



ALMA MATER STUDIORUM
UNIVERSITÀ DI BOLOGNA

ARCHIVIO ISTITUZIONALE DELLA RICERCA

Alma Mater Studiorum Università di Bologna Archivio istituzionale della ricerca

Investigating the Origins of the Illustration of the Decretum Gratiani: Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque de l'Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer, 454

This is the final peer-reviewed author's accepted manuscript (postprint) of the following publication:

Published Version:

Gianluca del Monaco (2020). Investigating the Origins of the Illustration of the Decretum Gratiani: Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque de l'Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer, 454. RIVISTA DI STORIA DELLA MINIATURA, 24, 32-43.

Availability:

This version is available at: <https://hdl.handle.net/11585/786044> since: 2024-06-15

Published:

DOI: <http://doi.org/>

Terms of use:

Some rights reserved. The terms and conditions for the reuse of this version of the manuscript are specified in the publishing policy. For all terms of use and more information see the publisher's website.

This item was downloaded from IRIS Università di Bologna (<https://cris.unibo.it/>).
When citing, please refer to the published version.

(Article begins on next page)

Investigating the Origins of the Illustration of the *Decretum Gratiani*:

Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque de l'Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer, ms. 454¹

The *Decretum Gratiani*, or *Concordia discordantium canonum* according to its original title, was the first volume of the collection of ecclesiastical legal texts known as the *Corpus iuris canonici*, 'The Body of Canon Law', since its first printing in 1500 and used by the Roman Catholic Church until 1917². The volume was one of the most popular textbooks and reference works in medieval western Europe. The work was composed by an individual called Gratian, probably in Bologna, Italy, in the 1140s³. Shortly afterwards, it began to be illustrated⁴, giving birth to an outstanding corpus of illuminated manuscripts⁵. This article will examine one of the oldest illustrated copy of the *Decretum*, coming from the Benedictine abbey of Saint-Bertin in the North French town of Saint-Omer near the Channel, and now held in the local municipal library as ms. 454 (Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque de l'Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer, ms. 454). Short catalogue records of the manuscript have

¹ The article is a revised version of a paper presented at the 46th Saint Louis Conference on Manuscript Studies (Saint Louis University, Saint Louis, Missouri, 17-18 June 2019). I am most grateful to Susan L'Engle for organizing and chairing the conference. This research is part of a broader project on the origins of the illustration of the *Decretum Gratiani*, especially in Italy, assisted by a Getty/ACLS Postdoctoral Fellowship in the History of Art from the American Council of Learned Societies, generously supported by the Getty Foundation. I should thank Andrea Padovani and Kenneth Pennington for encouraging me to investigate this topic. I am also indebted to Robert Gibbs and Giovanna Murano for useful advice. These studies are involved in the activity of the international research team 'Ius Illuminatum'.
² For an overall survey: P. LANDAU, *Gratian and the Decretum Gratiani*, in *The History of Medieval Canon Law in the Classical Period, 1140–1234: From Gratian to the Decretals of Pope Gregory IX*, edited by W. Hartmann – K. Pennington, Washington, D.C., 2008, pp. 22-54.

³ There is much controversy about the stages of composition of the *Decretum* and especially the identity itself of Gratian. The question has recently been summarized and furtherly investigated by: A. WINROTH, *The Making of Gratian's Decretum*, Cambridge/New York 2000; G. MURANO, *Dalle scuole agli Studia: il Decretum Gratiani tra XII e XIII secolo*, in *Scriptoria e biblioteche nel Basso Medioevo (secoli XII-XV)*, Atti del LI Convegno storico internazionale (Todi, 12-15 ottobre 2014), Spoleto 2015, pp. 71-107; IDEM, *Graziano e il Decretum nel secolo XII*, 'Rivista Internazionale di Diritto Comune', 26 (2015), pp. 61-139.

⁴ Already one copy in two volumes of the so-called 'first recension', presenting the earliest version of the work, has three initials with single standing figures of bishops, one letter with a couple of spouses (Admont, Stiftsbibliothek, 23, folios 122r, 161r; Admont, Stiftsbibliothek, 43, folios 40r, 116v), and an 'arbor consanguinitatis' superimposed on an enthroned frontal bearded monarch (Admont 43, folio 342v). The manuscripts were made in the same Austrian Benedictine abbey. Paul BUBERL, *Die illuminierten Handschriften in der Steiermark I: Die Stiftsbibliotheken zu Admont und Vorau*, Leipzig 1911 (*Beschreibendes Verzeichnis der illuminierten Handschriften in Österreich*, 4), Nummern 14-15, pp. 46-47.

⁵ The classic work on the topic is: A. MELNIKAS, *The Corpus of the Miniatures in the Manuscripts of Decretum Gratiani*, Rome 1975, reviewed by: C. NORDENFALK, 'Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte', 43 (1980), pp. 318-337.

been written by Rudolf Weigand⁶, Joanna Fronska⁷ and Claudia Rabel⁸, while Giovanna Murano has already established that it was copied in Bologna⁹. A fully digitized version has recently been made accessible on the web¹⁰. However, the series of historiated letters accompanying the text, the richest, indeed, among the early visual tradition of the *Decretum*, has never been properly analyzed with regards to its iconography and style.

The manuscript consists of 321 parchment leaves; four parchment flyleaves at the beginning and four at the end are filled with later inscriptions. The folios are arranged into 8-leaf gatherings, except for gathering xx, made of ten leaves¹¹. One leaf is missing after folio 293v in gathering xxxvii, a significant detail I will get back to. As observed by Murano, the text is written in two columns in a ‘rotunda’¹², the Italian Gothic book script, later developed in Bologna in a version called ‘littera nova’, which became the typical script of Bolognese university books from the thirteenth century on¹³. The text of the *Decretum* starts at folio 12v and comprises three major parts, according to its definitive arrangement¹⁴. Part I deals with general issues and the ordination of clerics, and is divided into 101 distinctions (‘Distinctiones’). Part II consists of 36 ‘Causae’, or the fictive legal cases invented by Gratian to illustrate and solve the contradictions regarding a theme. Part III is the treatise *De consecratione* (‘On consecration’), entitled as Causa XXXVII in Saint-Omer 454, regarding the consecration of a church, sacraments and other liturgical matters. As in many other twelfth-century manuscripts of the *Decretum*, the work is prefaced by the so-called *Introductio* “*In prima parte*

⁶ R. WEIGAND, *Die Glossen zum Dekret Gratians: Studien zu den frühen Glossen und Glossenkompositionen*, Roma 1991, pp. 930-931.

⁷ <http://initiale.irht.cnrs.fr/codex/13637> (last access: 29/08/2019).

⁸ *Jeux de mains: Portraits de scribes dans les manuscrits de la Bibliothèque d'Agglomération de Saint-Omer*, catalogue de l'exposition (Saint-Omer, 11 septembre-9 décembre 2015), Saint-Omer 2015, notice 6 (C. Rabel).

⁹ MURANO, *Graziano e il Decretum* cit., p. 127.

¹⁰ [https://bibliotheque-numerique.bibliotheque-agglo-stomer.fr/viewer/18175/?offset=61 - page=1&viewer=thumb&o=&n=0&q=](https://bibliotheque-numerique.bibliotheque-agglo-stomer.fr/viewer/18175/?offset=61-page=1&viewer=thumb&o=&n=0&q=) (last access: 30/08/2019).

¹¹ The collation is: i-xix⁸, xx¹⁰, xxi-xxxvi⁸, xxxvii⁷ [of 8, lacking v (a leaf after folio 293v)], xxxviii-xl⁸.

¹² MURANO, *Graziano e il Decretum* cit., p. 127.

¹³ G. ORLANDELLI, ‘Littera nova’ e ‘Littera antiqua’ fra glossatori e umanisti, Bologna 1965 (Quaderni della Scuola di paleografia ed archivistica dell’Archivio di Stato di Bologna, 7); IDEM, *Il codice scolastico bolognese*, in O. CAPITANI (a cura di), *L’Università a Bologna: personaggi, momenti e luoghi dalle origini al XVI secolo*, Cinisello Balsamo (Milano) 1987, pp. 113-131; B. BISCHOFF, *Paleografia latina: Antichità e Medioevo*, a cura di G. P. MANTOVANI – S. ZAMPONI, Padova 1992, p. 189.

¹⁴ LANDAU, *Gratian and the Decretum* cit., pp. 35-38.

agitur” (folios 1-12), a summary of the contents left out in later copies. Weigand has identified the presence of a first layer of marginal and interlinear glosses¹⁵. The marginal glosses include glosses from the so-called ‘First Gloss Composition’, while the interlinear glosses are from the ‘Second Gloss Composition’, both originated in Bologna in the 1150s, according to Weigand¹⁶. The later standard commentary to the *Decretum*, the *glossa ordinaria* by Johannes Teutonicus, finished in 1217, has subsequently been added in the common layout for Bolognese academic manuscripts since the thirteenth century, named ‘glossa cum textu incluso’, where the text is surrounded by the gloss. Only folios 23v-32 show the revised recension of the *glossa ordinaria* by Bartholomaeus Brixiensis, composed between 1234 and 1241¹⁷.

Fronska has identified two fourteenth-century inscriptions on the verso of the second flyleaf at the end of the volume witnessing that the manuscript was already at the time in the library of the Benedictine monastery of Saint-Bertin¹⁸, situated just outside the walls of Saint-Omer. The interest of this important religious and cultural center for the *Decretum Gratiani* is proved also by other three early illuminated copies of the work held in the same collection: ms. 453, written in the *scriptorium* of Saint-Bertin and illuminated by the Master of the Zachary of Besançon (Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque de l’Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer, ms. 453), an artist operating at the abbey during the third quarter of the twelfth century¹⁹, ms. 476, probably written and illustrated in Paris no later than the beginning of the thirteenth century by a few illuminators working in the so-called ‘Channel Style’ (Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque de l’Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer, ms. 476)²⁰, flourishing

¹⁵ WEIGAND, *Die Glossen* cit., p. 930.

¹⁶ IDEM, *The Development of the Glossa ordinaria to Gratian’s Decretum*, in *The History of Medieval Canon Law in the Classical Period, 1140–1234: From Gratian to the Decretals of Pope Gregory IX*, edited by W. Hartmann – K. Pennington, Washington, D.C., 2008, pp. 55-97: 58-61.

¹⁷ On the *Glossa ordinaria* to the *Decretum*: *Ibidem*, pp. 82-95.

¹⁸ <http://initiale.irht.cnrs.fr/codex/13637> (last access: 29/08/2019).

¹⁹ *Jeux de mains* cit., notice 7 (J. Fronska). A fully digitized version is available at: <https://bibliotheque-numerique.bibliotheque-agglo-stomer.fr/viewer/18376/?offset=62 - page=1&viewer=thumb&o=bookmarks&n=0&q=> (last access: 30/08/2019).

²⁰ *Jeux de mains* cit., notice 10 (D. Stutzmann). The manuscript has been fully digitized: <https://bibliotheque-numerique.bibliotheque-agglo-stomer.fr/viewer/18265/?offset=56 - page=1&viewer=thumb&o=bookmarks&n=0&q=> (last access: 30/08/2019).

between northern France and southern England in the late twelfth century²¹, and ms. 191, perhaps copied in Bologna and decorated by a North Italian artist with ornamental motifs imitating the Channel Style (Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque de l'Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer, ms. 191)²². Other inscriptions scattered in the flyleaves allow to track the presence of Saint-Omer 454 at Saint-Bertin until the eighteenth century. The manuscript entered the civic library of Saint-Omer together with the rest of Saint-Bertin library after the suppression of the abbey during the French Revolution.

The penwork decoration consists of display capitals in red and blue for the openings of each section of the introductory summary and each *Causa*, red or blue initials I with contrasting pen flourishing pattern for each section of the summary, initials in red and blue alternately in the text and, last but not least, at the beginning of each section of the summary and each *Causa*, pen flourishing sprays with heads of barley reaching into the bas-de-page, usually dubbed by scholars as 'jeux-de-plume' and common in twelfth-century legal manuscripts produced in Bologna. Indeed, what strikes most is the illuminated decoration including the table of Greek and Roman numerals at *Distinctio LXXII* (fol. 66r) (fig. 8)²³ and, above all, 39 historiated initials illustrating the opening of the summary (fol. 1r) (fig. 1), *Distinctio I* (folio 12v) (pl.), each *Causa*²⁴ and the treatise *De consecratione* (fol. 297r) (fig. 2). This is the most complete known series of illustrations for an early *Decretum*. Unlike the consistent pictorial programs with two- and one-column frontispieces and large opening at the

²¹ C. R. DODWELL, *The Canterbury School of Illumination: 1066-1200*, Cambridge (UK), pp. 98-113; R. SCHILLING, *The Decretum Gratiani Formerly in the C. W. Dyson Perrins Collection*, "The Journal of the British Archaeological Association", 26 (1963), pp. 27-39; W. CAHN, *A Twelfth-Century Decretum Fragment from Pontigny*, 'The Bulletin of The Cleveland Museum of Art', 62 (1975), pp. 47-59; IDEM, *St. Albans and the Channel Style in England*, in *The Year 1200: A Symposium, Conference proceedings* (New York, 1970), New York 1975, pp. 187-230; C. F. R. DE HAMEL, *Glossed Books of the Bible and the Origins of the Paris Booktrade*, Woodbridge 1984, pp. 38-54; W. CAHN, *Romanesque Manuscripts: The Twelfth Century*, London 1996, catalogue no. 89, pp. 110-111; S. L'ENGLE – R. GIBBS, *Illuminating the Law: Legal Manuscripts in Cambridge Collections*, exhibition catalogue (Cambridge, 3 November-16 December 2001), London/Turnhout 2001, Cat. No. 3, pp. 114-122 (R. Gibbs); C. GASTGEBER, *Literatur und Wissenschaft im Spiegel der Handschriftlichen Überlieferung*, in *Geschichte der Buchkultur*, 4/1, *Romanik [I]*, Herausgegeben von A. Fingernagel, Graz 2007, pp. 145-288: 159-161.

²² *Jeux de mains* cit., notice 17 (C. Rabel – P. Stirnemann). For a fully digitized version: <https://bibliotheque-numerique.bibliotheque-agglo-stomer.fr/viewer/18174/?offset=58 - page=1&viewer=thumb&o=bookmarks&n=0&q=> (last access: 30/08/2019).

²³ This is quite a common feature of early decorated *Decreta* and its presence was probably due to the use in the redaction of 'litterae formatae', recommendation letters carried by clerics in their journeys from a diocese to another. The letters were authenticated by a ciphered formula in Greek letters and numerals. The *Decretum* deals with the 'litterae formatae' in *Distinctio LXXIII*. CAHN, *A Twelfth-Century Decretum* cit., pp. 54-55.

²⁴ Folios 85v, 103v, 118r, 124v, 126v, 128r, 130v, 136r, 138v, 140v, 143v, 153r, 163r, 166v, 169r, 173r, 184r, 187r, 189v, 190v, 192v, 194v, 201v, 221r, 231r, 234r, 240r, 246v, 250r, 251r, 254r, 255v, 263r, 289v, 290v, 296r.

beginning of the main divisions of the text, which are typical of late-thirteenth- and fourteenth-century copies, the early illustrated manuscripts of Gratian's text present historiated or anthropomorphic capital letters related to the text opening book divisions with different extensions of the program. In fact, all known manuscripts show at least a few spaces left blank for initials never executed, historiated initials realized in later phases, decorated initials or letters with figures unrelated to the text. Surprisingly, Saint-Omer 454 does not have a very common feature of the early illustrated *Decreta*, the 'arbores affinitatis et consanguinitatis', the trees of affinity and consanguinity, consisting of diagrams intended to count the highest number of kinship degrees that prevented the eligibility of marriage partners, the latter superimposed onto a standing, frontal, male figure, the former headed by a married couple²⁵. These diagrams were usually inserted into Causa XXXV at the end of Quaestio V, dealing with the correct manner of counting the degrees of interrelationship. Indeed, I have found out that a leaf is lacking in gathering xxxvii, now made of seven folios, between folio 293v, where Quaestio V interrupts abruptly at the words "Rursus filius meus", and 294, opening with Gratian's conclusion of the Quaestio: "De gradibus consanguinitatis ut affinitatis". Therefore, it is possible to argue that at least the 'arbor consanguinitatis' or the two 'arbores' combined together were originally on one side of the lost leaf, the lacking text passage on the other.

The illustrations of Saint-Omer 454 are extremely significant also for their rich narrative, if one compares them to even the most fully historiated examples among the early Italian *Decreta*, as ms. 354 of Amiens municipal library (Amiens, Bibliothèques d'Amiens Métropole, ms. 354) (fig. 3)²⁶, ms. 341 of the Bibliothèque Sainte-Geneviève in Paris (Paris, Bibliothèque Sainte-Geneviève, ms. 341)²⁷ and Plut.4 sin.1 in the Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana in Florence (Firenze, Biblioteca

²⁵ On the 'arbores': H. SCHADT, *Die Darstellungen der Arbores Consanguinitatis und der Arbores Affinitatis: Bildschemata in juristischen Handschriften*, Tübingen 1982.

²⁶ On this manuscript see below in the article.

²⁷ The manuscript has been considered as copied in Bologna or in Central Italy. It shows 36 illuminated initials, among which 33 are historiated. The initials for the opening of Distinctio I and Causa X have been excised. The artist is the Master of the Avila Bible, probably trained in Rome and active especially in Tuscany during the second quarter of the twelfth century. WEIGAND, *Die Glossen* cit., pp. 904-905; G. ZANICHELLI, *Thesauris armarii aggregatus: il codice miniato a Bologna tra XI e XII secolo*, in *La cattedrale scolpita: Il romanico in San Pietro a Bologna*, catalogo della mostra (Bologna, 13 dicembre 2003-12 aprile 2004), a cura di M. Medica – S. Battistini, Ferrara 2003, pp. 147-184: 172-174; G. OROFINO, *Una Bibbia atlantica tra Italia e Spagna e i suoi 'maestri'*, in *Forme e Storia: Scritti di arte medievale e*

Medicea Laurenziana, Plut.4 sin.1)²⁸. Initials with figures related to the text in these manuscripts present just one or few characters. On the contrary, the historiated initials of the *Decretum* in Saint-Omer generally show more complex scenes, particularly for the fictive legal cases of Part II (figs 5-6), and for *De consecratione* (fig. 2). In these regards, they are closer to a group of North French and South English Channel Style *Decreta* first grouped by Rosy Schilling²⁹. Robert Gibbs declared that an equivalent program of illustration should have been elaborated also in Bologna, where the *Decretum* was originally composed and studied³⁰. Saint-Omer MS 454 appears to be a concrete evidence of this assumption.

The iconography of some initials deserves particular attention. First of all, the letter I opening the introductory summary ‘In prima parte agitur’ (fol. 1r) (fig. 1) depicts a personification of Justice, who pierces a dragon, symbolizing evil, with a staff surmounted by scales. The figure of Justice plainly refers to the “iustitia” mentioned at the beginning of the summary as one of the topic of the first part of the *Decretum*: “In prima parte agitur de iustitia naturali et positiva [...]”. The same subject is depicted in another contemporary Bolognese *Decretum* in Munich (München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 4505, fol. 1v)³¹, where a young crowned woman holds a scroll inscribed with

moderna per Francesco Gandolfo, Roma 2011, pp. 211-222: 214; G. Z. ZANICHELLI, *Osculetur me osculo oris sui: immagini del matrimonio nel XII secolo*, in “*Per una severa maestra*”: dono a Daniela Romagnoli, Fidenza 2014, pp. 135-147: 137-141; IDEM, *La trasformazione del libro di lusso fra XII e XIII secolo*, in *Scriptoria e biblioteche nel Basso Medioevo (secoli XII-XV)*, Atti del LI Convegno storico internazionale (Todi, 12-15 ottobre 2014), Spoleto 2015 (Atti dei Convegni del Centro italiano di studi sul basso medioevo - Accademia tudertina, Nuova serie, 28), pp. 285-300: 296; MURANO, *Graziano e il Decretum* cit., p. 114. A catalogue entry is available online: <http://www.calames.abes.fr/pub/bsg.aspx-details?id=BSGA11048> (last access: 02/09/2019).

²⁸ This manuscript has been presumably copied in Bologna. It presents 35 historiated initials, four inhabited, zoomorphic and decorated letters, and an ‘arbor consanguinitatis’ with a male bearded sovereign (folio 280r). Only two initials have been colored in the first phase of decoration, three has been completed afterwards and the rest of the initials and the ‘arbor’ have been left at the stage of drawings. The space for one initial has been left blank (fol. 116v). The artist who drew the initials and colored two of them has been connected to twelfth-century illumination in Lucca by Sonia Chiodo. E. B. GARRISON, *Twelfth-Century Initial Styles of Central Italy: Indices for the Dating of Manuscripts: Part II. Materials (Continued): Supplement II (Continued)*, in E. B. GARRISON, *Studies in the History of Mediaeval Italian Painting*, 4/3-4, Florence 1962, pp. 277-376: 337; WEIGAND, *Die Glossen* cit., pp. 746-748; ZANICHELLI, *Osculetur* cit., pp. 137-139, 141-142; MURANO, *Graziano e il Decretum* cit., p. 126; S. CHIODO, *Dalla biblioteca dei Francescani di Santa Croce a Firenze: un Decretum Gratiani del XII secolo*, in *Il libro miniato e il suo committente: Per la ricostruzione delle biblioteche ecclesiastiche del Medioevo italiano (secoli XI-XIV)*, a cura di T. D’Urso – A. Perriccioli Saggese – G. Z. Zanichelli, Padova 2016 (Biblioteca di arte, 11), pp. 387-406. The codex has been fully digitized: <http://mss.bmlonline.it/s.aspx?Id=AWOMTdSiI1A4r7GxMWg-&c=Gratiani Decretum - /book> (last access: 02/09/2019).

²⁹ SCHILLING, *The Decretum Gratiani* cit.

³⁰ *Illuminating the Law* cit., pp. 114-115 (R. Gibbs).

³¹ The manuscript shows just one anthropomorphic initial related to the text at the opening of the introductory summary (fol. 1v), one historiated letter at the beginning of *Distinctio I* (fol. 2r), the table of Greek and Roman numerals (fol. 57v),

the definition of justice from Justinian's *Institutiones*: "Iustitia est constans et perpetua voluntas suum cuique tribuens"³². Other *Decreta* of Italian origin present a more generic allusion to the authority presiding the exercise of justice: a sovereign (Troyes, Médiathèque du Grand Troyes, Ms 60, fol. 1r)³³, a bishop (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, NAL 1576, fol. 1r)³⁴ or Christ (Kraków, Biblioteka Jagiellońska, BJ Rkp. 356 IV, fol. 1v)³⁵. While scales are quite common at this time as an

and the 'arbor consanguinitatis' with a male bearded monarch (fol. 296). The spaces for the other initial letters have been left blank. The decoration has been iconographically and stylistically connected to a group of other early Italian *Decreta*, such as those in Bamberg (Bamberg, Staatsbibliothek Bamberg, Msc.Can.14), at Sidney Sussex in Cambridge (Cambridge, Sidney Sussex College, MS 101), in Munich (München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 4505), in Venice [Venezia, Biblioteca Nazionale, Lat. IV, 117 (=2435)], and Vercelli (Vercelli, Biblioteca Capitolare, cod. XXV), the last two assigned by Murano (*Graziano e il Decretum* cit., pp. 122-123, 126) to Bologna on paleographical grounds. Along with Nordenfalk, Silvia Bosi maintained that the artists were Bolognese, whereas Giusi Zanichelli has more recently connected the figure style to workshops active across the English Channel, but decorating these copies of the *Decretum* in Bologna. Indeed, they appear to be closer to Emilian illuminations, as those in a fragmentary Missal from the cathedral of Modena (Modena, Archivio Storico Diocesano di Modena-Nonantola, O.I.8). NORDENFALK, cit., p. 325; *Duecento: Forme e colori del Medioevo a Bologna*, catalogo della mostra (Bologna, 15 aprile-16 luglio 2000), a cura di M. Medica, Venezia 2000, scheda 15, pp. 57-59 (S. Bosi): 59; ZANICHELLI, *Thesauris* cit., pp. 175, 177; *Illuminating the Law* cit., Cat. No. 1, pp. 105-110 (R. Gibbs): 107, 109-110; R. GIBBS, *The Bratislava Gratian and its Position in the Tree of Trees of Consanguinity*, 'Ars' 42 (2009), pp. 168-180: 174, 177-178; U. BAUER-EBERHARDT, *Die illuminierten Handschriften italienischer Herkunft in der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek*, 1, *Vom 10. bis zur Mitte des 14. Jahrhunderts*, München 2011, scheda 34, pp. 40-41. The microfilm of the Clm 4505 has been digitized in full: <http://daten.digital-sammlungen.de/~db/0004/bsb00041810/images/> (last access: 24/09/2019). For the Missal O.I.8: A. CONTI, *Miniature romaniche per il duomo di Modena*, in *Lanfranco e Wiligelmo: Il Duomo di Modena*, catalogo della mostra (Modena-Nonantola, 1984-1985), Modena 1984, pp. 521-541: scheda M11, p. 538; *Duecento* cit., scheda 37, pp. 162-166 (G.Z. Zanichelli): 165.

³² *Inst. Iust.* 1, 1.

³³ The manuscript presents four historiated initials, three anthropomorphic letters related to the text, as well as 28 anthropomorphic, zoomorphic and decorated letters without a relation to the text. Anthropomorphic and zoomorphic initials adorn the folios containing the introductory summary. The bidimensional schematism of the figure style resembles the first illuminator of the so-called Countess Matilda Evangelistary (Nonantola, Museo Benedetto e Diocesano d'Arte Sacra), probably dating to the end of the eleventh century. It thus witnesses to the continuity of this style in the region throughout the second half of the twelfth century. NORDENFALK, cit., p. 324; GIBBS, *The Bratislava Gratian* cit., pp. 170 nota 8, 175; ZANICHELLI, *La trasformazione* cit., p. 295. I will furtherly discuss upon the Matilda Evangelistary below in the article.

³⁴ The introductory summary and the first part of the *Decretum* were written in Emilia in the late twelfth century in the first 128 folia of the volume. Other sections of the text were added in France in the following century. The early section presents one anthropomorphic letter related to the text at the opening of the introductory summary (fol. 1r) and one historiated initial at the beginning of Distinctio I (fol. 20r), while the summary has several anthropomorphic, zoomorphic and decorated initials. Scholars observed Tuscan features in the style of the illuminations, although they regarded them as presumably Bolognese. Actually, I think that the artist shows links to contemporary Florentine manuscript painting, for instance a Passionary at the Laurenziana (Firenze, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, Conv.Soppr.302). F. AVRIL – Y. ZALUSKA, *Manuscrits enluminés d'origine italienne*, 1, *VIe-XIIe siècles*, Paris 1980, scheda 99, p. 58; NORDENFALK, cit., p. 327; M. MEDICA, *La città dei libri e dei miniatori*, in *Duecento: Forme e colori del Medioevo a Bologna*, catalogo della mostra (Bologna, 15 aprile-16 luglio 2000), a cura di M. Medica, Venezia 2000, pp. 109-140: 110, 112; MURANO, *Graziano e il Decretum* cit., p. 63 nota 10, 106. The microfilm is available online at: <https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b10036669f1.item> (last access: 25/09/2019). On the Passionary of the Laurenziana: E. B. GARRISON, *Twelfth-Century Initial Styles of Central Italy: Indices for the Dating of Manuscripts: Part II. Materials* (Continued): *Supplement*, in E. B. GARRISON, *Studies in the History of Mediaeval Italian Painting*, 3/2, Florence 1957, pp. 119-169: 156-159; M. BOSKOVITS, *The Origins of Florentine Painting, 1100-1270*, Florence 1993 (A Critical and Historical Corpus of Florentine Painting, 1/1), p. 25.

³⁵ This manuscript has just two historiated letters at the beginning of the introductory summary (fol. 1v) and Distinctio I (fol. 12r), whereas the rest of the main divisions of the *Decretum* is enriched by decorated initials. The artist has convincingly been connected to the Byzantinizing illumination in Pisa related to the Bible of Calci [Calci (Pisa), Museo

attribute of Justice, I have found no other examples of the virtue piercing a dragon, an iconography presumably derived from images of the *Archangel Michael transfixing Satan*³⁶.

The initial H of Part I, opening with the words “Humanum genus duobus regitur. videlicet iure naturali et moribus.” (fol. 12v) (pl.), is painted with the ecclesiastical and secular rulers, a bishop, maybe the pope, and a monarch. Above, a bust of Christ hands to them the symbols of their powers, a key and a scepter. The illustration of the initial H at the beginning of the *Decretum* with ecclesiastical and secular rulers, paired as a prelate and a monarch, is quite common in twelfth-century manuscripts decorated by Italian illuminators. Alfons Stickler correctly realized that the textual source for this iconography was probably the tenth chapter of *Distinctio XCVI* of the *Decretum*, i.e. a letter by the late-fifth-century pope Gelasius I (491-496) stating that our world is ruled by the authority of popes and the power of kings³⁷. From the beginning the decretists reconciled this very passage with the debut of *Distinctio I* in marginal glosses and commentaries. They asserted that natural law (‘*ius naturalis*’), interpreted as divine law, and the customs (‘*mores*’), explained as human law, regulating mankind, are the tools through which popes and kings respectively exercise their authority. For instance, I found a mention of the Gelasian passage in the glosses to the opening of Part I in an Italian *Decretum* in Florence (Firenze, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale di Firenze, Conv. Soppr. A. II.376, fol. 1v)³⁸, which have been attributed by Weigand to the First or the Third Gloss

Nazionale della Certosa Monumentale di Calci], begun in 1168. GARRISON, *Twelfth-Century Initial Styles* cit., pp. 343-344; GIBBS, *The Bratislava Gratian* cit., p. 170 nota 7. On the Calci Bible, recently: *La Bibbia di Calci: Un capolavoro della miniatura romanica in Italia*, a cura di S. Russo, Pisa 2014.

³⁶ On the iconography of Justice: P. RÉFICE, *Giustizia*, in *Enciclopedia dell’Arte Medievale*, 7, Roma 1996, pp. 1-10.

³⁷ A.M. STICKLER, *Ursprung und gegenseitiges Verhältnis der beiden Gewalten nach den Miniaturen des gratianischen Dekrets*, ‘*Studia Gratiana*’ 20 (1976), pp. 341-59: 343-346. The Gelasian passage reads as follows: “Duo sunt quippe, Imperator auguste, quibus principaliter hic mundus regitur: auctoritas sacra Pontificum, et regalis potestas”. Gratiani, E. Friedberg, *Corpus Iuris Canonici*, 1, *Decretum Magistri Gratiani*, Graz 1959, col. 340 (Dist. XCVI, cap. X).

³⁸ “Inf. D. xxvi [sic: probably a mistake for “xcvi”] Duo”. The manuscript has been connected to Central Italy, Florence or Rome, on paleographical grounds. It has only one fully executed historiated initial at the opening of *Distinctio I* with the iconography of *Christ enthroned* (fol. 1v), quite unique for this text passage. There are one historiated letter just drawn at *Causa XVII* (fol. 185v) and 27 inhabited, anthropomorphic, zoomorphic or decorated letters only drawn or partially colored. The spaces for the other initials have been left blank. The style of the illumination has correctly been regarded as close to late geometrical production in Florence. E. B. GARRISON, *Twelfth-Century Initial Styles of Central Italy: Indices for the Dating of Manuscripts: Part II. Materials* (Continued), in E. B. GARRISON, *Studies in the History of Mediaeval Italian Painting*, 3/1, Florence 1957, pp. 33-81: 64; K. BERG, *Studies in Tuscan Twelfth-Century Illumination*, Oslo 1968, pp. 174, catalogue entry no. 101, p. 282; *Codici miniati benedettini*, catalogo della mostra (Firenze, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale di Firenze, 1982), a cura di A. Monti Giammarinaro, Firenze 1982, scheda 6, pp. 24-25 (A. Di Domenico); A. DI DOMENICO, *Alcuni codici miniati romanici nel fondo Conventi Soppressi della Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale di Firenze*, ‘*Miniatura*’ 3/4 (1990-1991), pp. 51-62: 56, 58-59; MURANO, *Graziano e il Decretum* cit., p. 114.

Composition, dated to around 1150 and 1160 respectively³⁹. The common commentary of the relation between the two passages is already in the *Summa*, or general commentary, on the *Decretum* by Stephen of Tournai⁴⁰, written probably about 1165-1167⁴¹.

Early Italian examples of the composition normally present the two rulers paired in full- or bust-length. Two manuscripts in Arras (Arras, Mediathèque de l'Abbaye Saint-Vaast, Ms 585, fol. 6r)⁴² and Bratislava (Bratislava, Slovenský národný archív, 14, p. 3)⁴³ show the two figures holding together a scepter or a Byzantine standard, a 'labaros'. Carl Nordenfalk and, more recently, Robert Gibbs observed that this depiction was probably inspired by the representations of co-rulers on earlier Byzantine coins⁴⁴. The pope and the king are painted as paired full-length figures in a closer manner to Saint-Omer 454 in the aforementioned Italian *Decreta* of Amiens (fig. 3) and Munich. However, the illustration in the Saint-Omer *Decretum* differs for the bust of Christ handing the symbols of ecclesiastical and secular powers, almost anticipating the frontispieces of late-thirteenth- and fourteenth-century Bolognese *Decreta* depicting the *Distribution of Powers*⁴⁵. The presence of the

³⁹ WEIGAND, *The Development* cit., pp. 58-59, 61.

⁴⁰ "Quidam statim quasi in foribus huius operis signant contra j. D. 96. cap. Duo sunt. Ibi dicitur, quia haec duo sunt, quibus mundus regitur, scilicet sacerdotium et regnum; sed idem est. Nam ab eis regitur sed his, i. e. per hoc, ut intelligas, sacerdotium per ius naturale, i. e. divinum, mundum regere, et regnum per mores, i. e. per ius gentium et civile idem facere." Stephani Tornacensis, J.F. von Schulte, *Die Summa über das Decretum Gratiani*, Darmstadt 1965, p. 8 (Dist. I).

⁴¹ K. Pennington, in K. PENNINGTON – W.P. MÜLLER, *The Decretists: The Italian School*, in *The History of Medieval Canon Law in the Classical Period, 1140–1234: From Gratian to the Decretals of Pope Gregory IX*, edited by W. Hartmann – K. Pennington, Washington, D.C., 2008, pp. 121-173: 136-138.

⁴² The volume shows 11 historiated initials and four anthropomorphic opening letters with figures related to the text. It has been connected to Bologna on stylistic grounds and regarded among the earliest surviving copies of the *Decretum* illustrated in the Emilian city. Gibbs has recently identified two different illuminators, the first one working also in the *Decretum* of Bratislava. The second artist is closer to the style of the above mentioned *Decretum* of Troyes. NORDENFALK cit., p. 324; GIBBS, *The Bratislava Gratian* cit., pp. 168-172, 174-175.

⁴³ The manuscript has been written in a Bolognese 'rotunda'. It presents only one anthropomorphic initial related to the text at the opening of *Distinctio I* (p. 3), two historiated initials at the beginning of *Causa I* (p. 126) and *Causa XXVII* (p. 401), two decorated letters (pp. 263, 269), and an 'arbor consanguinitatis' with a male bearded monarch (p. 515), whereas the spaces for the other initials have been left blank. Already attributed to Bologna, the illuminations have been considered by Gibbs as made by the same workshop of Arras 585. NORDENFALK cit., p. 324; GIBBS, *The Bratislava Gratian* cit.; MURANO, *Graziano e il Decretum* cit., pp. 107 nota 156, 127.

⁴⁴ NORDENFALK cit., p. 324; GIBBS, *The Bratislava Gratian* cit., pp. 168-170.

⁴⁵ MELNIKAS, *The Corpus* cit., pp. 29-53; R. GIBBS, *The Development of the Illustration of Legal Manuscripts by Bolognese Illuminators between 1241 and 1298*, in *Juristische Buchproduktion im Mittelalter*, Herausgegeben von V. Colli, Frankfurt am Main 2002 (Studien zur Europäischen Rechtsgeschichte, 155), pp. 173-218: 210-211; G. DEL MONACO, *L'Illustratore e la miniatura nei manoscritti universitari bolognesi del Trecento*, Bologna 2018 (DAR, 1), pp. 104-106. For a pioneering broad treatment of this iconographic theme between the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, including a consideration of the pivotal role of the early illustrated *Decreta*: W. CAHN, *The Tympanum of the Portal of Saint-Anne at Notre Dame de Paris and the Iconography of the Division of the Powers in the Early Middle Ages*, 'Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes' 32 (1969), pp. 55-72.

bust of Christ above the two rulers is also in another early Italian *Decretum* in the library of Beaune (Beaune, Bibliothèque municipale Gaspard Monge, ms 5, fol. 4r), decorated by a Byzantinizing artist, convincingly considered by Gibbs as near to the Pisan illuminators of the Bible of Calci [Calci (Pisa), Museo Nazionale della Certosa Monumentale di Calci], started in 1168, whereas he had been previously regarded as Sicilian by Hermann Schadt⁴⁶. It is noteworthy that, around the same years, the introduction to the aforementioned *Summa* of Stephen of Tournai compared the Church to a city consisting in two orders, the clerics and the laics, two powers, the sacerdotal and the royal, and two jurisdictions, divine and human laws, but one same king, Christ⁴⁷. As for visual sources, it can be argued that also the insertion of Christ may depend on Byzantine coins portraying two co-rulers on one side and a bust of Christ Pantocrator as the grantor of their power on the other⁴⁸. It should be added that a coinage with a close imagery was struck in the West by Roger II, King of Sicily, between 1140 and 1154⁴⁹. I think that the Christ handing a key and a scepter in Saint-Omer may be an update of the iconography visible in the Beaune manuscript through another similar Byzantine composition, the celestial coronation of co-rulers, as for instance in the Gospel Book of John II Comnenos (Città del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Urb.gr.2, fol. 19v) of about 1133⁵⁰, or the imperial couple, as in the enamel on the top of the Khakhuli Triptych in the Museum of Tbilisi, Georgia (ca.

⁴⁶ The manuscript presents two historiated initials at the opening of *Distinctio I* (fol. 4r) and *Causa I* (fol. 75v), a table of Greek and Roman numerals (fol. 57r) and two versions of the ‘arbor consanguinitatis’ with a male bearded monarch (fol. 321v) and a young beardless sovereign (fol. 322r) respectively. The spaces for the other initials have been left blank. Schadt attributed the manuscript to Norman Sicily due to the strong Byzantine appearance of the illuminations, especially the ‘arbores’. However, Gibbs has more persuasively compared the style of the Beaune artist to the masters of the Calci Bible. SCHADT, *Die Darstellungen* cit., p. 48 nota 153; GIBBS, *The Bratislava Gratian* cit., p. 177 e nota 17; MURANO, *Graziano e il Decretum* cit., p. 70 nota 37, 83-84. The volume is available in full at the address: <https://bvmm.irht.cnrs.fr/mirador/index.php?manifest=https://bvmm.irht.cnrs.fr/iiif/23044/manifest> (last access: 30/09/2019).

⁴⁷ “In eadem civitate sub eodem rege duo populi sunt, et secundum duos populos duae vitae, secundum duas vitas duo principatus, secundum duos principatus duplex iurisdictionis ordo procedit. Civitas ecclesia; civitatis rex Christus; duo populi duo in ecclesia ordines: clericorum et laicorum; duae vitae: spiritualis et carnalis; duo principatus: sacerdotium et regnum; duplex iurdictio: divinum ius et humanum.” Stephani, *Die Summa* cit., p. 1 (Introductio). Of course, the statement that Christ was the ultimate grantor of both supreme earthly powers dated from centuries before. MELNIKAS, *The Corpus* cit., pp. 29-41. For an updated discussion of the topic: *Cristo e il potere. Teologia, antropologia e politica*, a cura di L. Andreani – A. Paravicini Bagliani, Firenze 2017 (MediEVI, 18).

⁴⁸ For instance, the Histamenon of Basilus II and Constantine VIII (1005?). A. TORNO GINNASI, *Incoronazione celeste nel mondo bizantino: politica, cerimoniale, numismatica e arti figurative*, Oxford 2014, p. 107.

⁴⁹ P. GRIERSON – L. TRAVAINI, *Medieval European Coinage with a Catalogue of the Coins in the Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge, 14, Italy (III): South Italy, Sicily, Sardinia*, Cambridge 1998, pp. 120-122.

⁵⁰ Where a full-page miniature depicts *The Celestial Coronation of John II and Alexios Comnenos*. TORNO GINNASI, *Incoronazione* cit., pp. 147-148.

1071)⁵¹. Furthermore, a similar depiction of the *Distribution of Powers* was present in the papal palace of the Lateran in Rome since around 799. In the right corner of the apsidal arch of the Triclinium of Leo III a mosaic showed Saint Peter enthroned giving a pallium to the pope and a banner to Charlemagne. Today, one can see the eighteenth-century copy of the mosaics, but earlier recordings of the original are preserved. An even closer composition is now visible on the left corner with Christ enthroned handing a pair of keys to Saint Peter and a banner to Constantine, but it was already lost at the time when the whole decoration was restored in 1625. Therefore, it is not possible to establish what it actually represented⁵².

A bust-length Christ holding a cross on a staff and sending an angel was depicted above the scene representing a bishop consecrating an altar in the initial D opening the treatise *De consecratione* (fol. 297r) (fig. 2), i.e. the third and last part of the *Decretum*. Of course, the altar consecration is a proper illustration of the first words of the treatise, “De ecclesiarum consecratione”, “On the consecration of churches”, and is depicted in the above mentioned Laurenziana *Decretum* too (fol. 283v). The presence of Christ and the angel arguably refers to a prayer pronounced by the priest while consecrating the Host: “Omnipotens Deus, iube hoc perferri per manum sancti angeli tui, in sublime altare tuum”⁵³. It is significant that this invocation is mentioned by the decretist Simon of Bisignano in his *Summa* on the *Decretum*, finished in Bologna between 1177 and 1179⁵⁴, with regards to the mass and the consecration of the Host as the Body of Christ, while commenting upon the beginning of the *De consecratione*⁵⁵.

To conclude this paper, I will discuss about the style of this exceptionally rich visual program among the early Italian illustrated *Decreta*, in order to determine its chronology and creation place.

⁵¹ Depicting *The Celestial Coronation of Michael VII and Mary of Alania*. *Ibidem*, pp. 126-129.

⁵² M. ANDALORO, *La pittura medievale a Roma, 312 - 1431: Atlante, percorsi visivi*, 1, *Suburbio, Vaticano, Rione Monti*, Milano 2006, scheda 19, pp. 217-220 (F.R. Moretti).

⁵³ “Almighty God, command that these gifts be borne by the hands of your holy Angel to your altar on high”.

⁵⁴ Pennington, in PENNINGTON – MÜLLER, *The Decretists* cit., p. 140.

⁵⁵ “Missa uero dicitur uel quia missa est ad Deum hostia, unde dicitur: ‘missa est’, idest fideles sequimini hostiam que missa est ad celestia, tendentes post eam. Vel dicitur missa quia missus celestis uenit ad consecrandum Dominicum corpus per quem ad altare celeste defertur hostia iuxta uocem sacerdotis dicentis: ‘Omnipotens Deus, iube hoc perferri per manum sancti angeli tui, in sublime altare tuum’”. Simonis Bisinianensis, Petrus V. Aimone, *Summa in Decretum Simonis Bisinianensis*, Fribourg 2007, p. 499 (Pars III De consecratione, Distinctio I, 37-42).

Firstly, it is possible to remark that the initials opening the introductory summary (fol. 1r) (fig. 1), *Distinctio I* (fol. 12v) (pl.), *Causae XXVIII* (fol. 246v), *XXIX* (fol. 250r), *XXXIV-XXXVI* (fols. 289v, 290v, 296r) (fig. 4) are distinguished for an overall higher quality and the use of ‘verdaccio’ to render the flesh tone. These traits may suggest the hand of an artist of prominent workmanship, whereas all the other initials were presumably created by less skilled collaborators under his direction (figs 2, 5-6).

The ornamental motifs of the H at the beginning of *Distinctio I* show the free elaboration of Central Italian geometrical initial styles very close to the same letter in the *Decretum* 354 of Amiens (fol. 9) (fig. 3). Another shared feature is the extensive use of burnished gold ground. As observed by Rabel, other motifs appear to come from North European illumination, as the leaves inhabited by heads, the elongated dragons extending the length of initial shafts (figs 4-5), and the small lions typical of Channel-Style manuscripts⁵⁶. The first two elements are present also in another early Italian manuscript of the *Decretum* at the Sainte-Geneviève Library in Paris (Paris, Bibliothèque Sainte-Geneviève, ms. 168)⁵⁷. A peculiar characteristic of Saint-Omer 454 is indeed the depiction of marvelous creatures, as the sciapod of *Causa I* (fol. 85v) (fig. 5), the member of a fantastic people living in Central Asia with only one big leg, the birds with men’s heads of *Causae VI* (fol. 128) and *XVIII* (fol. 187), and the siren arranging her hair with a comb of *Causa XIII* (fol. 163) (fig. 6). These

⁵⁶ *Jeux de mains* cit., scheda 6 (C. Rabel).

⁵⁷ The manuscript shows two historiated letters at the beginning of *Distinctio I* (fol. 3r) and *Causa I* (fol. 80r), and one inhabited initial at the opening of *De consecratione* (fol. 290v). Pen-flourished initials were subsequently added to the openings of the other *Causae*. Zanichelli has attributed the painted initials to the same group of French Italian artists working in the *Decreta* of Chambéry (Chambéry, Bibliothèques municipales de Chambéry, MSS 13) and Trento (Trento, Biblioteca Comunale di Trento, ms. 3568). While, in my opinion, these illuminators appear to be fully transalpine, perhaps German as the scribes who wrote the manuscripts, the initials of Sainte-Geneviève actually manifest a mixture of Italian and northern French or southern English elements. Indeed, their figure style is not so distant from the above mentioned fragmentary Missal of Modena cathedral. Another similar case is represented by the *Decretum* Edili 96 in Florence (Firenze, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, Edili 96). NORDENFALK cit., p. 327; ZANICHELLI, *Thesaurus* cit., p. 178. On the *Decretum* of Chambéry, in addition: C. Heid-Guillaume, in C. HEID-GUILLAUME – A. RITZ, *Manuscrits médiévaux de Chambéry: textes et enluminures*, Paris 1998 (Corpus des manuscrits enluminés des collections publiques des départements), pp. 65-69; MURANO, *Graziano e il Decretum* cit., p. 117. On the *Decretum* of Trento, also: L. Dal Poz, in M. BERNASCONI – L. DAL POZ, *Codici miniati della Biblioteca Comunale di Trento*, Firenze 1985, pp. 43-56; MURANO, *Graziano e il Decretum* cit., p. 117. A catalogue entry is available online: <http://www.calames.abes.fr/pub/#details?id=BSGA10305> (last access: 07/10/2019). On the Edili 96: *Duecento* cit., scheda 16, pp. 59-61 (S. Bosi).

figures were typical of decorated manuscripts of the *Bestiary* and the *Mirabilia mundi* as well as Romanesque architectural sculpture⁵⁸.

As for the figure style, the closest affinities are again with the above mentioned *Decretum* of Amiens (fig. 3). Especially the letters painted by the illuminator of higher workmanship in our manuscript share a similar robust and vigorous interpretation of Byzantinizing classicism. Nordenfalk suggested that the miniatures of Amiens 354 were made by Bolognese illuminators, whereas Anthony Melnikas had previously considered them as Tuscan. Massimo Medica has more recently distinguished two different illuminators working in the manuscript and maintained that both could be North Italian, although it appears difficult for the scholar to connect them directly to Bologna⁵⁹. Indeed, in my opinion, the figure style of this codex resembles the second illuminator of the so-called Countess Matilda Evangelistary (Nonantola, Museo Benedettino e Diocesano d'Arte Sacra) (fig. 7), written in the *scriptorium* of Nonantola Benedictine abbey near Modena, a few miles from Bologna, and still held in the monastery museum. This manuscript has been the object of controversial scholarly literature with regards to the chronology and stylistic culture of the ten full-page scenes of the *Life of Christ* made by two very different artists⁶⁰. The second master belongs to a Byzantinizing stylistic

⁵⁸ *Book of Beasts: The Bestiary in the Medieval World*, exhibition catalogue (Los Angeles, The J. Paul Getty Museum, May 14-August 18, 2019), edited by E. Morrison, Los Angeles 2019. Specifically on the iconography of sirens: J. LECLERCQ-MARX, *La sirène dans la pensée et dans l'art de l'antiquité et du moyen âge, du mythe païen au symbole chrétien*, Bruxelles 1997. Analogous figures are visible also in the inhabited initials of some Channel-Style *Decreta*, as one codex in Gdansk (Gdansk, Bibl. Polskiej Akademii Nauk, Mar. F. 77). MELNIKAS, *The Corpus* cit., *passim*.

⁵⁹ The manuscript presents 37 historiated initials, one decorated letter for the opening of the introductory summary (fol. 1r), a table of Greek and Roman numerals (fol. 54v), and an 'arbor consanguinitatis' with a male bearded monarch (fol. 256v). The space for the initial of Causa IV (fol. 108r) has been left blank. One illuminator of higher quality and stronger Byzantinizing appearance worked on folios 9r, 72r, 142v, and 256v. The other initials are the work of more sketchy collaborators. MELNIKAS, *The Corpus* cit., *passim*; NORDENFALK cit., p. 325; *Duecento* cit., scheda 39, pp. 168-171 (M. Medica); ZANICHELLI, *Thesauris* cit., pp. 175, 178; GIBBS, *The Bratislava Gratian* cit., pp. 172, 174-175, 177-178; ZANICHELLI, *Osculetur* cit., pp. 137-142. The microfilm has been fully digitized: <https://bvmm.irht.cnrs.fr/consult/consult.php?reproductionId=18680> (last access: 01/10/2019).

⁶⁰ Pietro Toesca first attributed the most part of the full-page miniatures (fols. 3r, 9v, 15r, 37v, 45v, 60v, 63r) to a twelfth-century artist looking at transalpine models and the three remaining scenes (fols. 24v, 45r, 46r) to a later Byzantinizing illuminator, active in the thirteenth century. These considerations were still overall accepted by Alessandro Conti, who regarded both artists as Emilian, the first one showing connections to Spanish Romanesque painting, as previously suggested by Ferdinando Bologna, rather than Ottonian art, as observed instead by Mario Salmi. Arturo Carlo Quintavalle has later remarked that all the decoration should be dated to the late eleventh or the early twelfth century, assuming the first artist's relationships with the Cassinese illumination and the second master's links to contemporary manuscript painting in Cluny as well as Ottonian culture. If the miniatures by the first artist may have been executed at the end of the eleventh or the opening of the twelfth century, along with the many decorated initials adorning the codex, the Byzantinizing author of the other full-page miniatures might have worked on the Evangelistary in a later moment, as I explain in the article. P. TOESCA, *Il Medioevo*, Torino 1927 (*Storia dell'arte classica e italiana*, 3), p. 1058; M. SALMI, *La*

trend with a few examples in northern Italy, as the mosaics with the *Apostles* in the atrium of Saint Mark in Venice, dating to the late eleventh century⁶¹, and the mosaic fragments from the lost decoration of the apse of Ravenna cathedral, completed in 1112⁶². However, this artist appears to be aware also of Byzantinizing trends in English Romanesque illumination around 1125-1150⁶³ and should thus have worked approximately in the middle of the century. I believe that the artists of the Amiens *Decretum* are followers of this style being active in Emilia not many years later⁶⁴. The masters of Saint-Omer 454 freely elaborated upon the same Byzantinizing style with a more linear treatment of garment folds and the choice of iridescent colors. The first trait reveals the knowledge of other stylistic trends long diffused in Emilia, and more generally in northern Italy, probably interrelated with transalpine European Romanesque art⁶⁵.

miniatura italiana, Milano 1956, p. 14; F. BOLOGNA, *La pittura italiana delle origini*, Roma 1962 (La pittura italiana, 1), p. 69; CONTI, *Miniature* cit., scheda M12, pp. 539-540; A.C. QUINTAVALLE, *Wiligelmo e Matilde: L'officina romanica*, catalogo della mostra (Mantova, Palazzo Te, 15 giugno-10 novembre 1991), Milano 1991, p. 265; *La sapienza degli angeli: Nonantola e gli Scriptoria padani nel Medioevo*, catalogo della mostra (Nonantola, Museo Benedettino Nonantolano e Diocesano d'Arte Sacra, 5 aprile-20 giugno 2003), a cura di G. Z. Zanichelli – M. Branchi, Modena 2003, scheda 27, pp. 123-129 (M. Branchi).

⁶¹ W. DORIGO, *Venezia*, in *La pittura nel Veneto: Le origini*, a cura di F. Flores d'Arcais, Milano 2004, pp. 21-63: 45-46.

⁶² C. RIZZARDI, *Il Romanico monumentale e decorativo a Ravenna e nel suo territorio*, in *Storia di Ravenna: III. Dal Mille alla fine della signoria polentana*, a cura di A. Vasina, Venezia 1993, pp. 447-480: 462-466.

⁶³ For instance, I can mention the Bury St Edmunds Bible (Cambridge, Corpus Christi College, MS 2), probably painted by Master Hugo around 1135. A full digitized reproduction of the manuscript is available alongside a complete bibliography at: <https://parker.stanford.edu/parker/catalog/nm203xw8381> (last access: 01/10/2019).

⁶⁴ On the contrary, Gibbs interpreted the Byzantinism of the illuminators as close to the Pisan artists of the Beane and Cracow *Decreta*. Gibbs, *The Bratislava Gratian* cit., pp. 174-175.

⁶⁵ Good examples could be the *Liber Magistri* of Piacenza cathedral (Piacenza, Archivio Capitolare, Cod. 65), dating to the last decade of the twelfth century, according to a recent paleographical study of the obituary notes to the calendar at the end of the volume (fols. 440r-445v), or the sculptures of Nicholas, still affecting his Emilian colleagues throughout the twelfth century, as Pietro d'Alberico in Bologna or the author of the *Virgin and Child* from Piacenza in the Boston Museum of Fine Arts (57.583). On the *Liber Magistri*, at least: A.C. QUINTAVALLE, *Miniatura a Piacenza: I codici dell'Archivio Capitolare*, Venezia 1963, pp. 21-26, 99-114; M. FERRARI, *Per la datazione del "Liber Magistri" di Piacenza (Biblioteca Capitolare della Cattedrale, cod. 65)*, in *"Quod ore cantas corde credas". Studi in onore di Giacomo Baroffio Dahnk*, a cura di L. Cappaticci, Città del Vaticano 2013 (Monumenta, studia, instrumenta liturgica, 70), pp. 189-202; G. Z. ZANICHELLI, *Tra cattedrale e cenobio: due immagini mariane del XII secolo nella diocesi di Piacenza*, in *La lezione gentile: Scritti di storia dell'arte per Anna Maria Segagni Malacart*, a cura di L. C. Schiavi – S. Caldano – F. Gemelli, Milano 2017, pp. 357-368: 360-362; M. FERRARI, *Bobbio e Piacenza, tra manoscritti, biblioteche e archivi*, in *I misteri della Cattedrale: Meraviglie nel labirinto del sapere*, catalogo della mostra (Piacenza, 7 aprile-7 luglio 2018), Milano 2018, pp. 39-45: 42-43. On Pietro d'Alberico: M. MEDICA, *I portali dell'antica cattedrale di Bologna tra XII e XIII secolo*, in *La cattedrale scolpita: Il romanico in San Pietro a Bologna*, catalogo della mostra (Bologna, 13 dicembre 2003-12 aprile 2004), a cura di M. Medica – S. Battistini, Ferrara 2003, pp. 109-146: 120-129. On the Boston *Virgin and Child*, recently: ZANICHELLI, *Osculetur* cit., pp. 142-147; IDEM, *Tra cattedrale* cit., pp. 357-359. It may be significant that presumably since the 1170s a group of wooden statues depicting the *Crucifixion*, showing an intense linear manner and consequently attributed to a wandering artist from South Tirol with a strong northern European, and especially French, background was visible in the cathedral of Bologna. *La cattedrale scolpita: Il romanico in San Pietro a Bologna*, catalogo della mostra (Bologna, 13 dicembre 2003-12 aprile 2004), a cura di M. Medica – S. Battistini, Ferrara 2003, scheda 18, pp. 292-295 (M. Medica); L. MOR, *Legni scolpiti e modelli nella Bologna medievale*, in *Imago splendida: Capolavori di scultura lignea a Bologna dal Romanico al Duecento*, catalogo della mostra (Bologna,

Furthermore, a specific connection to the emerging illumination of the *Decretum* in Bologna is offered by the table of Greek and Roman numerals (fol. 66r) (fig. 8). The three figures sustaining the table at the bottom, two blue humanoid monsters with a red face on both sides and one young half-naked man at the center, follow indeed models resembling those of a similar group of figures in the numerals table of a *Decretum* in Bamberg (Bamberg, Staatsbibliothek Bamberg, Msc.Can.15, fol. 314v), painted by a probably Emilian workshop active on a bunch of *Decreta* in Bologna, since at least two among these manuscripts can be ascribed to the city in terms of script⁶⁶.

The *Decretum Gratiani* 454 of the municipal library of Saint-Omer is a unique witness of the early creation of a complete visual program to Gratian's text in Bologna during the second half of the twelfth century. Its series of 39 historiated initials, perhaps originally accompanied also by the tables of interrelationship, stands out for the rich narrative of some compositions and a few distinctive iconographies, especially the initial H with a bust of Christ handing the symbols of power to the ecclesiastical and secular authorities. One illuminator devised these illustrations and painted some of them. He was probably an Emilian artist, who inventively developed the robust Byzantinizing style represented by the *Decretum* 354 of Amiens thanks to the knowledge of other stylistic trends diffused in Emilia, but also of ornamental motifs stemming from northern Europe.

23 novembre 2019-8 marzo 2020), a cura di M. Medica – L. Mor, Cinisello Balsamo (Milano) 2019, pp. 13-33: 16-23; *Imago splendida: Capolavori di scultura lignea a Bologna dal Romanico al Duecento*, catalogo della mostra (Bologna, 23 novembre 2019-8 marzo 2020), a cura di M. Medica – L. Mor, Cinisello Balsamo (Milano) 2019, scheda 1, pp. 94-97 (L. Mor).

⁶⁶ On this workshop see above note 31. A similar monster is also at folio 126r, shown while bearing the initial I of Causa V above. The motif of two blue monsters supporting the table of numerals is also in other manuscripts decorated by the same group of artists (Cm 4505, fol. 57v; Venice Lat. IV,117, fol. 61r; Vercelli XXV, fol. 57r), although the figures are slightly different from those in Bamberg Can. 15 and Saint-Omer 454. For a catalogue entry of Bamberg Can. 15: G. SUCKALE-REDLEFSEN, *Die Handschriften des 12. Jahrhunderts der Staatsbibliothek Bamberg*, Wiesbaden 1995 (Katalog der illuminierten Handschriften der Staatsbibliothek Bamberg, 2), Kat. 95, pp. 100-103.