of Berta Martini, Carla Cuomo, Maria Rosa De Luca, Trasposizione didattica del sapere musicale: aspetti di contenuto e di metodo, in: Giuseppina LA FACE BIANCONI and Anna SCALFARO (eds.): *La musica tra conoscere e fare*, Milano: FrancoAngeli, 2011, pp. 123-156, 142-153; »Understanding by investigating«: how to educate students in historical-musical research, in: Carla CUOMO and Maria Rosa DE LUCA: The transposition of musical knowledge in intellectual education, *Musica Docta. Rivista digitale di Pedagogia e Didattica della Musica*, 4, Special issue (2014), pp. 173-39: 30-39.

<sup>23</sup> Carla CUOMO, L'esecuzione come esercizio critico, *Pedagogia più Didattica*, 3 (2008), pp. 129-134; *Dall'ascolto all'esecuzione. Orientamenti per la Pedagogia e la Didattica della musica*.

dural level.<sup>24</sup> It is teachers first and foremost who should have this competence, in that they should combine 'knowing' and 'making' music in their own training (and therefore in their thinking) to foster similar integration in their students.

The two spheres of music, epistemic and poietic, are actually two ways of describing the interplay of the components involved in making and understanding music. The two spheres cannot be separated in and of themselves: knowing is also making, and making, if it is reflective as Dewey suggests, is always knowing and understanding. Therefore, the three practices are linked in a relationship of close continuity in the model. Together, they comprise a methodology of teaching and learning music that is mostly workshop-based, under the banner of cognitive apprenticeship.<sup>25</sup>

The model of music education developed by the Italian research project carried out by DAR (Department of Arts at Bologna University) and »Il Saggiatore musicale« shows that, in little more than fifteen years, the gap between musicology, music pedagogy and educational sciences in Italy has been partially eliminated. Nonetheless, this project is ongoing and some areas need to be further developed, such as the music history didactics and composition and improvisation didactics designed for schools. Much work still needs to be done, both scientifically and politically. Here are some of the results achieved on both of these levels.

Carla Cuomo

### *Project results*

To foster a close relationship between musicology, music pedagogy and educational sciences, for years our research has focused on the following three areas.

#### **(1) *Political-institutional relationships***

In Italy, our discipline finds itself in a problematic situation. The parliament, government, and public administrations have mainly cultivated an idea of musical education unilaterally focused on »practical learning«. We seek to help everyone, in particular policymakers, researchers and teachers, understand that music education cannot ignore the cultural and historical spheres, otherwise music risks ending up isolated from the context of other school disciplines. An important step in the right direction occurred with the development of the *Indicazioni Nazionali per il Curricolo della scuola dell'infanzia e del primo ciclo d'istruzione* (National guidelines for the curriculum of kindergarten, elementary and middle school education) 2007, revised in

<sup>24</sup> Carla CUOMO, Listening to and performing music with competence, first part of Carla Cuomo and Maria Rosa De Luca, The transposition of musical knowledge in intellectual education, *Musica Docta. Rivista digitale di Pedagogia e Didattica della Musica*, 4, Special issue (2014), pp. 17-39: 17-29; *Dall'ascolto all'esecuzione. Orientamenti per la Pedagogia e la Didattica della musica*, pp. 89-93.

<sup>25</sup> Carla CUOMO: *Dall'ascolto all'esecuzione. Orientamenti per la Pedagogia e la Didattica della musica*, pp. 74-80.

2012. Italian musicologists were directly involved in drafting the *National guidelines*, striking a balance between an exclusive focus on practical »doing« and a cultural approach. It was musicologists who wrote the statement, included in the *guidelines*, that »music learning consists of practices and sets of knowledge«: additionally, they listed the six »formative functions« that are manifested during the process of music learning: cognitive-cultural, linguistic-communicative, emotional-affective, identity-oriented and intercultural, relational and critical-aesthetic.<sup>26</sup>

### (2) *University/Schools relationships*

It is not sufficient to intervene at the legislative, governmental and administrative levels alone if school teachers are not motivated in a cultural direction. In view of this point, we are promoting direct relations between universities and schools through research-training courses: our intention is to set up a channel of transmission that puts school teachers in direct contact with both musicological and pedagogical-musical content developed in an academic environment; teachers are then called upon to transform the scientific content we provide into didactic knowledge. To facilitate this operation, the »Il Saggiatore musicale« association in Bologna established a special group called »SagGEM« (Group for Music Education). This group brings together teachers from schools, conservatories and universities as well as scholars of educational sciences and school managers. SagGEM focuses on four points: (1) enhancing Western art music, without prejudice to other genres and traditions; (2) achieving the necessary synergy between universities, conservatories and schools; (3) linking music education to other school disciplines; and (4) consulting ethnomusicology for the intercultural perspective.

### (3) *Impact on the academic society*

Here we will describe only four of the concrete outcomes of our scientific efforts.

(a) Conferences: We have dedicated several conferences to essential themes in pedagogical-didactic thinking. The founding conference on *Music Education and Training* in 2005 led musicologists to dialogue with scholars of educational sciences so that they could grasp the specific problems involved in musical knowledge; at the same time, it also led musicologists and educational science scholars to interact with school teachers. The most recent international conference *Music as Cultural Education: Building new Bridges between Pre-College Schools and Universities* was held in Bologna in 2018 and focused on the relationship between universities and schools.

(b) Musica Docta: We founded a special peer reviewed, online journal called *Musica Docta* that aims to strengthen the relationship between musicological university research while enhancing the conceptual input of educational sciences and

<sup>26</sup> Giuseppina LA FACE BIANCONI: Il cammino dell'Educazione musicale: vicoli chiusi e strade maestre; Giorgio PAGANNONE: Funzioni formative e didattiche della musica.

reinforcing the teaching of school teachers. *Musica Docta* welcomes articles, reviews and presentations by Italian and foreign scholars. It presents theoretical and empirical research and also offers »didactic pathways« that provide models school teachers can immediately use by illustrating the passage from scientific knowledge to didactic knowledge in particular. *Musica Docta* publishes in five languages: French, English, Italian, Spanish and German.

(c) Study Group IMS: At the 19th conference of the International Musicological Society (Rome 2012), the Transmission of Knowledge as a Primary Aim in Music Education Study Group was created. This study group seeks to foster the responsibility of musicologists for the didactic transposition of knowledge in universities and schools. After Rome 2012, Bologna 2014, and New York 2015, in June 2018 the group met again in Bologna. This last meeting focused on the relationship between university research and the work of teachers in schools (the reports are available in *Musica Docta*, IX, 2019). North American, Chinese, Japanese and European colleagues attended the meeting.

(d) The network: One of the most important projects in recent years has consisted in creating a network of ten universities – Bologna, Catania, Chieti-Pescara, Ferrara, Palermo, Pavia-Cremona, Roma Tre, Sassari, Teramo, and Torino – in collaboration with »Il Saggiatore musicale«. This network focuses on the study of music pedagogy and music didactics for high-quality music education, that is, music education based on the »rich« transmission of musical knowledge. The political implications of this operation are significant. It should be noted that many Italian universities understand the problems involved in transmitting musical knowledge and, united and in agreement, they will contribute to training young citizens thanks to a virtuous relationship with schools.

There is still a great deal we could add, but we are confident that these few highlights give an idea of the extraordinary work that Italian university musicology has been carrying out for many years.

Giuseppina La Face

### *Conclusion*

At the international level, the impact of the scientific and political work conducted in Italy to date is measured by the reverberations the very idea of musicology, its perception and way of telling its story is gaining in the international musicological community. The problem of knowledge transmission is finally coming to be recognized as significant, although not yet central. We hope that it will eventually gain this centrality. We also hope that our colleague pedagogists will collaborate with musicologists to develop an idea of musical education that is not only performance-centred, that is, centred on the technical-practical aspects that shift the social meaning of music to entertainment. Rather, what we should be working



to foster is a social idea of music as culture and an educational idea of music as a privileged tool for intellectual training.

Carla Cuomo and Giuseppina La Face  
(English translation by Angelina Zontine)

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY:

- BALDACCI, Massimo: *Trattato di pedagogia generale*, Roma: Carocci, 2012.
- BERTIN, Giovanni Maria: *Educazione alla ragione*, Roma: Armando, 1968.
- BRUNER, Jerome: *On Knowing. Essays for the Left Hand*, Cambridge (Mass.): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1964.
- BRUNER, Jerome: *The Culture of Education*, Cambridge (Mass.): Harvard University Press, 1996.
- BRUNER, Jerome: *Toward a Theory of Instruction*, Cambridge (Mass.): Harvard University Press, 1966.
- CHEVALLARD, Yves: *La transposition didactique du savoir savant au savoir enseigné*, Grenoble: La Pensée Sauvage, 1985.
- CUOMO, Carla: *Dall'ascolto all'esecuzione. Orientamenti per la Pedagogia e la Didattica della musica*, Milano: FrancoAngeli, 2018.
- CUOMO, Carla: Didattica dell'ascolto e didattica della produzione musicale: ipotesi di continuità, in: Franz Comploi (ed.): *Musikerziehung. Erfahrungen und Reflexionen*, Brixen: Weger, 2005, pp. 61-74; <<http://wwcat.saggiatoremusicale.it/saggem/ricerca/bibliografia/cuomo%20didattica%20dell%20ascolto.pdf>>.
- CUOMO, Carla: L'esecuzione come esercizio critico, *Pedagogia più Didattica*, 3, 2008, pp. 129-134.
- CUOMO, Carla: Listening to and performing music with competence, first part of Carla Cuomo and Maria Rosa De Luca, The transposition of musical knowledge in intellectual education, *Musica Docta. Rivista digitale di Pedagogia e Didattica della Musica*, 4, Special issue (2014), pp. 17-39: 17-29.
- DAHLHAUS, Carl: Che significa e a qual fine si studia la storia della musica, *Il Saggiatore musicale*, XII (2005), pp. 219-230.
- DAHLHAUS, Carl: *Grundlagen der Musikgeschichte*, Köln: Volk, 1977.
- DE LUCA, Maria Rosa: »Understanding by investigating«: how to educate students in historical-musical research, in: Carla Cuomo and Maria Rosa De Luca: The transposition of musical knowledge in intellectual education, *Musica Docta. Rivista digitale di Pedagogia e Didattica della Musica*, 4, Special issue (2014), pp. 17-39: 30-39.
- DE LUCA, Maria Rosa: Un approccio didattico alla costruzione del sapere storicomusicale, first part of Trasposizione didattica del sapere musicale: aspetti di contenuto e di metodo, in: Giuseppina La Face Bianconi e Anna Scalfaro (eds.): *La musica tra conoscere e fare*, FrancoAngeli, Milano, 2011, pp. 123-156, 142-153.
- DELLA CASA, Maurizio: *Educazione musicale e curricolo*, Bologna: Zanichelli, 1985 (repr. 2002).
- DEWEY, John: *Democracy and Education: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Education*, New York: Macmillan, 1916.

- DEWEY, John: *Experience and Education*, New York: Kappa Delta, 1938.
- DEWEY, John: *How We Think*, Boston, New York, Chicago: Heath & Co, 1910.
- DEWEY, John: *Logic, The Theory of Inquiry*, New York: Holt, 1938.
- EDLER, Arnfried – HELMS, Siegmund – HOPF, Helmuth (eds.) *Musikpädagogik und Musikwissenschaft*, Wilhelmshaven: Noetzel, 1987.
- EGGEBRECHT, Hans Heinrich: «Ars musica». Storia di un concetto medievale, in: Fabio Alberto Gallo (ed.): *Musica e Storia tra Medioevo e età moderna*, Bologna: Il Mulino, 1986, pp. 109-116 (original edition: «Ars musica». Musikanschauung des Mittelalters und ihre Nachwirkungen, *Die Sammlung*, XII, 1957, pp. 306-313, 315, 317, 320).
- FRABBONI, Franco – PINTO MINERVA, Franca: *Manuale di pedagogia generale*, Roma-Bari: Laterza, 2001.
- FRABBONI, Franco: I fondamenti teoretici del problematicismo, in: M. Gattullo et al. (ed.): *Educazione e ragione. Scritti in onore di Giovanni Maria Bertin*, 2 vol., Firenze: La Nuova Italia, 1985, pp. 63-68.
- LA FACE BIANCONI, Giuseppina – CUOMO, Carla – PASQUINI, Elisabetta, (eds.): *Musicologia e Pedagogia musicale. Resoconti delle ricerche in corso (2014)*, Bologna: Bononia University Press, 2018.
- LA FACE BIANCONI, Giuseppina: Il cammino dell'Educazione musicale: vicoli chiusi e strade maestre, in: Giuseppina La Face Bianconi and Franco Frabboni (eds.): *Educazione musicale e Formazione*, Milano: FrancoAngeli, 2008, pp. 13-25.
- LA FACE, Giuseppina: Italian Musicologists and the Challenge of Music Pedagogy, *Musica Docta. Rivista digitale di Pedagogia e Didattica della musica*, 6, 2016, pp. 1-18; <https://musicadoc.ta.unibo.it/article/view/6561/6358>
- LA FACE, Giuseppina: Keynote Address: Musicology and Music Pedagogy: An Unnatural Divorce (Bologna, May 29-30, 2014), *Journal of Music History Pedagogy*, 5 (2014) 1, pp. 157-163.
- LA FACE, Giuseppina: La didattica dell'ascolto, *Musica e Storia*, 3 (2006), pp. 511-541; <<https://www.rivisteweb.it/issn/1127-0063/issue/179>>.
- LA FACE, Giuseppina: Le pedate di Pierrot. Comprensione musicale e didattica dell'ascolto, in: Franz Comploi (ed.): *Musikalische Bildung. Educazione musicale*, Brixen: Weger, 2005, pp. 40-60; <<http://wwcat.saggiatoremusicale.it/saggem/ricerca/bibliografia/pedate.pdf>>.
- MARTINI, Berta: *Didattiche disciplinari. Aspetti teorici e metodologici*, Bologna: Pitagora, 2000.
- MARTINI, Berta: *Formare ai saperi. Per una pedagogia della conoscenza*, Milano: FrancoAngeli, 2005.
- MARTINI, Berta: La trasposizione didattica: concetto-chiave della didattica della musica, first part of Berta Martini, Carla Cuomo, Maria Rosa De Luca, Trasposizione didattica del sapere musicale: aspetti di contenuto e di metodo, in: G. La Face Bianconi e A. Scalfaro (eds.): *La musica tra conoscere e fare*, Milano: FrancoAngeli, 2011, pp. 123-129.
- PAGANNONE, Giorgio: Funzioni formative e didattiche della musica, in: Antonella Nuzzaci e Giorgio Pagannone (eds.): *Musica, Ricerca, Didattica. Profili culturali e competenza musicale*, Lecce: Pensa, 2008, pp. 113-156.
- VYGOTSKIJ, Lev Semënovič: *Istoriya razvitija vssih psihicheskikh funktsij*, Moskva: Akademiya ppedagogicheskikh nauk, 1960 (en. tr. The History of the Development of Higher Men-

tal functions, transl. by Maria J. Hall; prologue by Joseph Glick, ed. of the English translation Robert W. Reiber, New York, London: Plenum, 1997).

VYGOTSKIJ, Lev Semënovič: *Myšlenie i reč'*, Moskva-Leningrad: Gosudarstvennoe Social'no Ekonomičeskoe Izdatel'stvo, 1934 (tr. en. *Thought and Language*, edited and translated by Eugenia Hanfamn and Gertrude Vakar, New York and London: John Wiley and Sons; Boston: The M.I.T. Press, 1962).

#### Electronic sources:

*Indicazioni Nazionali per il Curricolo della scuola dell'infanzia e del primo ciclo d'istruzione*, <<http://www.indicazioninazionali.it/2018/08/26/indicazioni-2012/>> (access: 16 April 2020)

Il Saggiatore musicale – SagGEM. BIBLIOTECA ELETTRONICA, *Testi di Pedagogia musicale*, <<https://www.saggiatoremusicale.it/home/biblioteca-elettronica/testi-di-pedagogia-musicale/>> (access: 16 April 2020)

Recommendation of the European Parliament and Council, 2006, <<https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/IT/TXT/?uri=celex%3A32006H0962>> (access: 16 April 2020)

### *Sažetak*

#### GLAZBENA PEDAGOGIJA U ODNOSU NA MUZIKOLOGIJU I OBRAZOVNE ZNANOSTI: TRI PODRUČJA INTERVENCIJE

U zapadnom svijetu već dugo postoji neprirodna podjela između pedagoško-didaktičkog polja i muzikologije, a suvremena situacija nije to znatno promijenila. Muzikologija i pedagoško-didaktički studiji odabrali su i slijede paralelne putove koji se ne preklapaju.

Konceptualno je polazište svijest o dvama problemima: s jedne strane muzikologija riskira da postane samoreferencijalna ako se ne otvori vitalnoj vezi s političkim aspektima obrazovanja; s druge strane obrazovne znanosti razvijaju modele glazbenog obrazovanja čiji se sadržaj ne ažurira na temelju muzikološkog znanja. Ova razjedinjenost uzrokuje da izvođenje glazbe prevladava nad poznavanjem glazbe, umjesto da su ove dvije dimenzije združene.

Članak opisuje rezultate talijanskog istraživačkog projekta koji provodi talijanska Sveučilišna mreža za glazbeno obrazovanje (Rete universitaria per l'Educazione musicale).