

Alma Mater Studiorum Università di Bologna  
Archivio istituzionale della ricerca

Speleothem record attests to stable environmental conditions during Neanderthal-modern human turnover in southern Italy

This is the final peer-reviewed author's accepted manuscript (postprint) of the following publication:

*Published Version:*

Andrea, C., Veronica, C., Christoph, S., Stefano, B., John, H., Hai, C., et al. (2020). Speleothem record attests to stable environmental conditions during Neanderthal-modern human turnover in southern Italy. NATURE ECOLOGY & EVOLUTION, 4(9), 1188-1195 [10.1038/s41559-020-1243-1].

*Availability:*

This version is available at: <https://hdl.handle.net/11585/764986> since: 2024-05-27

*Published:*

DOI: <http://doi.org/10.1038/s41559-020-1243-1>

*Terms of use:*

Some rights reserved. The terms and conditions for the reuse of this version of the manuscript are specified in the publishing policy. For all terms of use and more information see the publisher's website.

This item was downloaded from IRIS Università di Bologna (<https://cris.unibo.it/>).  
When citing, please refer to the published version.

(Article begins on next page)

**Speleothem record attests stable environmental conditions during  
Neanderthal-Modern Human turnover in Southern Italy**

Columbu Andrea<sup>1\*</sup>, Chiarini Veronica<sup>1</sup>, Spötl Christoph<sup>2</sup>, Benazzi Stefano<sup>3,4</sup>,  
Hellstrom John<sup>5</sup>, Cheng Hai<sup>6,7,8</sup>, De Waele Jo<sup>1</sup>

1) University of Bologna, Department of Biological Geological and Environmental  
Sciences (Bologna, Italy)

2) University of Innsbruck, Institute of Geology (Innsbruck, Austria)

3) University of Bologna, Department of Cultural Heritage (Bologna, Italy)

4) Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology, Department of Human  
Evolution (Leipzig, Germany)

5) University of Melbourne, School of Earth Sciences (Melbourne Australia)

6) Xi'an Jiaotong University, <sup>[1]</sup>SEP Institute of Global Environmental Change (Xi'an,  
China)

7) State Key Laboratory of Loess and Quaternary Geology, Institute of Earth  
Environment, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Xi'an (Xi'an, China)

8) University of Minnesota, Department of Earth Sciences (Minnesota, USA)

\* corresponding author

**The causes of Neanderthal-Modern Human (MH) turnover are ambiguous. While potential biocultural interactions between the two groups are still little known, it is clear that Neanderthals in southern Europe disappeared about 42,000 years ago (ka), after ~3,000 years long cohabitation with MH. Among a plethora of hypotheses on Neanderthal extinction, rapid climate changes during the Middle to Upper Palaeolithic transition (MUPT) are regarded as a primary factor. Here we show evidence for stable climate and environmental conditions during the MUPT in a region (Apulia) where Neanderthals and MH coexisted. We base our findings on a rare last glacial stalagmite deposited between ~106 and ~27 ka, providing the first continuous western Mediterranean speleothem palaeoclimate archive for this period. The uninterrupted growth of the stalagmite attests the constant availability of rainfall and vegetated soils, while its  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ - $\delta^{18}\text{O}$**

34 **palaeoclimate proxies demonstrate that Apulia was not affected by**  
35 **dramatic climate oscillations during the MUPT. Our results imply that**  
36 **climate did not play a key role in the disappearance of the Neanderthals in**  
37 **this area, thus the Neanderthal-MH turnover must be approached from a**  
38 **perspective that takes into account climate and environmental conditions**  
39 **favourable for both species.**

## 41 **Background**

42 There is no leading theory about the triggers of the most important cultural  
43 transition in human history<sup>1,2</sup>. Rapid climate shifts during the MUPT are  
44 considered as one of the most important drivers of the Neanderthal-MH  
45 interchange<sup>2-8</sup>, because of the impact on population/depopulation dynamics<sup>7,8</sup>,  
46 fragmentation of optimal habitats<sup>6</sup>, deterioration of environmental conditions<sup>3</sup>,  
47 and/or the weakening of local communities after severe cold and dry stages<sup>4</sup>.  
48 Accordingly, the Neanderthals have been inexorably afflicted by recurrent  
49 millennial- to centennial-scale dry and cold conditions attributable to  
50 Dansgaard–Oeschger (DO) cycles and especially Heinrich (H) events during  
51 Marine Isotope Stage (MIS) 3. H events induced aridity and cold temperatures in  
52 Western and Central Europe<sup>10</sup>, and those occurring from ~63 to ~40.5 ka (H6 to  
53 H4) had irreversible impacts on the Neanderthal population<sup>5</sup>. The one at ~40.5  
54 ka (H4) caused the final Neanderthals' demise and/or their migration into other  
55 areas where the extinction occurred later<sup>2</sup>. However, this is at odds with the fact  
56 that H events lack consistent equivalents in the Mediterranean realm<sup>11</sup> and they  
57 may have not necessarily resulted in very harsh climate conditions in the entire  
58 region<sup>12</sup>. Additionally, Neanderthal extinction might have occurred before H4<sup>13</sup>.  
59 Indeed, there are chronological and spatial impediments in solving this  
60 conundrum, because of age uncertainties of both the palaeoclimate and the  
61 anthropological events, and the unknown response of local Neanderthal-MH  
62 habitats to high-latitude driven climate change. Moreover, ancient human  
63 communities occupied only small portions of land with ideal settlement  
64 conditions, and the gradual climate deterioration of the last glacial period likely  
65 reduced the extent of these optimal Neanderthal habitats<sup>6</sup>. The 2,600 to 5,400  
66 years-long interval of Neanderthal-MH coexistence was likely unevenly

distributed in space<sup>13</sup>. Therefore, climate-related hypotheses should be based on records from the same area where Neanderthals-MH actually cohabitated, but these records are scarce<sup>14</sup>.

Neanderthal and MH remains are widespread from northern to southern Italy<sup>9</sup>. This study targets Apulia (Fig. 1), where Neanderthals were present since at least MIS 5e until ~42 ka, while the earliest European MH appeared in this region ~45 ka<sup>1,9</sup>. Thus, this is a strategic region for understanding the biocultural processes occurring during the Neanderthal-MH transition and, ultimately, whether climate played a decisive role in the disappearance of the former and in the territorial supremacy of the latter.

## Results

We explored several caves in Apulia searching for speleothems (Extended Data Figure 1). Uranium-thorium (U-Th) radiometric dating on 14 stalagmites (Extended Data Figure 5 and Supplementary Table 1) attests that cave calcite deposition was abundant during the last and older glacial periods (Fig. 1). Here we focus on stalagmite PC from Pozzo Cucù Cave (40.90° N, 17.16° E), for which 27 stratigraphically aligned U-Th dates (Supplementary Table 1) were used to produce an age-depth model (Extended Data Figure 6). Accordingly, PC grew uninterruptedly from 106.0 <sup>+2.8</sup>/<sub>-2.7</sub> to 26.6 <sup>+0.8</sup>/<sub>-0.9</sub> ka, and thus covers MIS 5 to MIS 3 (Fig. 2). High-resolution  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  analyses (n = 2659) reveal a pattern comparable to the North Greenland Ice Core<sup>15</sup> (NGRIP) from the entire MIS 5 and 4. During MIS 3,  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  shows a less evident – but still recognisable – similarity with NGRIP, while  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  yields a plateau-like signal. Importantly,  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  does not show evidence of many of the most severe climate events affecting northern latitudes (e.g., Heinrich events).

## Discussion

Because glacial stages in the Mediterranean area were generally dry and characterised by sparse vegetation, continuous speleothem growth was rare. In Italy, for example, there is no evidence of uninterrupted stalagmite deposition during glacial periods (Fig. 1). To our knowledge, the longest record has been constructed by using four speleothems (two stalagmites and two stalactites)

found in Frassassi Cave<sup>16</sup>. In the Iberian Peninsula, speleothem formation was also intermittent<sup>11,17,18</sup>, while more continuous deposition is only known from caves in Turkey and on the south-eastern side of the Mediterranean Sea<sup>19,20</sup>. The continuous growth of speleothems in Manot Cave (Israel) has been recently taken as evidence for the lack of water shortage in northern Israel during the last glacial period<sup>21</sup>. Considering that continuous speleothem deposition is only feasible if the karst reservoir is recharged by rainfall and soil bioactivity procures high amounts of CO<sub>2</sub> to infiltrating water, Apulia's glacial climate was possibly milder than in other areas in the western and central Mediterranean. The  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values of PC are representative of soil activity<sup>10,11</sup> (see methods). For most of the time, values are more negative than -5.0 ‰ (Fig. 2), attesting the presence of C3 plants<sup>22</sup> that normally prevail in temperate regions. It is well established that  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  in speleothems from the Mediterranean principally reflects rainfall amount variations<sup>23</sup>. Secondly, it might also record changes in moisture sources<sup>24</sup>. Because of the striking resemblance between PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  and NGRIP  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  (Fig. 2), especially during MIS 5 and 4, we are confident that the stalagmite recorded the effects of climate change in the high latitudes and the North Atlantic. This intrahemispheric connection is translated into rainfall oscillations during DO cycles, with higher (lower) rainfall amount during interstadials (stadials) as expressed by more negative (positive)  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values. This correlation can also be seen at the intra-stadial/interstadial timescale<sup>25</sup> (Extended Data Figure 2). Intriguingly, the shape of several MIS 5 DO-like events in PC (e.g., DOs from ~90 to ~70 ka) appear more similar to the Asian monsoonal oscillations<sup>26</sup> than to NGRIP (Extended Data Figure 3), a feature worth to be examined in detail in future studies. Variability of PC growth rate and  $[\text{234}/\text{238}\text{U}]_i$  (Extended Data Figure 4) agrees with PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  being principally driven by rainfall amount (see methods). Changes in the dominant moisture source are possibly reflected by the PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values too. During Greenland Interstadials (GIs) rainfall in the Mediterranean region was predominantly Atlantic-sourced giving rise to more negative  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values, similar to today<sup>23,27</sup>. Conversely, Mediterranean-sourced moisture showing more positive  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values prevailed when large ice sheets during Greenland Stadials (GSs) impeded the Westerlies from efficiently delivering moisture to the Mediterranean region (see methods). This is because

the lower moisture production in the Atlantic, according to the relative decrease of GSs temperatures, limits advection over the Mediterranean<sup>23</sup>. As the Atlantic moisture input decreases, the ratio between Mediterranean/Atlantic moisture increases in the area of study. The further expansion of northern ice-sheet since MIS 3 probably caused a pronounced southward shift of the Westerlies<sup>24</sup>, that might have boosted this mechanism.

The covariation of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  in PC is consistent with rainfall amount being a primary driver (Fig. 2). In Apulia, rainfall coupled with temperature variations as recorded by other archives (Fig. 3) modulated soil organic activity reflected by the  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  record of PC (Fig. 2). Between DO 24 and DO 15, bioproductivity increased during GIs giving rise to more negative  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values. Because of reduced rainfall and lower temperatures during GSs, bioproductivity decreased resulting in more positive  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values. The generally low  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values in conjunction with the lack of growth stops in PC strongly argues for a continuously vegetated catchment of the cave's drip water with expanding forests during GIs and trees becoming sparse during GSs (Fig. 3), in agreement with nearby pollen records<sup>28,29</sup>. The PC  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  data suggest two periods of extremely dry condition, when both isotopes show peak values: from  $66.7^{+0.9}/_{-1.2}$  to  $65.6^{+1.1}/_{-1.3}$  ka during MIS 4, and from  $55.3^{+1.1}/_{-2.5}$  to  $54.9^{+1.1}/_{-2.7}$  ka during MIS 3. Both events deviate from the NGRIP variability but agree with speleothem<sup>11</sup>, lacustrine<sup>29</sup> and marine records<sup>30</sup> from the Mediterranean region. They have been attributed to markedly dry conditions during ice-rafting events and increases of cold-water foraminifera in the North Atlantic during H events 6 and 5a<sup>11,31</sup>. Although the aridity of these events was not sufficient to stop carbonate deposition at the PC site, as occurring in speleothems from continental Europe<sup>10</sup> (Fig. 3g), these periods are here regarded as the driest and probably coldest of the entire MIS 5 to 3 timespan at least in Southern Italy. The event at ~55 ka was certainly the driest of the entire record as reflected by the highest  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values and a marked reduction in growth rate (Fig. 1 and Extended Data 4). This event was likely even drier than GS24 and GS23, from  $105.2^{+2.4}/_{-2.3}$  to  $102.4^{+2.1}/_{-2.0}$  ka and from  $95.7^{+0.9}/_{-0.8}$  to  $93.1^{+0.7}/_{-0.9}$  ka, which also led to  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values higher than -5 ‰.

There is no correlation between PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  and NGRIP for DO 14 and 13 (Fig. 2), likely because of the low resolution due to the slow growth rate. From DO 12 to the top of the record, PC shows its most interesting features: i) PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  reveals NGRIP-like millennial-scale oscillations, although the similarities with NGRIP are strikingly less evident than prior to  $\sim 55$  ka. The implication is that rapid climate oscillation during MIS 3 recorded in Greenland had a lower impact on rainfall variability in Apulia than those during MIS 5 and 4; and ii) these oscillations are superimposed to a general PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  trend toward more positive values (Fig. 2), which is synchronous with the progressive reduction of the stalagmite's diameter (Fig. 1). Considering that the latter mirrors long-lasting reduced dripping and thus calcite deposition at the top of the speleothem<sup>32</sup>, these observations point to a middle to upper MIS 3 in Apulia characterised by a progressive rainfall reduction rather than by rapid and severe climate switches. At this point the Mediterranean might have become the primary source of moisture because of the expansion of the Northern ice-sheets. This is consistent with a gradual increase in the  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  value of the moisture source for PC. Furthermore, rainfall amount variability during MIS 3 GIs and GSs, caused by Mediterranean cyclogenesis, is not comparable to that induced by a higher efficiency of Westerlies delivering moisture during MIS 4 and 5. This is because the availability of moisture is lower than when the Atlantic is the principal moisture source. Most importantly, from  $\sim 55$  ka onward PC  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values show a "plateau-like" feature during MIS 3 (Fig. 2). This cannot be explained by in-karst processes and/or kinetic mechanisms affecting isotopic fractionation (see methods), but rather reflects stable soil dynamics and only minor vegetation changes. Preliminary  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  data from another Apulian stalagmite (SA1, Fig. 2 and Extended Data 5) agree with PC<sup>33</sup>. This reinforces the idea that drastic rainfall (and temperature) variations were minimal and insufficient to cause major changes in soil bioproductivity and/or interruptions in speleothem deposition. Speleothems from Frasassi cave<sup>16</sup>, the only Italian record available for comparison (Fig. 1), also report  $\sim$ constant  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  (Fig. 3) from  $\sim 55$  ka to at least  $\sim 30$  ka, which was interpreted as mirroring relatively stable climatic conditions in the northeastern Apennines. The slight depletion trend that is visible in the PC- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  plateau may appear inconsistent with the gradual decrease

in rainfall expressed by PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ . We advance the possibility that the lack of severe droughts, which would also cause the total/partial soil erosion, allowed an enduring maturation of pedogenic layers although the general trend of climate deterioration. This hypothesis will be thoroughly explored by future studies. Vegetation shifts likely occurred, but they were possibly less pronounced than in the nearby Monticchio Lake<sup>28</sup> area (Fig. 3) because of the proximity with the coast and the lower altitude. Accordingly, from ~55 ka onward we set the beginning of environmental niche conditions in Apulia<sup>1</sup>. Neanderthals settled in this region well before MIS 3, so Apulia cannot be considered a *refugia*<sup>34</sup> for them. Contrarily to Apulia, freshwater availability, as well as vegetation, was scarce in the northern parts of the Italian Peninsula as highlighted by speleothem deposition (Fig. 1). This attracted wildlife and new hunter-gatherer communities. Favourable settlement conditions might have fostered the arrival of MH in Apulia and their coexistence with Neanderthals (Fig. 2). The disappearance of Neanderthals in Apulia (~42 ka) occurred ~13,000 years after the cold and dry interval at ~55 ka, while the following H5 (~45 ka) apparently did not have a strong impact on the local environment. This is confirmed by arboreal pollen values above 40% in the nearby Monticchio Lake record<sup>28</sup>. In contrast, pollen in Greece<sup>29</sup>, planktonic foraminifera in the Tyrrhenian Sea<sup>30</sup> and speleothems from Iberia<sup>11</sup> and Turkey<sup>19</sup> record climate deterioration during H5 at around 48 ka (Fig. 3), further suggesting that Apulia was a favourable environmental niche during MIS 3 in comparison to other localities. It has been recently shown<sup>35</sup> that the climate in Morocco responded inconsistently to northern high-latitude ice-rafted debris events, with even pluvial phases occurring during these cold and dry periods. This calls for a re-evaluation of the role of the northern high latitudes in triggering major cooling/drying events across the Mediterranean region. Even supposing a late Neanderthal presence in Southern Italy, e.g. later than ~42 ka, the fact that the impact of H4 (~40.5 ka) on PC's proxy data is negligible further excludes climate as the major trigger for the Neanderthal-MH turnover during MUPT.

## Final remarks



PC represents strong evidence of environmental stability in Apulia during the Neanderthal-MH turnover, hence high latitude rapid climate changes were not the primary cause of Neanderthals' disappearance in this region. Opposite opinions face the paradox that shifts toward a dry and cold climate did not result in a cessation of speleothem deposition, but caused the extinction of a species well adapted to the surrounding environment and that survived previous climate periods more severe than MIS 3. Consequently, this applies to all European mid-latitude regions where DO climate variations during MIS 3 were attenuated by latitudinal, orographic and/or geographical factors. In all Apulia-like niches, the issue of the Neanderthal-MH turnover must be approached from a perspective that takes into account climate and environmental conditions favourable for both species. This interestingly differs from the Levantine area where there was no water shortage during MUPT, but speleothem  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  suggest an alternation between woody and more open vegetation. The adaptation of different modern cultures that possibly interacted with Neanderthals has been there defined as landscape-dependent<sup>21</sup>. In Apulia-like niches instead, the advanced hunting technology of MH groups over Neanderthals since their migration to Europe<sup>36-39</sup> appears now a solid reason to explain the territorial supremacy of the former that induced the extinction of the latter after ~3000 years of coexistence.

## Methods

### Cave sampling and speleothem subsampling

The caves explored for this work are: Pozzo Cucù (40.90° N, 17.16° E), Trullo (40.85° N, 17.11° E), Sant'Angelo (40.73° N, 17.57° E) and Zaccaria (40.74° N, 17.55° E) (Extended Data Figure 1). For the conservation of the cave environment, all speleothems used in this study were found displaced from their original position, sometimes in multiple pieces. No hammer or any cutting tools were employed during sampling. PC stalagmite was found right next to its growing location. All stalagmites were cut along the central axis and polished to allow a better visualization of the internal layering and macrofabrics. For U-Th dating, ~100 mg calcite powders and/or chips were obtained by milling along a discrete number of growth layers. Drill bits of 1 mm and 0.8 mm were used for preliminary and detailed dating, respectively. For stable isotope subsampling, one half of PC was quartered, in order to precisely conduct milling operation along the central axis. The milling increment was 0.1 mm between the top and 51 mm from the top, and 0.2 mm from 51 mm to the bottom of the stalagmite. A total of 2659 subsamples was obtained. See Fig. 1 for subsampling location. The milling resulted in an average resolution of ~30 yr (range ~20 to 175 yr).

### U-Th dating and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ - $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ analyses

The majority of U-Th dating was accomplished at the University of Melbourne (Australia), School of Earth Sciences, while a minor part was carried out at the Xi'an Jiaotong University (China),<sup>[1]</sup> Institute of Global Environmental Change (Supplementary Table 1). In Melbourne, ~100 mg of calcite were first dissolved using  $\text{HNO}_3$  then spiked with a solution of a known  $^{236}\text{U}/^{233}\text{U}/^{229}\text{Th}$  ratio. Eichrom TRU-Spec resin columns were first decontaminated by using a sequential wash of 1.5M  $\text{HNO}_3$ , 4M  $\text{HCl}$  and 0.2M  $\text{HF}$ -0.1M  $\text{HCl}$ , then the U+Th compound was separated from the carbonate matrix by using another wash of 1.5M  $\text{HNO}_3$ , 4M  $\text{HCl}$  and 0.2M  $\text{HF}$ -0.1M  $\text{HCl}$ . The U+Th solution evaporated on a hot plate at 80°C and later in 5%  $\text{HNO}_3$ -0.5%  $\text{HF}$ , to be ready for the analyses in a Nu Plasma multi-collector-inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometer (MC-ICP-MS), with settings defined in previous works<sup>40</sup>. Final U-Th ages were calculated using equation (1) of Hellstrom (2006)<sup>41</sup> using the  $^{230}\text{Th}$ - $^{234}\text{U}$  decay constants of Cheng et al. (2013)<sup>42</sup> and an initial  $(^{230}\text{Th}/^{232}\text{Th})_i$  of  $1.5 \pm 1.5$ . In Xi'an, the general chemical preparation procedure is similar to Melbourne, although U and Th compounds, after calcite  $\text{HNO}_3$  dissolution, are first precipitated using a Fe solution, then extracted separately by using decontaminated resin columns and sequential washes of 6N  $\text{HCl}$  and ultraclean water. The U and Th solution is mixed with 2%  $\text{HNO}_3$  + 0.1%  $\text{HF}$  before analysis on a Thermo Fisher Neptune Plus MC-ICP-MS<sup>42</sup>. Ages were calculated as above. All ages are reported relative to 1950 AD (before present, BP; Supplementary Table 1). Despite slight differences in sample chemical treatment and age calculation, the dates produced in the two labs are consistent (Supplementary Table 1). Only top and bottom were dated for the majority of speleothems (Extended Data Figure 5), while 27 ages constitute the PC chronological dataset. The PC ages and their  $2\sigma$  uncertainties were used in StalAge<sup>43</sup> and COPRA<sup>44</sup> to produce the age model. Both algorithms produced a comparable age-depth curve (Extended Data Figure 6). In order to minimise the intrinsic artefacts produced by the two algorithms, such as unrealistic maxima in growth rate and unjustified

large uncertainty propagation, the final age model was obtained by a linear regression of the average age values between StalAge and COPRA models at the same depths (Extended Data Figure 6).

For stable isotopes, powders were prepared using an online, continuous-flow preparation system (GasBench II), then analysed using a ThermoFisher Delta V Plus mass spectrometer at the University of Innsbruck (Austria), Institute of Geology. NBS18, NBS19, CO1, and CO8 standards were used as references. The results are expressed in per mil (‰) units relative to the Vienna Pee Dee Belemnite (VPDB) international standard. The  $1\sigma$  analytical reproducibility was 0.06‰ and 0.08‰ for  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , respectively.

### **Conditions during PC deposition**

Stable isotope values of speleothems deposited under non-equilibrium conditions may mask the palaeoclimate signal. The Hendy test can be used to evaluate geochemical conditions during calcite deposition<sup>45</sup>, and equilibrium is indicated if: 1)  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values are not strongly correlated along the growth axis; 2)  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values are not strongly positively correlated from the centre to the flank along individual growth layers; 3)  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  do not increase from the centre to the side of growth layer, with a maximum increase threshold of 0.8‰ for  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ .  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values along the central axis of PC are not strongly correlated ( $r = 0.6$  – although correlation itself might be a result of climate forcing<sup>46</sup>), and individual layers do not suggest non-equilibrium fractionation (Extended Data Figure 7). A slight influence of kinetic fractionation is only likely for the H1 layer (Extended Data Figure 7), located close to the top of the speleothem and starting at 10 mm from the centre of the stalagmite. In this top part, the stalagmite diameter is small, and the more positive  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values resulted from the steep flank.

In addition to the Hendy test, the constant ~10 cm diameter of PC also argues in favour of equilibrium-dominated isotope fractionation<sup>47</sup>.

Finally, we consider Pozzo Cucù cave a ventilation-poor environment during PC deposition, considering the present narrow artificial entrance. Indeed, Pozzo Cucù possibly belongs to a karst system that had no large natural connection with the surface, minimizing the air exchange between the cave and the surface. This is important because ventilation is the main driver of fast degassing and evaporation in caves (considering that humidity in non-ventilated caves is commonly close to condensation), with evaporation being one of the principal causes of kinetic fractionation. However, it is suspected that speleothems are never deposited at full equilibrium conditions<sup>46</sup>, and we cannot exclude a small influence of kinetic fractionation in the PC stable isotope signature. For this reason, and based on our previous studies<sup>27,48,49</sup>, PC is considered as deposited under quasi-equilibrium conditions, i.e.  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  data primarily reflect palaeoclimate/palaeoenvironmental conditions above the cave.

Regarding post-depositional processes that might have compromised the original geochemical composition of the stalagmite, PC does not show any visual evidence of dissolution and recrystallization. Accordingly, all U-Th dates are in stratigraphic order (Supplementary Table 1).

### **Significance of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values**

Speleothem  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  ( $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{spel}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{spel}}$ ) values reflect processes *inside* and *outside* of the karst system. Because endogenous (i.e. geological) processes might conceal and/or modify the geochemical output of exogenous (i.e. climatic) processes, the first challenge in speleothem science is to understand whether or not a potential climate signal has been registered in the stalagmite stable isotope signature. With calcite deposited under quasi-equilibrium conditions and with no evidence of diagenesis, endogenous factors can be ruled out as primary drivers of stable isotopic composition. Furthermore, considering that most of PC's  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  ( $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$ ) shifts occurred simultaneously with interhemispheric climate events (Fig. 2 and 3), it is clear that climate had a major role in modulating stable isotopes. The interpretation of  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  timeseries hence requires to identify the key exogenous factor(s) and to understand if endogenous factors had a secondary role in modulating  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  values.

At Western Europe latitudes, temperature and rainfall amount compete in regulating rainfall water  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  ( $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{rw}}$ ). Temperature and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{rw}}$ , in the Mediterranean region, show a weak positive gradient of  $\sim 0.22\text{‰}/^{\circ}\text{C}$ , while rainfall amount and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{rw}}$  show a strong negative gradient of  $\sim -1.6\text{‰}/100\text{ mm rain}^{50}$ . The equilibrium  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  fractionation during calcite deposition ranges between  $-0.24\text{‰}/^{\circ}\text{C}$  ( $^{51}$ ) and  $-0.18\text{‰}/^{\circ}\text{C}$  ( $^{52}$ ) and counterbalances the temperature-dependent isotope fractionation of atmospheric precipitation outside the cave. Accordingly, rainfall amount is the principal driver of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{spel}}$  in the study area as supported by previous studies in the western Mediterranean<sup>18,23,27,48,49,53</sup>. The same effect prevails in Central Italy<sup>54</sup>, the nearest speleothem record from Italy, as well as in Macedonia (F.Y.R.O.M)<sup>55</sup>, the nearest speleothem record on the Balkan side of the Adriatic Sea. However, rainfall amount oscillations should also affect the rate of bedrock dissolution that in turn could have an important impact on growth rate and the abundance of uranium in speleothems. During wet (and warm) climate stages, bedrock is subjected to a more intense dissolution because of the higher quantity of water and a higher input of  $\text{CO}_2$  from soil. Because of the higher amount of dissolved carbonate in the drip water and a possibly faster dripping in the cave, speleothem growth rate increases. The opposite (i.e. a growth rate decrease) is expected for dry stages, although this general condition might not be valid for complex karst networks and/or might vary with time<sup>56</sup>. At the same time, rapid dissolution of bedrock limits uranium alpha-recoil, i.e.  $^{234}\text{U}$  and  $^{238}\text{U}$  are equally leached from the bedrock<sup>23</sup>. Longer water residence times, typical of drier conditions, promote uranium alpha-recoil and higher  $[^{234}/^{238}\text{U}]_i$  ratios because of a more efficient leaching of  $^{234}\text{U}$ . If rainfall amount is the main regulator of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$ , more negative values are expected during relatively wet periods, when growth rate increases and  $[^{234}/^{238}\text{U}]_i$  ratio decreases; on the contrary, less negative values are expected during relatively dry periods when growth rate decreases and the  $[^{234}/^{238}\text{U}]_i$  ratio increases. PC shows, within uncertainties, this pattern, confirming that rainfall amount was one of the principal driver of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  (Extended Data Figure 4). The agreement between the  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  pattern and the Greenland isotope record for most of the DO cycles, with more negative values during interstadials and less negative values during stadials, is an indirect confirmation of the rainfall amount effect as interstadials (stadials) were relatively wet (dry) in the Mediterranean realm<sup>18,27,48,49,54</sup>.

Vegetation bioproductivity controls  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  of soil  $\text{CO}_2$  ( $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{soil}}$ ) and thus  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  in the infiltrating water ( $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw}}$ ). Excluding endogenous factors,  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{spel}}$  ranges between -14.0‰ and -5.0‰ for C3 plants<sup>22</sup>. More negative  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw-spel}}$  values are expected during periods of high bioproductivity, characteristic of humid and warm climate stages, while less negative  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw-spel}}$  values are expected during periods of low bioproductivity, typical of dry and cold climate stages.  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  shows the most significant oscillation during MIS 5 and 4, with lower values corresponding to interstadials and higher values corresponding to stadials, in agreement with  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  oscillations. The only exogenous process that could cause a substantial increase in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw-spel}}$  is the switch to C4 vegetation<sup>22</sup>. At the same time, endogenous phenomena such as sulphide-driven bedrock dissolution<sup>57</sup>, closed-system bedrock dissolution<sup>45</sup> and prior calcite precipitation (PCP)<sup>58</sup> also push  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw-spel}}$  toward less negative values. Importantly, all these processes can be attributed to a relative dry climate, considering that C4 plants thrive in steppe-like environments and the endogenous processes are enhanced during times of reduced recharge. However, only PCP has an effect on both  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw-spel}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{iw-spel}}$ .

Concomitant variations of  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  during MIS 5 to 4 are thus attributed to rainfall and bioproductivity changes triggered by the interstadial-stadial cyclicity. However, during the concomitant excursion toward the highest values at 105.2  $^{+2.4}_{-2.3}$  to 102.4  $^{+2.1}_{-2.0}$  ka, 95.7  $^{+0.9}_{-0.8}$  to 93.1  $^{+0.7}_{-0.9}$  ka, 66.7  $^{+0.9}_{-1.2}$  to 65.6  $^{+1.1}_{-1.3}$  ka, and 55.3  $^{+1.1}_{-2.5}$  to 54.9  $^{+1.1}_{-2.7}$  ka and especially when  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  is above  $\sim -5\text{‰}$  it is possible that the above-mentioned processes might have played a role in increasing  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$ . We consider PCP as the main endogenous process increasing  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{iw}}$ , because rapid shifts in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  toward high values occur simultaneously. Sulphide-driven bedrock dissolution can be excluded because of the lack of sulphide minerals in the Pozzo Cucù bedrock.

During MIS 3,  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  do not covary.  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  shows a pattern characterised by negligible oscillations with values around  $\sim -8\text{‰}$ ;  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  shows millennial-scale DO-like oscillations of  $\sim -1\text{‰}$ , lower than during MIS 5 and 4, and a general trend toward less negative values. The lack of a covariation between  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  argues against PCP; mixing of groundwater or in-karst kinetic processes (for example: evaporation) are excluded for the same reason. The relatively negative values of  $\sim -8\text{‰}$  are inconsistent with closed system and sulphide-driven bedrock dissolution. Even speleothems deposited from water in contact with  $\text{CO}_2$  derived from old organic matter trapped in bedrock fissures would result in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values higher than  $\sim -8\text{‰}$ . Thus,  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  reflects soil bioproductivity, which remained rather stable throughout MIS 3. This means that variations in rainfall (and temperature) during MIS 3 in Apulia were too small to cause significant perturbations in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{soil}}$ . This limited rainfall variation, together with a decreased resolution in this part of the record could explain the small  $\sim -1\text{‰}$  excursions of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$ .

Finally,  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  possibly responded to variations of moisture source during the entire MIS 5 to 3 period. Today, the study area receives most rainfall from the Atlantic, with a smaller contribution from the Mediterranean Sea<sup>59</sup>. Atlantic-sourced  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{rw}}$  is more negative than Mediterranean-sourced  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{rw}}$ , and the influence of the former is related to: 1) abundance of moisture produced in the Atlantic and 2) the efficiency of the Westerlies delivering this moisture in the

Mediterranean area. When polar ice sheets expanded, the influence of Atlantic-sourced moisture decreased in favour of Mediterranean-sourced moisture, because the production of moisture in the Atlantic is lower and westerlies trajectories changes. With all the other effects negligible, the source effect<sup>60</sup> would generally follow DO cyclicity leading to more negative  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values during interstadials and less negative values during stadials. However, at some point in the MIS 3, the Westerlies were pushed southward in response to the expansion of the Northern ice sheet. Rainfall in the Mediterranean was then controlled by the genesis of low pressure areas (cyclones) within in the Mediterranean realm. Although periods of increasing versus decreasing rainfall might still follow regional-scale DO cyclicity, rainfall amount changes are inferior than during MIS 5 and 4, because the availability of moisture is lower than when the Atlantic is the principal moisture source. A possible interpretation of the  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  signature during MIS 3 invokes a major influence of Mediterranean-derived rainfall causing a gradual trend of rainfall reduction, with a superimposed low-intensity rainfall amount increase versus decrease pattern (following DO cyclicity). It is important to stress that both the gradual rainfall reduction as well as rainfall decrease during MIS 3 GIs in Apulia were insufficient to cause significant perturbations in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{soil}}$ , as for example during MIS 5 and 4.

## Acknowledgements

The authors thank all the local speleologists that helped in the 2014 and 2019 fieldwork at Pozzo Cucù, Sant'Angelo, Zaccaria and Messapi caves: Gigi Loperfido, Salvatore Inguscio, Giovanni Ragone, Piero Lippolis, Alessio Lacirignola, Donatella Leserri, Michele Marraffa, Orlando Lacarbonara, Fabio Semeraro, Sebastiano Calella, Pasquale Calella, Claudio Pastore, Claudio Marchitelli, Rosanna Romanazzi, Roberto Cupertino, Giovanni Caló e Franco Lorusso (belonging to the Gruppo Speleologico Martinese, CARS Altamura, Gruppo Speleologico Neretino, Gruppo Ricerche Carsiche Putignano, Gruppo Puglia Grotte and Gruppo Escursionistico Speleologico Ostunense), as well as the Bellanova family for access to Messapi Cave. AC, JDW and VC are also grateful to all members of the Gruppo Speleologico Martinese for their logistic help and the warm hospitality in Martina Franca. Thanks also to Mario Parise (University of Bari) for the help during 2014 fieldwork, Alessandro Reina (Polytechnic University of Bari) for his enthusiasm in supporting this research, Victor Casulli and Rosanna Laragione of Castellana Grotte srl for their interest in supporting this study, Manuela Wimmer and Marc Luetscher (Innsbruck University) for their help during lab work, Luca Pisani (Bologna University) for the DEM figure used in Extended Data Figure 1, Laura Calabrò (Bologna University) for the drilling of sample SA1. AC is supported by Leonardo Da Vinci Grant 2019 - DD MIUR No 787, 15/04/2019, SB is supported by ERC grant n. 724046 – SUCCESS <https://ERC-SUCCESS.eu>, and HC by NSFC 41888101 grant. This research received financial contributions from Grotte di Castellana srl and from Federazione Speleologica Pugliese. Special thanks to Prof. John Stewart and two anonymous reviewers for their comments that helped to improve the paper.

## Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests

**Data availability**

Supplementary Table 1 and 2

**Authors contribution**

AC and VC conceived and designed the experiments, AC, VC, CS, JH, HC performed the experiments, AC and SB analyzed the data, AC, VC, CS, SB, JDW contributed with materials/analysis tools, AC wrote the paper with inputs from all coauthors.

## References

- 1 Benazzi, S. *et al.* Early dispersal of modern humans in Europe and implications for Neanderthal behaviour. *Nature* **479**, 525-529 (2011).
- 2 Wolf, D. *et al.* Climate deteriorations and Neanderthal demise in interior Iberia. *Scientific Reports* **8**, 7048, doi:10.1038/s41598-018-25343-6 (2018).
- 3 Mellars, P. A new radiocarbon revolution and the dispersal of modern humans in Eurasia. *Nature* **439**, 931-935, doi:10.1038/nature04521 (2006).
- 4 Müller, U. C. *et al.* The role of climate in the spread of modern humans into Europe. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **30**, 273-279, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2010.11.016 (2011).
- 5 Staubwasser, M. *et al.* Impact of climate change on the transition of Neanderthals to modern humans in Europe. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **115**, 9116-9121 (2018).
- 6 Melchionna, M. *et al.* Fragmentation of Neanderthals' pre-extinction distribution by climate change. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **496**, 146-154 (2018).
- 7 Finlayson, C. & Carrion, J. S. Rapid ecological turnover and its impact on Neanderthal and other human populations. *Trends Ecol Evol* **22**, 213-222, doi:10.1016/j.tree.2007.02.001 (2007).
- 8 Stewart, J. R. The ecology and adaptation of Neanderthals during the non-analogue environment of Oxygen Isotope Stage 3. *Quaternary International* **137**, 35-46 (2005).
- 9 Benazzi, S. *et al.* The makers of the Protoaurignacian and implications for Neanderthal extinction. *Science* **348**, 793-796 (2015).
- 10 Genty, D. *et al.* Precise dating of Dansgaard–Oeschger climate oscillations in western Europe from stalagmite data. *Nature* **42**, 833-837 (2003).
- 11 Pérez-Mejías, C. *et al.* Orbital-to-millennial scale climate variability during Marine Isotope Stages 5 to 3 in northeast Iberia. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **224**, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2019.105946 (2019).
- 12 Badino, F. *et al.* An overview of Alpine and Mediterranean palaeogeography, terrestrial ecosystems and climate history during MIS 3 with focus on the Middle to Upper Palaeolithic transition. *Quaternary International*, doi:10.1016/j.quaint.2019.09.024 (2019).
- 13 Higham, T. *et al.* The timing and spatiotemporal patterning of Neanderthal disappearance. *Nature* **512**, 306 (2014).
- 14 Rey-Rodríguez, I. *et al.* Last Neanderthals and first Anatomically Modern Humans in the NW Iberian Peninsula: Climatic and environmental conditions inferred from the Cova Eirós small-vertebrate assemblage during MIS 3. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **151**, 185-197 (2016).
- 15 NGRIP Members. High-resolution record of Northern Hemisphere climate extending into the last interglacial period. *Nature* **431**, 147-151 (2004).
- 16 Kudielka, G. *et al.* Implications for central Italy paleoclimate from 95,000 yr BP until the early Holocene as evident from Frassassi Cave speleothems. *250 Million Years of Earth History in Central Italy: Celebrating 25 Years of the Geological Observatory of Coldigioco* **542**, 429 (2019).



- 551 17 Budsky, A. *et al.* Western Mediterranean climate response to  
552 Dansgaard/Oeschger events: new insights from speleothem records.  
553 *Geophysical Research Letters*, 9042-9053, doi:10.1029/2019GL084009  
554 (2019).
- 555 18 Denniston, R. F. *et al.* A stalagmite test of North Atlantic SST and Iberian  
556 hydroclimate linkages over the last two glacial cycles. *Climate of the Past*  
557 **14**, 1893-1913, doi:10.5194/cp-14-1893-2018 (2018).
- 558 19 Badertscher, S. *et al.* Pleistocene water intrusions from the Mediterranean  
559 and Caspian seas into the Black Sea. *Nature Geoscience* **4**, 236-239,  
560 doi:10.1038/ngeo1106 (2011).
- 561 20 Bar-Matthews, M., Ayalon, A., Gilmour, M., Matthews, A. & Hawkesworth,  
562 C. J. Sea-land oxygen isotopic relationships from planktonic foraminifera  
563 and speleothems in the Eastern Mediterranean region and their  
564 implication for paleorainfall during interglacial intervals. *Geochimica et*  
565 *Cosmochimica Acta* **67**, 3181-3199, doi:10.1016/s0016-7037(02)01031-1  
566 (2003).
- 567 21 Yasur, G. *et al.* Climatic and environmental conditions in the Western  
568 Galilee, during Late Middle and Upper Paleolithic periods, based on  
569 speleothems from Manot Cave, Israel. *Journal of Human Evolution*,  
570 doi:10.1016/j.jhevol.2019.04.004 (2019).
- 571 22 McDermott, F. Palaeo-climate reconstruction from stable isotope  
572 variations in speleothems: a review. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **23**, 901-  
573 918, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2003.06.021 (2004).
- 574 23 Drysdale, R. N. *et al.* Evidence for obliquity forcing of glacial Termination  
575 II. *Science* **325**, 1527-1531, doi:10.1126/science.1170371 (2009).
- 576 24 Luetscher, M. *et al.* North Atlantic storm track changes during the Last  
577 Glacial Maximum recorded by Alpine speleothems. *Nature*  
578 *Communications* **6**, 6344, doi:10.1038/ncomms7344 (2015).
- 579 25 Rasmussen, S. O. *et al.* A stratigraphic framework for abrupt climatic  
580 changes during the Last Glacial period based on three synchronized  
581 Greenland ice-core records: refining and extending the INTIMATE event  
582 stratigraphy. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **106**, 14-28,  
583 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2014.09.007 (2014).
- 584 26 Cheng, H. *et al.* The climatic cyclicity in semiarid - arid central Asia over  
585 the past 500,000 years. *Geophysical Research Letters* **39**  
586 <https://doi.org/10.1029/2011GL050202> (2012).
- 587 27 Columbu, A. *et al.* A long record of MIS 7 and MIS 5 climate and  
588 environment from a western Mediterranean speleothem (SW Sardinia,  
589 Italy). *Quaternary Science Reviews* **220**, 230-243 (2019).
- 590 28 Allen, J. R. M. *et al.* Rapid environmental changes in southern Europe  
591 during the last glacial period. *Science* **400**, 740-743 (1999).
- 592 29 Tzedakis, P. C., Hooghiemstra, H. & Pälike, H. The last 1.35 million years at  
593 Tenaghi Philippon: revised chronostratigraphy and long-term vegetation  
594 trends. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **25**, 3416-3430,  
595 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2006.09.002 (2006).
- 596 30 Toucanne, S. *et al.* Tracking rainfall in the northern Mediterranean  
597 borderlands during sapropel deposition. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **129**,  
598 178-195, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2015.10.016 (2015).

599 31 Hodell, D. A., Channell, J. E. T., Curtis, J. H., Romero, O. E. & Röhl, U. Onset  
600 of “Hudson strait” Heinrich events in the eastern North Atlantic at the end  
601 of the middle Pleistocene transition (~640 ka)?: Pleistocene Heinrich  
602 events. *Paleoceanography* **23**, <https://doi.org/10.1029/2008PA001591>  
603 (2008).

604 32 Kaufmann, G. & Dreybrodt, W. Stalagmite growth and palaeo-climate: an  
605 inverse approach. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* **224**, 529-545  
606 (2004).

607 33 Columbu, A. *et al.* A long continuous palaeoclimate-palaeoenvironmental  
608 record of the last glacial period from southern Italy and implications for  
609 the coexistence of Anatomically Modern Humans and Neanderthals.  
610 Preceedings of the European Geosciences Union (EGU) Conference. doi:  
611 <https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-egu2020-140> (2020)

612 34 Stewart, J. & Stringer, B. Human evolution out of Africa: the role of refugia  
613 and climate change. *Science* **335**, 1317-1321 (2012).

614 35 Ait Brahim, Y. *et al.* North Atlantic ice-rafting, ocean and atmospheric  
615 circulation during the Holocene: insights from Western Mediterranean  
616 speleothems. *Geophysical Research Letters* **46**,  
617 doi:10.1029/2019GL082405 (2019).

618 36 Sano, K. *et al.* The earliest evidence for mechanically delivered projectile  
619 weapons in Europe. *Nature Ecology & Evolution* **3**, 1409-1414 (2019).

620 37 Arrighi, S. *et al.* Backdating systematic shell ornament making in Europe  
621 to 45,000 years ago. *Archaeological and Anthropological Sciences* **12**, 59  
622 (2020).

623 38 Arrighi, S. *et al.* Bone tools, ornaments and other unusual objects during  
624 the Middle to Upper Palaeolithic transition in Italy. *Quaternary*  
625 *International* (2019).

626 39 Marciani, G. *et al.* Lithic techno-complexes in Italy from 50 to 39 thousand  
627 years BP: An overview of lithic technological changes across the Middle-  
628 Upper Palaeolithic boundary. *Quaternary International* (2019).

629 40 Drysdale, R. N. *et al.* Precise microsampling of poorly laminated  
630 speleothems for U-series dating. *Quaternary Geochronology* **14**, 38-47,  
631 doi:10.1016/j.quageo.2012.06.009 (2012).

632 41 Hellstrom, J. U-Th dating of speleothems with high initial  $^{230}\text{Th}$  using  
633 stratigraphical constraint. *Quaternary Geochronology* **1**, 289-295,  
634 doi:10.1016/j.quageo.2007.01.004 (2006).

635 42 Cheng, H. *et al.* Improvements in  $^{230}\text{Th}$  dating,  $^{230}\text{Th}$  and  $^{234}\text{U}$  half-life  
636 values, and U-Th isotopic measurements by multi-collector inductively  
637 coupled plasma mass spectrometry. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*  
638 **371-372**, 82-91, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2013.04.006 (2013).

639 43 Scholz, D. & Hoffmann, D. L. StalAge – An algorithm designed for  
640 construction of speleothem age models. *Quaternary Geochronology* **6**,  
641 369-382, doi:10.1016/j.quageo.2011.02.002 (2011).

642 44 Breitenbach, S. F. M. *et al.* COnstructing Proxy-Record Age models  
643 (COPRA). *Climate of the Past* **8**, 1765-1779 (2012).

644 45 Hendy, C. H. The isotopic geochemistry of speleothems-I. The calculation  
645 of the effects of different modes of formation on the isotopic composition  
646 of speleothems and their applicability as palaeoclimatic indicators.  
647 *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* **35**, 801-824 (1971).

648 46 Mickler, P. J., Stern, L. A. & Banner, J. L. Large kinetic isotope effects in  
 649 modern speleothems. *Geological Society of America Bulletin* **118**, 65-81  
 650 (2006).  
 651 47 Dreybrodt, W. & Scholz, D. Climatic dependence of stable carbon and  
 652 oxygen isotope signals recorded in speleothems: From soil water to  
 653 speleothem calcite. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* **75**, 734-752,  
 654 doi:10.1016/j.gca.2010.11.002 (2011).  
 655 48 Columbu, A., Sauro, F., Lundberg, J., Drysdale, R. & De Waele, J.  
 656 Palaeoenvironmental changes recorded by speleothems of the southern  
 657 Alps (Piani Eterni, Belluno, Italy) during four interglacial to glacial climate  
 658 transitions. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **197**, 319-335,  
 659 doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2018.08.006 (2018).  
 660 49 Columbu, A. *et al.* Early last glacial intra-interstadial climate variability  
 661 recorded in a Sardinian speleothem. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **169**,  
 662 391-397, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2017.05.007 (2017).  
 663 50 Bard, E. *et al.* Hydrological conditions over the western Mediterranean  
 664 basin during the deposition of the cold Sapropel 6 (ca. 175 Kyr BP). *Earth*  
 665 *and Planetary Science Letters* **202**, 481-494 (2002).  
 666 51 Kim, S.-T. & O'Neil, J. R. Equilibrium and nonequilibrium oxygen isotope  
 667 effects in synthetic carbonates. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* **61**,  
 668 3461-3475, doi:10.1016/s0016-7037(97)00169-5 (1997).  
 669 52 Tremaine, D. M., Froelich, P. N. & Wang, Y. Speleothem calcite formed in  
 670 situ: Modern calibration of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  paleoclimate proxies in a  
 671 continuously-monitored natural cave system. *Geochimica et*  
 672 *Cosmochimica Acta* **75**, 4929-4950 (2011).  
 673 53 Drysdale, R. N. *et al.* Stalagmite evidence for the precise timing of North  
 674 Atlantic cold events during the early last glacial. *Geology* **35**, 77-80,  
 675 doi:10.1130/g23161a.1 (2007).  
 676 54 Vanghi, V. *et al.* Climate variability on the Adriatic seaboard during the  
 677 last glacial inception and MIS 5c from Frassassi Cave stalagmite record.  
 678 *Quaternary Science Reviews* **201**, 349-361,  
 679 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2018.10.023 (2018).  
 680 55 Regattieri, E. *et al.* A MIS 9/MIS 8 speleothem record of hydrological  
 681 variability from Macedonia (F.Y.R.O.M.). *Global and Planetary Change* **162**,  
 682 39-52, doi:10.1016/j.gloplacha.2018.01.003 (2018).  
 683 56 Ford, D. & Williams, P. Karst geomorphology and hydrology. *John Wiley &*  
 684 *Sons, Chichester* (2007).  
 685 57 Bajo, P. *et al.* Stalagmite carbon isotopes and dead carbon proportion  
 686 (DCP) in a near-closed-system situation: An interplay between sulphuric  
 687 and carbonic acid dissolution. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* **210**, 208-  
 688 227, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2017.04.038 (2017).  
 689 58 Fairchild, I. J. & Treble, P. C. Trace elements in speleothems as recorders  
 690 of environmental change. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **28**, 449-468,  
 691 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2008.11.007 (2009).  
 692 59 Longinelli, A. & Selmo, E. Isotopic composition of precipitation in Italy: a  
 693 first overall map. *Journal of Hydrology* **270**, 75 - 88 (2003).  
 694 60 Dansgaard, W. Stable isotopes in precipitation. *Tellus* **16**, 436-468 (1964).  
 695 61 Lisiecki, L. E. & Raymo, M. E. A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally  
 696 distributed benthic  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  records. *Paleoceanography* **20**, 1-17 (2005).

697 62 Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Preto, N. & McDermott, F. Late Holocene annual  
698 growth in three Alpine stalagmites records the influence of solar activity  
699 and the North Atlantic Oscillation on winter climate. *Earth and Planetary*  
700 *Science Letters* **216**, 411-424, doi:10.1016/s0012-821x(03)00515-6  
701 (2003).

702 63 Johnston, V. E. *et al.* Evidence of thermophilisation and elevation-  
703 dependent warming during the Last Interglacial in the Italian Alps.  
704 *Scientific Reports* **8**, 2680, doi:10.1038/s41598-018-21027-3 (2018).

705 64 Belli, R. *et al.* Regional climate variability and ecosystem responses to the  
706 last deglaciation in the northern hemisphere from stable isotope data and  
707 calcite fabrics in two northern Adriatic stalagmites. *Quaternary Science*  
708 *Reviews* **72**, 146-158 (2013).

709 65 Pozzi, J. P. *et al.* U-Th dated speleothem recorded geomagnetic excursions  
710 in the Lower Brunhes. *Scientific Reports* **9**, 1114, doi:10.1038/s41598-  
711 018-38350-4 (2019).

712 66 Regattieri, E. *et al.* Holocene Critical Zone dynamics in an Alpine  
713 catchment inferred from a speleothem multiproxy record: disentangling  
714 climate and human influences. *Scientific Reports* **9**, doi:10.1038/s41598-  
715 019-53583-7 (2019).

716 67 Regattieri, E. *et al.* A continuous stable isotope record from the  
717 penultimate glacial maximum to the Last Interglacial (159–121ka) from  
718 Tana Che Urla Cave (Apuan Alps, central Italy). *Quaternary Research* **82**,  
719 450-461, doi:10.1016/j.yqres.2014.05.005 (2014).

720 68 Isola, I. *et al.* Speleothem U/Th age constraints for the Last Glacial  
721 conditions in the Apuan Alps, northwestern Italy. *Palaeogeography,*  
722 *Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **518**, 62-71,  
723 doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2019.01.001 (2019).

724 69 Columbu, A. *et al.* Late quaternary speleogenesis and landscape evolution  
725 in the northern Apennine evaporite areas. *Earth Surface Processes and*  
726 *Landforms* **42**, 1447-1459 (2017).

727 70 Frisia, S. *et al.* Holocene climate variability in Sicily from a discontinuous  
728 stalagmite record and the Mesolithic to Neolithic transition. *Quaternary*  
729 *Research* **66**, 388-400 (2006).

730 71 Francke, A. *et al.* Sedimentological processes and environmental  
731 variability at Lake Ohrid (Macedonia, Albania) between 637 ka and the  
732 present. *Biogeosciences* **13**, 1179-1196, doi:10.5194/bg-13-1179-2016  
733 (2016).

734 72 Moseley, G. E. *et al.* NALPS19: Sub-orbital scale climate variability  
735 recorded in Northern Alpine speleothems during the last glacial period.  
736 *Climate of the Past*, 29-50, doi:10.5194/cp-16-29-2020 (2020).  
737  
738

**Figure 1.** A) PC stalagmite, sampling information and age model (see methods for age model construction and Hendy test). B) Ages of published Italian stalagmites used for palaeoclimate reconstruction and those presented in this study, compared to interglacial versus glacial variation over the last ~500 ka (curves: Greenland ice core  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  (purple)<sup>15</sup> and Atlantic benthic foraminifera  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  (black)<sup>61</sup>. The background shows a map of Italy with the location of the studied cave (red star) and other published speleothem records. Ages are marked by dots; solid lines indicate continuous growth while dotted lines stand for discontinuous growth and/or poor chronological constraint. Only speleothems from Apulia (this study, red labels) continuously grew over the entire last glacial period (gray shade). Speleothems: PE (Piani Eterni karst system)<sup>48</sup>, ER (Ernesto Cave)<sup>62</sup>, CB (Cesare Battisti Cave)<sup>63</sup>, Sa (Savi Cave)<sup>64</sup>, Ba (Basura Cave)<sup>65</sup>, RM (Rio Martino Cave)<sup>66</sup>, TCU (Tana che Urla Cave)<sup>67</sup>, GDV (Grotta del Vento)<sup>68</sup>, Ren (Renella Cave)<sup>69</sup>, CC (Corchia Cave)<sup>53</sup>, Gypsum (Northern Italy Gypsum caves)<sup>69</sup>, Fr (Frasassi Cave)<sup>16,54</sup>, SA (Sant'Angelo Cave, this study), Za (Zaccaria Cave, this study), Tr (Trullo Cave, this study), PC (Pozzo Cucù Cave, this study), BMS (Bue Marino Cave)<sup>49</sup>, CA (Crovasa Azzurra Cave)<sup>27</sup>, Car (Carburangeli Cave)<sup>70</sup>.

**Figure 2.** PC  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  (top, red) and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  (bottom, blue) versus Greenland ice core  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  (middle, black<sup>15</sup>). Black numbers and bars refer to DO cycles<sup>25</sup>. The PC proxy record is correlated to NGRIP along stadial events (grey shading). Intermittent shading is used when correlation is ambiguous. Boxes on the bottom show MIS and H events, as well as the Neanderthal-MH transition in Apulia and MUPT in Europe. PC  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  curves also show age  $2\sigma$ -uncertainties (shaded horizontal bars).

**Figure 3.** PC  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  record (grey) compared to marine (a. GDEC-4-2<sup>30</sup>) and lacustrine (b. Monticchio Lake<sup>28</sup>; c. Tenaghi Philippon Lake<sup>29</sup>; d. Ohrid Lake<sup>71</sup>) archives, as well as circum-Mediterranean speleothems (e. Cueva Victoria  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , yellow line<sup>17</sup> (refer to black axis/numbers); Ejulve Cave  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ , purple line<sup>11</sup>; Buraca Gloriosa, pink line<sup>18</sup>; f. Sofular Cave  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , green line<sup>19</sup> (refer to black axis/numbers); Corchia Cave  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , orange dotted line<sup>53</sup>; Frasassi Cave (composite), orange line<sup>16</sup> g. Villars Cave  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , green line<sup>10</sup>; NALPS19 record  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , blue line<sup>72</sup>; h. Soreq cave  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , brown line<sup>19</sup>).