

Alma Mater Studiorum Università di Bologna Archivio istituzionale della ricerca

Large-scale stable isotope characterization of a Late Cretaceous dinosaur-dominated ecosystem

This is the final peer-reviewed author's accepted manuscript (postprint) of the following publication:

Evans, D., Ryan, M., Goodwin, M., Fanti, F., Huang, L., Wortmann, U., et al. (2020). Large-scale stable isotope characterization of a Late Cretaceous dinosaur-dominated ecosystem. GEOLOGY, 48(6), 546-551 [10.1130/G47399.1]. *Published Version:*

Availability: [This version is available at: https://hdl.handle.net/11585/759709 since: 2020-05-21](https://hdl.handle.net/11585/759709)

Published:

[DOI: http://doi.org/10.1130/G47399.1](http://doi.org/10.1130/G47399.1)

Terms of use:

Some rights reserved. The terms and conditions for the reuse of this version of the manuscript are specified in the publishing policy. For all terms of use and more information see the publisher's website.

> This item was downloaded from IRIS Università di Bologna (https://cris.unibo.it/). When citing, please refer to the published version.

> > (Article begins on next page)

- Large-scale stable isotope characterization of a Late Cretaceous
- dinosaur-dominated ecosystem
-
- 4 Thomas M. Cullen^{1,2,*}, F.J. Longstaffe³, U.G Wortmann⁴, L. Huang³, F. Fanti⁵, M.B.
- 5 Goodwin⁶, M.J. Ryan⁷, and David C. Evans^{2,8}
- *¹ Integrative Research Center, Field Museum of Natural History, 1400 S Lake Shore Dr.,*
- *Chicago, IL, 60605, USA.*
- *² Department of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology, University of Toronto, 25 Willcocks Street,*
- *Toronto, Ontario M5S 3B2, Canada*
- *³ Department of Earth Sciences, The University of Western Ontario, 1151 Richmond Street,*
- *London, ON, N6A 5B7, Canada*
- *⁴ Department of Earth Sciences, University of Toronto, 22 Russell Street, Toronto, ON, M5S 3B1,*
- *Canada*
- *⁵ Dipartimento di Scienze Biologiche, Geologiche e Ambientali, Alma Mater Studiorum,*
- *Università di Bologna, Via Zamboni 67, 40126 Bologna, Italy*
- *⁶ University of California Museum of Paleontology, 1101 Valley Life Sciences, Berkeley, CA*
- *94720-4780, USA*
- *⁷ Department of Earth Sciences, Carleton University, 1125 Colonel By Drive, Ottawa, Ontario*
- *K1S 5B6, Canada*
- *⁸ Royal Ontario Museum, 100 Queen's Park, Toronto, ON, M5S 2C6, Canada*
- ** Corresponding Author: tcullen@fieldmuseum.org*
-

ABSTRACT

 In the Cretaceous of North America, environmental sensitivity and habitat specialization have been hypothesized to explain the surprisingly restricted geographic ranges of many large-bodied dinosaurs. Understanding the drivers behind this are key to predicting broader trends of dinosaur species and community response to climate change under greenhouse conditions. However, previous studies of this question have frequently examined only small sub-components of the paleoecosystem or operated without comparison to similar modern systems from which to 30 constrain interpretations. Here we perform a high-resolution multi-taxic $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{18}O$ study of a Cretaceous coastal floodplain ecosystem, focusing on species interactions and paleotemperature 32 estimation, and compare with similar data from extant systems. Bioapatite δ^{13} C preserves predator-prey offsets between tyrannosaurs and ornithischians, and between aquatic reptiles and fish. Large ornithischians had broadly overlapping stable isotope ranges, contrary to hypothesized niche partitioning driven by specialization on coastal or inland subhabitat use. Comparisons to a modern analogue coastal floodplain show similar patterns of ecological guild structure and aquatic-terrestrial resource interchange. Multi-taxic oxygen isotope temperature estimations yield results for the Campanian of Alberta consistent with the few other paleotemperature proxies available, and are validated when applied for extant species from a modern coastal floodplain, suggesting this approach is a simple and effective avenue for paleoenvironmental reconstruction. Together, these new data suggest dinosaur niche-partitioning was more complex than previously hypothesized, and provide a framework for future research on dinosaur-dominated Mesozoic floodplain communities.

INTRODUCTION

 The Cretaceous is a key interval of Earth history for understanding paleocommunity structure and ecological dynamics in greenhouse systems, as it contains a rich and well-studied fossil record from multiple continents, with those from the Campanian of Alberta, Canada, being among the richest and most intensively collected (Brown et al., 2013). To thoroughly characterize paleoecological dynamics at this time, however, we must build upon the inferences obtained from broad-scale biodiversity meta-analyses (e.g. Butler et al., 2011; Sakamoto et al., 2016) and examine species and communities at more ecologically sensitive spatial/temporal scales (Price et al., 2018). Of particular interest is the testing of hypothesized subhabitat partitioning, which has long been suggested to explain restricted distributions in coeval Cretaceous dinosaurs (Fricke and Pearson, 2008; Horner et al., 1992; Lehman, 2001; Sampson et al., 2010). These patterns are surprising given that large terrestrial tetrapods today commonly have broad ranges and are relatively tolerant of changing environmental conditions (Lehman, 1987). The veracity of such patterns for dinosaur habitat zonation, however, remain debated (e.g. Lucas et al., 2016), and are only variably recovered in studies of Cretaceous regional vertebrate community dynamics (Brinkman et al., 1998; Cullen and Evans, 2016). Stable isotope analyses provide a useful tool for testing these hypotheses, while simultaneously allowing assessment of paleotemperature conditions in the terrestrial deposits of the Campanian of Alberta/Montana, which remains relatively uncharacterized despite its densely-sampled and well-studied fossil record (Barrick et al., 1999; Upchurch and Wolfe, 1987). Detailed assessments of paleoecological and paleoenvironmental dynamics across both spatial and temporal gradients are a key piece of data for patterns of biodiversity in greenhouse systems.

APPROACH

 We perform the broadest multi-taxic stable isotope analysis to date of a vertebrate community in the Mesozoic. We sample a phylogenetically, physiologically, and ecologically broad range of vertebrate taxa from the Late Cretaceous of Alberta, so as to capture the isotopic range in this ecosystem at a well-constrained spatial and temporal scale. Our analyses are used: (1) to reconstruct paleocommunity structure from this ancient coastal floodplain and compare it with stable isotope data from modern analogues, (2) to test the hypothesis of subhabitat specialization amongst co-occurring large ornithischians, and (3) to estimate temperature(s) for the sampled assemblage, with comparisons to the available data from regional samples obtained via other proxies, and confirmatory tests of oxygen isotope-derived temperatures from modern analogues .

LOCALITY & GEOLOGICAL SETTING

 We sampled a vertebrate microfossil bonebed, the 'Rainy Day Site', from the upper Oldman Formation of Alberta (known as Judith River Fm. in Montana) (Figure 1) (Arbour and Evans, 2017; Cullen and Evans, 2016). Sedimentology in this locality is consistent with an active channel belt with high aggradation and sediment support, grading into mud-dominated intervals reflective of the wetter, more organic-rich settings of the uppermost Oldman Formation (Figure 1D). These deposits are constrained spatially, minimally time-averaged, represent local deposition of wetland or similar materials in fluvial deposits in the broader coastal floodplain environment, and, as the fossils were preserved together, were likely exposed to the same suite of diagenetic/taphonomic effects (Rogers and Brady, 2010). This differs from many other isotopic studies on Mesozoic dinosaur communities, which derive samples from multiple sites and lithologies; that lack of control on diagenetic and other variation within a sample increases the

 potential of significant analytical errors. Cretaceous data were compared to modern analogue coastal floodplain stable isotope analyses of the Atchafalaya River Basin fauna of Louisiana from Cullen et al. (2019). The Atchafalaya River Basin represents a useful analogue to the upper Oldman Fm., as both are low-lying, seasonally flooded landscapes with warm temperate to subtropical climates, contain relatively similar flora, and have numerous taxa that are physiologically, ecologically, and phylogenetically similar (e.g. metatherian mammals, crocodilians, lepisosteid fish, etc).

MATERIAL & METHODS

100 Stable isotope analyses performed on 83 samples $(N_{\text{taxa}}=17)$, measured via laser-ablation gas- chromatography isotope-ratio-mass-spectrometry at the University of Western Ontario, reported 102 using standard isotopic practice (δ^{13} C and δ^{18} O), following the methods of Cullen et al (2019, and references therein). Stable isotope compositions for each specimen and associated data were recorded (Table DR1 & 2), with tests assessing sampling biases, XRD examining mineral alteration, and relative grouping of isotopic compositions of sampled taxa (sensu Fricke et al., 2008 and references therein) finding no bias and a lack of pervasive alteration (Figure DR1). The 107 carbon isotope composition of diet $(\delta^{13}C_{\text{dict}})$ was calculated using trophic enrichment factors (or 108 TEF; $\Delta = \delta_{bioapative}$ - δ_{dieet}) obtained for extant relatives and/or physiological analogues of sampled taxa (Table DR3). Given a lack of specific ecologically-relevant extant relatives, dinosaur $110 \frac{\delta^{13}C_{\text{dict}}}$ was reconstructed under three TEF scenarios, as birds, as reptiles, and as mammals, to reveal potential effects of dietary-physiology differences. Stable isotope compositions and TEF-112 applied δ^{13} C_{diet} compositions for Cretaceous and modern taxa are included as species-level means in Table DR4.

Temperature calculations derived from oxygen isotope compositions $(\delta^{18}O)$ were performed using taxon-bioapatite-isotope geothermometers, and particularly the ectotherm- endotherm combined mean (EECM) equation of Cullen et al. (2019) (modified from dual taxon approach of Fricke and Wing, 2004, including species-specific methods of others from references therein)). This modified method calculates the combined mean of bioapatite $\delta^{18}O_{\text{phosphate}}$ (in this case, modified by 1‰ from laser-produced total $\delta^{18}O$, or $\delta^{18}O_{\text{LPTO}}$, sensu Larson and Longstaffe, 2007) from each sampled ectotherm taxon, as well as the combined 121 mean of $\delta^{18}O_{\text{water}}$ determined for each sampled endotherm taxon, and uses them in the equation: 122 T=111.4 – (4.3)(combined mean bioapatite $\delta^{18}O_{\text{ecto phosphate}}$ – combined mean $\delta^{18}O_{\text{endo water}}$)

PALEOCOMMUNITY STRUCTURE

125 Stable carbon compositions for Cretaceous taxa show offsets in δ^{13} C of ~1-3‰ present between megacarnivorous tyrannosaurids and their large-bodied ornithischian prey, as well as between aquatic reptiles and fish (Figure 2), consistent with expectations from predator-prey pairs known 128 for extant systems (Bocherens, 2000). There is considerable overlap in both $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{18}O$ among sampled bulk-feeding herbivores (hadrosaurids, ceratopsians, ankylosaurs) (Figures 2 and 3, Figure DR1C). While the full extent of plant isotopic heterogeneity in the Late Cretaceous of this region of North America is not known, there is sufficient evidence to suggest that coastal vs. inland signals should be detectable (Fricke and Pearson, 2008). This overlap thus challenges the hypothesis that, at least in this model Campanian ecosystem, these taxa significantly partitioned isotopic niches (a proxy for ecological niche, see Newsome et al., 2007) via subhabitat specialization. Our results suggest instead that habitat use and dietary differences (if present) are 136 either not detectable using bioapatite δ^{13} C and δ^{18} O, or that they partitioned niches via other

 of relative structure and composition, and that, despite some differences, the Atchafalaya provides a robust community and paleoenviromental analogue for the Campanian of Alberta, and more generally, coastal plain ecosystems from the latest Cretaceous of North America.

 Overall, where overlap exists our results are in line with stable isotope compositions recorded from other Late Cretaceous vertebrates (Amiot et al., 2015; Fricke and Pearson, 2008), though our combination of broader taxon sampling and extant comparisons facilitate a greater degree of ecological resolution for reconstruction and hypothesis testing. However, we recover distinct results from those of Ostrom et al (1993), the only other broad multi-taxic stable isotope study to attempt to reconstruct these ecosystems. Their analyses of high-molecular-weight 169 organic $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{15}N$ extracted from a mix of fossil bones and teeth sampled from multiple sites throughout the Dinosaur Park Formation (formerly Judith River Formation) of Alberta 171 produced somewhat equivocal results, with many compositions at odds with expectations (e.g. 172 putatively herbivorous ornithomimids with higher $\delta^{15}N$ than faunivorous tyrannosaurs, 173 faunivorous lizards with lower $\delta^{15}N$ than herbivorous dinosaurs, etc). $\delta^{13}C$ compositions for their 174 samples were ~ -27 to -23% , rather than the ~ -10 to -3% compositions recorded here and in other stable isotope studies of Cretaceous dinosaurs (Amiot et al., 2015; Fricke et al., 2008). The differing sources of the material and distinct analytical methods may account for this disparity, and it is also possible that their results may be reflective of a sediment bulk organic carbon 178 signal, as the latter has a nearly identical δ^{13} C range in the Late Cretaceous of western North America (Fricke et al., 2008).

PALEOTEMPERATURE RECONSTRUCTION

 Individual taxon oxygen isotope temperature estimates produce variable results, though the mean paleotemperature estimate for the Late Campanian of Alberta derived from the multi-taxic EECM method is 18°C (Figure 4, Table DR5). This is consistent with independent mean annual paleotemperature proxies from the broader region, including leaf physiognomy (Upchurch and Wolfe, 1987), clumped isotope analysis of paleosol carbonate nodules (Burgener et al., 2019), and paired taxon oxygen isotope temperature estimates (Barrick et al., 1999), and produces distinct results from the single taxon temperature estimate approaches (Figure 4, Amiot et al., 2004, and references therein; Kohn, 1996)). Applying EECM to extant taxa from the modern 190 system produced a temperature estimate within \sim 2 °C of mean annual temperature, providing an important independent check that the method produces useful results and may moderate some of the variation introduced by individual taxon physiologies when using the single-taxon or 'single ectotherm, single endotherm' variations of the approach (Figure 4). Our modified EECM method is therefore a robust and simple tool for estimating paleotemperature in conjunction with multi-taxic paleoecological stable isotope datasets.

CONCLUSIONS

 Stable isotope analyses of a spatially and temporally constrained Mesozoic vertebrate ecosystem 199 reveals evidence of predator-prey offsets in δ^{13} C compositions and ecological guild distributions that meet predictions derived from extant analogue ecosystems. The overlapping isotopic ranges of bioapatite from large ornithischians argues against a long-held hypothesis that these groups were strongly partitioning their niches based on subhabitat sensitivities. The bioapatite oxygen- isotope EECM approach for paleotemperature estimation represents a and simple and robust technique for paleoclimate reconstruction. Our combined fossil + modern combined approach

 provides a framework for future paleocommunity analyses in these abundantly preserved coastal plain systems.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank the staff of the Royal Tyrrell Museum (A. Neuman, D. Brinkman, B, Strillisky, B.

Sanchez), staff of the Royal Ontario Museum (V. Di Cecco, K. Dunnell, Cathy Dutton, Jacquie

Miller), Louisiana State University Museum of Natural Sciences (J. Esselstyn, J. Nations, D.

Dittmann), Museum of Vertebrate Zoology at the University of California Berkeley (C. Spencer,

C. Conroy, C. Cicero), Louisiana Dept of Wildlife & Fisheries, Landry family, C. Capobianco,

L. Yeider, and E. Benner for sampling and analysis permissions and assistance. We thank and

credit D. Dufault, R. Fuchs, T. Heath, L. Hughes, M. Menchetti, M. Michaud, D. Raver, S.

Shelley, V. Simeonovski, S. Smith, M. Spitzer, S. Traver, N. Vitek, E. Willoughsby, C. Yasuda,

Wikimedia user 'smokeybib', and PhyloPic for silhouette images. We also thank Jordan Mallon

and two anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments which strengthened the paper. This

study was supported by Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council (NSERC) of

Canada Discovery Grants to DCE. (RGPIN 355845), UGW., and FJL, a NSERC CGS, OGS, and

a QEII-GSST to TMC, the Canada Research Chairs Program (FJL), the Canada Foundation for

Innovation (FJL), the Ontario Research Fund (F.J.L.), and the Dinosaur Research Institute

(TMC). This is LSIS Contribution #374.

REFERENCES CITED

 Amiot, R., Lécuyer, C., Buffetaut, E., Fluteau, F., Legendre, S., and Martineau, F., 2004, Latitudinal temperature gradient during the Cretaceous Upper Campanian-Middle

- Maastrichtian: δ18O record of continental vertebrates: Earth and Planetary Science Letters, v. 226, p. 255-272.
- Amiot, R., Wang, X., Zhou, Z., Wang, X., Lécuyer, C., Buffetaut, E., Fluteau, F., Ding, Z.,
- Kusuhashi, N., and Mo, J., 2015, Environment and ecology of East Asian dinosaurs
- during the Early Cretaceous inferred from stable oxygen and carbon isotopes in apatite:
- Journal of Asian Earth Sciences, v. 98, p. 358-370.
- Arbour, V. M., and Evans, D. C., 2017, A new ankylosaurine dinosaur from the Judith River Formation of Montana, USA, based on an exceptional skeleton with soft tissue
- preservation: Royal Society open science, v. 4, no. 5, p. 161086.
- Barrick, R. E., Fischer, A. G., and Showers, W. J., 1999, Oxygen isotopes from turtle bone: applications for terrestrial paleoclimates?: Palaios, p. 186-191.
- Bocherens, H., 2000, Preservation of isotopic signals (13C, 15N) in Pleistocene mammals, *in*
- Ambrose, S. H., and Katzenberg, M. A., eds., Biogeochemical approaches to paleodietary analysis, Volume 5: New York, Kluwer Academic Publishers, p. 65-88.
- Brinkman, D. B., Ryan, M. J., and Eberth, D. A., 1998, The paleogeographic and stratigraphic
- distribution of ceratopsids (Ornithischia) in the Upper Judith River Group of Western
- Canada: Palaios, v. 13, no. 2, p. 160-169.
- Brown, C. M., Evans, D. C., Campione, N. E., O'Brien, L. J., and Eberth, D. A., 2013, Evidence
- 246 for taphonomic size bias in the Dinosaur Park Formation (Campanian, Alberta), a model
- Mesozoic terrestrial alluvial-paralic system: Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,
- Palaeoecology, v. 372, p. 108-122.
- Burgener, L., Hyland, E., Huntington, K. W., Kelson, J. R., and Sewall, J. O., 2019, Revisiting
- the equable climate problem during the Late Cretaceous greenhouse using paleosol

- primary stable isotope signals in dinosaur remains, and environmental gradients of the
- Late Cretaceous of Montana and Alberta: Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,
- Palaeoecology, v. 266, no. 1-2, p. 13-27.
- Fricke, H. C., and Wing, S. L., 2004, Oxygen isotope and paleobotanical estimates of
- 279 temperature and $\delta^{18}O$ -latitude gradients over North America during the early Eocene: American Journal of Science, v. 304, p. 612-635.
- 281 Holtz Jr, T. R., Brinkman, D. L., and Chandler, C. L., 1998, Denticle morphometrics and a possibly omnivorous feeding habit for the theropod dinosaur Troodon: Gaia, v. 15, p.
- 159-166.
- Horner, J. R., Varricchio, D. J., and Goodwin, M. B., 1992, Marine transgressions and the evolution of Cretaceous dinosaurs.: Nature, v. 358, p. 59-62.
- Kohn, M. J., 1996, Predicting animal δ18O: accounting for diet and physiological adaptation: Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, v. 60, no. 23, p. 4811-4829.
- Kohn, M. J., 2010, Carbon isotope compositions of terrestrial C3 plants as indicators of (paleo)
- ecology and (paleo) climate: Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, v. 107, no. 46, p. 19691-19695.
- Larson, T. E., and Longstaffe, F. J., 2007, Deciphering seasonal variations in the diet and drinking water of modern White-Tailed deer by in situ analysis of osteons in cortical
- bone: Journal of Geophysical Research: Biogeosciences, v. 112, no. G4, p. n/a-n/a.
- Lehman, T. M., 1987, Late Maastrichtian paleoenvironments and dinosaur biogeography in the
- western interior of North America: Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology,

v. 60, p. 189-217.

335 **FIGURES & FIGURE CAPTIONS**

336

- 337 Figure 1. Geographic and
- 338 stratigraphic position of
- 339 Cretaceous locality ('Rainy Day
- 340 Site', or RDS). A, position of
- 341 study area in North America; B,
- 342 position of RDS in southern
- 343 Alberta (specific GPS coordinates
- 344 on-file at Royal Tyrrell Museum
- 345 and available upon request); C,
- 346 Campanian stratigraphy of
- 347 southern Alberta with
- 348 stratigraphic position of RDS
- 349 indicated; D, Stratigraphic section
- 350 at RDS locality indicating
- 351 location of RDS in respect to
- 352 other nearby sites and marker
- 353 beds; E, photograph of locality
- 354 showing position of RDS and
- 355 nearby sites and marker beds; F,

356 photograph of broader area stratigraphy. Green line in E $&$ F indicates position relative to 357 stratigraphic column in D inset. Abbreviations: c–clay; cz–coal zone; m–mud; ss–sandstone.

 c_m

359 Figure 2. Stable carbon isotope compositions of analyzed fossil taxa. Expected predator-prey 360 isotopic offsets exist between tyrannosaurids and large ornithischians, and between aquatic 361 reptiles and fish. No distinct separation present in the isotopic ranges of sampled ornithischians. 362

382 Stable oxygen isotope compositions are 'phosphate-corrected' (i.e. modified to display only 383 δ^{18} O_{phosphate}, and remove the small fraction of δ^{18} O_{carbonate} and δ^{18} O_{hydroxyl} also measured in laser-384 produced total-oxygen) in order to facilitate comparisons with modern Atchafalaya data from

386 Figure 4: Oxygen isotope-based temperature estimates. A, individual taxon isotope-temperature 387 estimates from Cretaceous paleoecosystem compared to endotherm-ectotherm-combined-mean 388 (EECM) estimate from same data, alongside temperature estimates from other proxies (MAT= 389 mean annual temperature, WMMT= warm month mean temperature, and CMMT= cold month 390 mean temperature). B, individual taxon isotope-temperature estimates from the modern 391 Atchafalaya River Basin ecosystem compared to EECM estimate from same data, to measured 392 temperatures from Atchafalaya River (taken multiple times per day during one full year), and to 393 measured air temperatures for that region. All temperatures and $\delta^{18}O_{\text{water}}$ calculated from 394 $\delta^{18}O_{\text{phosphate}}$ compositions. See Table DR5 for detailed information and original data sources.

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION

¹GSA Data Repository item 2020155. This contains the data, including Figure DR1 (tests of 398 sampling bias and geochemical alteration), Table DR1 (mean $\delta^{13}C$, $\delta^{18}O$ and collection data for 399 all specimens), Table DR2 (δ^{13} C and δ^{18} O measurements for all samples), Table DR3 (Trophic 400 Enrichment Factors applied for δ^{13} C_{diet} comparisons between Cretaceous and modern faunal 401 communities), Table DR4 (species mean δ^{13} C and δ^{18} O for Cretaceous and modern taxa), Table DR5 (Calculated oxygen isotope-based temperature estimates for Cretaceous and Atchafalaya, other Campanian paleotemperature proxies, and modern Louisiana temperature data), and associated supplementary references mentioned within the included DR figures and tables. Data Repository available online at http://www.geosociety.org/datarepository/2020/, or on request from editing@geosociety.org