This is the final peer-reviewed accepted manuscript of:

Marcello Trevisani, Annachiara Berardinelli, Chiara Cevoli, Matilde Cecchini, Luigi Ragni, Frederique Pasquali,

Effects of sanitizing treatments with atmospheric cold plasma, SDS and lactic acid on verotoxin-producing *Escherichia coli* and *Listeria monocytogenes* in red chicory (radicchio),

Food Control, Volume 78, 2017, Pages 138-143

The final published version is available online at:
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2017.02.056>

Rights / License:

The terms and conditions for the reuse of this version of the manuscript are specified in the publishing policy. For all terms of use and more information see the publisher's website.

*Manuscript

1 Effects of Sanitizing Treatments with Atmospheric Cold Plasma, SDS and Lactic Acid on 2
verotoxin-producing *Escherichia coli* and *Listeria monocytogenes* in Red Chicory (radicchio)

3 Marcello Trevisani^{a*}, Annachiara Berardinelli^b, Chiara Cevoli^b, Matilde Cecchini^a, Luigi Ragni^b,
4 Frederique Pasquali^b

5 ^a *Department of Veterinary Medical Sciences, Alma Mater Studiorum, University of Bologna, Via*
6 *Tolara di Sopra 50, Ozzano dell'Emilia, BO, Italy; ^b Department of Agricultural and Food*
7 *Sciences, Alma Mater Studiorum, University of Bologna, Via Fanin 50, 40127 Bologna, Italy*

8 **corresponding author. Email address: marcello.trevisani@unibo.it*

9

9 **Abstract**

10 The main objective of this study was to evaluate the synergistic effect of atmospheric cold plasma
 11 (ACP), Sodium Dodecyl Sulphate (SDS) and lactic acid (LA) on *L. monocytogenes* and
 12 verotoxinproducing *E. coli* in red chicory. Experimentally inoculated samples were pre-treated with
 13 either SDS, or SDS + LA for 5, 10 or 15 min. Pre-treated samples were then submerged in deionised
 14 water and either exposed to ACP generated by dielectric barrier discharge device (DBD: fixed
 15 parameters: 19.15 V and 3.15 A) for 15 min or left untreated. All combinations of treatments were
 16 evaluated for sensory effects. Viable counts of verotoxin-producing *E. coli* on red chicory decreased
 17 by more than 4 logs (4.78 Log CFU/cm² vs control) after a treatment with LA+SDS for 5 min and
 18 ACP for 15 min and often dropped below the limit of quantification. *L. monocytogenes* showed a
 19 higher tolerance to this sanitizing treatment and the level of inactivation was higher than 3 logs
 20 (3.77 Log CFU/cm² vs control) only by increasing the duration of the washing step in LA+SDS to 15
 21 min. The different treatments had no detrimental effects on colour, freshness and texture of red
 22 chicory, but odour and overall acceptability of the samples treated by ACP slightly decreased during
 23 storage. Further optimization of treatment parameters for maintaining fresh characteristics are needed,
 24 but the effectiveness of combinations of sanitizers and ACP on other pathogens and fresh produce
 25 worth to be investigated.

26 **Highlights**

- 27 • Red chicory leaves were treated with Lactic Acid, SDS and ACP to control VTEC and Listeria
- 28 • LA and SDS had synergistic effect with ACP in inactivation of VTEC and Listeria
- 29 • Freshness, colour and texture of the leaves were slightly affected by the analysed treatments

30 **Keywords:** Sanitizing Treatments; Atmospheric Cold Plasma; Sodium Dodecyl Sulphate; Lactic

31 Acid; verotoxin-producing *Escherichia coli*; *Listeria monocytogenes*

32 **1. Introduction**

33 The supply of safe food remains one of the major concerns of food industry. Among food, leafy greens
34 are relatively vulnerable to pathogen contamination such as *Escherichia coli*, *Listeria* and
35 *Salmonella*. Salad vegetables have been frequently associated with foodborne outbreaks (Denis,
36 Zhang, Leroux, Trudel, & Bietlot, 2016; Friesema et al., 2008; Lynch, Tauxe, & Hedberg, 2009;
37 Söderström et al., 2008).

38 During processing, suitable disinfectants such as chlorine dioxide, ozone, and peracetic acid, are used
39 with the aim to reduce the number of microorganisms naturally contaminating fresh produces and
40 prevent cross-contamination (Banach, Sampers, Haute, & van der Fels-Klerx, 2015). Relatively
41 recently, chlorine was discovered to react with organic compounds with the formation of carcinogenic
42 chlorinated compounds in water (chloramines and trihalomethanes) (Gil, Selma, López-Gálvez, &
43 Allende, 2009). Since then, there have been many attempts to find alternative washing treatments.

44 A novel processing technology, Atmospheric Cold Plasma (ACP), has shown promising results
45 (Berardinelli et al., 2016; Mir, Shah, & Mir, 2016; Pasquali et al., 2016). The antimicrobial
46 mechanism is yet to be elucidated, but it is known that ACP is a source of multiple chemically reactive
47 species with a high bactericidal activity, including reactive oxygen (ROS) and reactive nitrogen
48 species (RNS) (Liao et al., 2016). Among the ROS, ozone, atomic oxygen, singlet oxygen,
49 superoxide, peroxide, and hydroxyl radicals, independently or in synergy, are expected to play a role
50 in the bacterial inactivation process (Joshi et al., 2011; Ziuzina, Boehm, Patil, Cullen, & Bourke,
51 2015).

52 Our previous study demonstrated that ACP in water medium was efficient in the inactivation of *L.*
53 *monocytogenes* and *E. coli* cells inoculated on radicchio leaves, but a significant reduction was

observed only in the planktonic bacteria (i.e. the microbial cells that migrated to the washing water) (Berardinelli et al., 2016). In this respect, the use of a surfactant might increase the sanitation efficacy of ACP by improving the washing effect. Some studies have reported that combinations of surfactants, such as Sodium Dodecyl Sulphate (SDS), with organic acids have synergistic effect (Beuchat, Mann, & Alali, 2012; Zhao, Zhao, & Doyle, 2009). Besides the antimicrobial property by lowering pH, Lactic Acid (LA) is a permeabilizer of the Gram-negative bacterial outer membrane and showed a strong sensitizing effect to SDS in *E. coli* and *Salmonella* Typhimurium (Alakomi, Skyttä, Saarela, & Helander, 2005). Unfortunately, LA and SDS also caused detrimental effects on visual quality and texture of lettuce in modified atmosphere packages during storage at 4 °C, although these effects can depend on experimental condition such as slice the lettuce into pieces before the sanitation step (Guan, Huang, & Fan, 2010).

According to recent studies, the presence of plasma-induced acidic pH, the reactive oxygen (ROS) and nitrogen (RNS) species and their interactions, give further rise to reactive products, which get stabilized and exhibit strong antimicrobial properties (Ercan, Smith, Ji, Brooks, & Joshi, 2016; Oehmigen et al., 2010).

This study aimed at evaluating the synergistic effect of ACP, SDS and LA on *L. monocytogenes* and verotoxin-producing *E. coli* in red chicory. This perennial plant is often used as a colourful salad garnish due to the leaves' bitter flavour. Red chicory was chosen as a model of leafy vegetables because of its sensitivity to discoloration and sogginess.

2. Material and Methods

2.1. Samples

Radicchio, also known as red chicory (*Cichorium intybus* L.) was purchased at a local supermarket and immediately transported to laboratory in a cool bag. The outer 3 or 4 leaves and core were removed from the red chicory head and discarded. The remaining leaves were washed under tap water

for 10 s and drained carefully, then left under laminar flow in a biohazard cabinet to dry (approximately 30 min) and exposed to germicidal UV-light (254 nm) for 30 min (both sides).

2.2. *Growth of bacteria and preparation of inoculum*

Five strains of verotoxin-producing *E. coli* (VTEC) (O157:H7 ATCC 35150, O157:Hnt VT+ isolated from cattle carcass, O26:H11 VT+, isolated from milk, O26:H11 VT+, isolated from milk filter, O26:H11 FV4028 received from *E. coli* reference laboratory Lugo (Spain)) and five strains of *L. monocytogenes* (LR 102 0227-359, vi 51028, 0113-131, vi51010) were used. Cultures were grown at 37°C using Tryptic Soy Broth (TSB, Oxoid) and Brain Heart Infusion (BHI, Oxoid, Basingstoke, United Kingdom) for VTEC and *L. monocytogenes*, respectively. Broth cultures were stored at -80°C with the addition of 25% glycerol. Tryptic Soy Agar (TSA) plates were streaked from these stocks and stored at 4°C. Cultures for inactivation experiments were inoculated from single colonies on these agar plates and grown at 37°C for 21 h. Single colonies of each strain of VTEC and *L. monocytogenes* were harvested and suspended in Phosphate-Buffered Saline pH 7.0 (PBS) at a cell density of approximately 10^8 CFU/mL (0.08–0.1 absorbance at 625 nm). The number of bacteria was determined by plating the appropriate decimal dilutions on TSA and incubating at 37°C for 24 h.

2.3. *Inoculation of samples*

One hundred microliter of the suspensions of bacteria (VTEC or *L. monocytogenes*) in PBS (at a cell density of approximately 10^8 CFU/mL) were spotted on the red chicory leaves. Bacteria would be expected to adhere in higher numbers on soil contaminated spots than would those on the clean vegetables, therefore 100 µl of horticultural soil water solution (0.1% w/v), which was freshly boiled for 60 min, was spotted on 10 points of each red chicory leaf (external part). The inoculum with VTEC or *L. monocytogenes* was made on the soil contaminated spots, then leaves were airdried on a mesh in a laminar flow biosafety hood at room temperature for 1 hour. The inocula were spotted in a

102 well-identified area of approximately 2 cm by 5 cm (10 cm²) at each side of the central leave vein.
103 The inoculated red chicory leaves were then put in plastic box and hold at 8-10°C overnight.

104 2.4. *Preliminary washing steps*

105 After the overnight storage the radicchio leaves were cut and the inoculated portions (10 cm²) were
106 submerged in water solutions containing SDS (0.05% w/v), LA (2% w/v) + SDS (0.05% w/v) or NaCl
107 (0.85% w/v). All reagents were purchased from Sigma-Aldrich (Milano, Italy). Treatments were
108 performed at room temperature (20-25°C) for 5, 10 or 15 min. During this period, the washing effect
109 was increased by gently tilting the containers for 5 s every 2 min. After this step samples were rinsed
110 with 18 ml of sterile deionized water.

111 2.5. *Plasma settings and treatments*

112 ACP treatment of red chicory was carried out as previously described (Berardinelli et al., 2016). In
113 brief, radicchio samples were subjected to the effect of plasma in a plastic hermetic chamber housing
114 a Dielectric Barrier Discharge (DBD) plasma source; a fan mounted above the electrode was used to
115 direct the plasma species against the sample. Samples were placed below the plasma source in plastic
116 boxes filled with deionised water to a height of 0.6 cm. The distance between the fluid and the
117 electrodes was 2 cm. Voltage at the electrodes was produced by high voltage (HV) transformers and
118 power switching transistors supplied by a stabilized DC power supply (ElektroAutomatik GmbH &
119 Co.KG, EA-PS 2042-06B). Treatment parameters were fixed at 19.15 V and 3.15 ± 0.5 A for 15 min.

120 Challenge tests with *L. monocytogenes* and VTEC were performed independently. To ensure result
121 reproducibility, each experiment (preliminary washing and ACP) was repeated three times with three
122 replicate samples each.

123 2.6. Microbiological assessments

124 The viability of VTEC and *L. monocytogenes* cells was assessed after each challenge test. The samples
 125 were homogenised in 50 ml of buffered peptone water (BPW, Oxoid, Basingstoke, United Kingdom)
 126 with a Stomacher® (Seward, UK) at normal speed for 2 min. Serial ten-fold dilutions were performed
 127 and plated onto Thin Agar Layer (TAL) plates for colony counting after storage at room temperature
 128 for one hour. The TAL method involves overlaying 14 mL of nonselective medium (Tryptic Soy Agar
 129 Oxoid, TSA, Basingstoke, United Kingdom) onto a pre-poured, pathogen-specific selective medium,
 130 in order to allow the recovery of sub-lethally injured cells (Wu and Fung, 2001). Agar Listeria
 131 according to Ottaviani and Agosti (ALOA, Biolife, Milan, Italy) was used as selective and differential
 132 medium for *L. monocytogenes*. Oxoid™ MacConkey Agar (MAC, Oxoid, Basingstoke, United
 133 Kingdom) was used for the detection and isolation of *E. coli*. Ten lactose fermenting colonies were
 134 picked from the countable plates and tested by latex agglutination kits for *E. coli* O26 and *E. coli*
 135 O157 (Oxoid™ Dryspot™ *E. coli* O157 and *E. coli* O26 test kit, Basingstoke, United Kingdom) and
 136 the numbers of serogroup specific colonies were calculated. Colonies were enumerated on TAL plates
 137 after incubation at 37°C for 24 h. Upon the observation of no colonies, BPW homogenates were tested
 138 with the methods ISO 16654 and ISO 11290 to detect the presence of VTEC and *L. monocytogenes*,
 139 respectively.

140 Lethality was calculated as the difference between the logarithms of colony counts of untreated and
 141 treated samples ($\text{Log } N_0 - \text{Log } N$).

142 2.7. Qualitative assessments

143 Non inoculated red chicory leave fragments (approximately 2 cm by 5 cm) were submerged in water
 144 solution of SDS and LA+SDS (at concentrations reported above) for 5, 10 or 15 min. After this step
 145 the samples were washed with deionized water and immersed in 90 ml of deionized water.

146 The plasma treatment was carried out for 15 min as described in the microbiological section. Each
 147 treatment was repeated three times. Colour of red chicory was assessed with a reflectance colorimeter
 148 (Minolta Chroma Meter CR-400, Konica Minolta Sensing Europe, Cinisello Balsamo, Italy). Three
 149 measurements were performed for each sample before and after each treatment. The analysis was
 150 repeated after one day of storage (at 4°C and 80% of R.H). Colour differences were identified using
 151 the CIE L*a*b* coordinates and the parameter C* (Chroma) was calculated from the a* and b*
 152 coordinates (C.I.E. 2007).

153 Sensory test was conducted with 12 untrained assessors, considering 5 attributes: freshness, colour,
 154 odour, texture and overall acceptability, as described by Pasquali et al. (2016).

155 pH values of water solutions before and immediately after the plasma treatment were also recorded
 156 (pH meter, GLP 22, CRISON).

157 2.8. *Statistical analysis*

158 Unless elsewhere noted, data were reported as the arithmetic mean $\pm$ Standard Deviation (SD). The
 159 R Stats Package for Windows (CRAN, R-project) was used for statistical analyses. Data were
 160 analysed for normality and homoscedasticity (Shapiro-Wilk and Levene test, respectively). For
 161 calculating the statistical significance of the results one-way ANOVA and All Pairwise Multiple
 162 Comparison Procedures, were used. The Kruskal–Wallis was used in case of significance of Shapiro-
 163 Wilk and Levene test.

164

165 **3. Results and Discussion**

166 3.1. *Effect of Lactic Acid, SDS and ACP on VTEC*

167 Cold plasma demonstrates high efficacy in terms of reduction of VTEC cell number when associated
 168 with a preliminary washing step in lactic acid (Figure 1. Panel A). The majority of the samples (6 out

169 of 9) inoculated with VTEC (6.72 ± 0.27 Log CFU/cm²) and treated with LA+SDS for 5 min and
 170 ACP for 15 min had counts below the level of quantification. However, the presence of VTEC was
 171 detected in these samples after 24 h of enrichment, meaning that the numbers of viable VTEC cells
 172 were in a range between the limit of detection (LOD, 1 CFU in 10 cm² = -1 Log CFU/cm²) and the
 173 theoretical limit of quantification (LOQ, 1 CFU in 1 ml of the sample homogenate approximately
 174 equal 0.7 Log CFU/cm²). Also one out of 9 samples, not treated with ACP but washed with LA+SDS,
 175 was below LOQ. In order to calculate the differences between the microbial counts before and after
 176 treatments, the data points below the LOQ were arbitrarily assigned a value equal to 0.65 Log
 177 CFU/cm² for statistical analyses, which biases estimates upward.

178 Data distributions that do not follow the normal distribution can be represented graphically in a box
 179 plot (also known as a box-and-whisker plot) reporting median values, quartiles (25% and 75%)
 180 minimum and maximum values (Figure 1). Reduction of VTEC counts was significantly higher in
 181 samples treated with ACP, SDS and LA (4.78 ± 0.66) in comparison to samples treated with only two
 182 of the three sanitizing methods (2.53 ± 1.30 mean Log CFU/cm² (LA + SDS) and 2.69 ± 0.38 mean Log
 183 CFU/cm² (SDS + ACP) and (Figure 1A).

184 Berardinelli et al. (2016) did not observe significant differences of VTEC counts on red chicory after
 185 treatment with ACP for 30 min using the same plasma apparatus, whereas 60 min treatments gave a
 186 significant reduction (-2.2 mean Log CFU/cm² vs control). In this study, the effect on VTEC counts
 187 was similar when the ACP treatment was applied for 15 min after washing the radicchio leaves with
 188 SDS (-2.89 mean Log CFU/cm² vs control) and the efficiency of the ACP treatment was much higher
 189 after washing with LA+SDS (-4.78 mean Log CFU/cm² vs control).

190 Several studies have highlighted that the large variability of results observed in challenge test with *E.*
 191 *coli* on lettuce and other fresh produce aiming at assessing the sensitivity to ACP can depend on
 192 experimental conditions (Bermúdez-Aguirre, Wemlinger, Pedrow, Barbosa-Cánovas, & GarciaPerez,

2013; Min et al., 2016; Song et al., 2015; Ziuzina et al., 2015). Because the attachment to surface and internal structures can be a relevant factor, in this study the experimental inoculation of red chicory leaves was performed prior to cutting. Moreover, the conditions used to facilitate attachment included the inoculation on soil contaminated spots and the incubation at room temperature for one hour, followed by overnight storage at 8-10 °C. The number of attached *E. coli* in the control samples was 5.58 mean Log CFU/cm², with a recovery of 10.75% ($\pm 9.25\%$) versus the inoculum. This difference between the number of *E. coli* in the inoculum and on control samples (approx. 1 Log CFU) can be due to the effect of washing with physiologic solution (NaCl 0.85% w/v).

The effects of lactic acid on *E. coli* O157:H7 was previously investigated by Velázquez, Barbini, Escudero, Estrada, & Guzmán (2009) who reported a 1.71 Log CFU reduction on lettuce after washing with 1% LA in bags with continuous agitation for 1 min. Similar results were reported by Akbas & Ölmez (2007). A significant reduction of *E. coli* (1.9 Log CFU/g) was observed after dipping lettuce in 0.5% LA for 2 min. The authors pointed out that any further reduction was observed by increasing the LA concentration from 0.5 to 1% or the treatment time from 2 to 5 min.

The synergistic effect of LA (0.5%) in combination with SDS (0.05%) was previously tested by Guan and colleagues (2010). The authors reported a reduction of 0.41 ± 0.12 (Log CFU/g tissue) after washing for 5 min and observed detrimental effects on visual quality and texture of lettuce after storage in modified atmosphere package at 4°C for 7 and 14 days. However, these detrimental effects might be linked to the specific experimental conditions, because lettuce leaves were cut into pieces before the sanitation and the LA might more easily penetrate inside the lettuce leaves.

3.2. Effect of Lactic Acid, SDS and ACP on *L. monocytogenes*

The combination of LA (2%) +SDS (0.05%) treatment was very effective on *L. monocytogenes* (Figure 1B). Mean counts were often below LOQ, especially in the groups treated for 15 min, with

216 7 and 6 out of 9 samples below LOQ in the groups treated and not treated with ACP, respectively.
 217 The *L. monocytogenes* counts in the control samples washed with NaCl 0.85% for 10 and 15 min
 218 were 5.17 ± 0.13 (mean Log CFU/cm²) and 4.43 ± 0.50 (mean Log CFU/cm²), respectively (average
 219 percent recovery 2.50 ± 0.75 and 2.40 ± 0.44). Washing with LA+SDS, with or without a subsequent
 220 treatment with ACP, showed higher efficacy against *L. monocytogenes* in comparison to treatments
 221 combinations excluding LA. Within LA + SDS treated samples, the higher the time of the SDS
 222 treatment the higher the *L. monocytogenes* reduction values. In particular reduction values of -3.12
 223 mean Log CFU/cm² vs control (LA + SDS 10 min) and -4.50 mean Log CFU/cm² vs control (LA +
 224 SDS 15 min) were registered. However, the impact of the data below quantification limit should be
 225 considered.

226 In the present study, SDS + ACP showed a limited efficacy against *L. monocytogenes* in
 227 experimentally inoculated red chicory. A limited, although statistical significant, reduction of ACP
 228 alone has been already described on red chicory after 30 and 60 min of treatment applied using the
 229 same DBD system (1 and 1.30 Log CFU/cm² respectively) (Berardinelli et al., 2016).

230 Akbas & Ölmez (2007) reported that the populations of *L. monocytogenes* on iceberg lettuce samples
 231 were significantly reduced ($1.5 \text{ Log CFU g}^{-1}$) after dipping the inoculated samples in 0.5% LA for 2
 232 min and that the effect was not significantly increased with treatment time of 5 min or LA
 233 concentration 1%. The effectiveness of treatment with LA (or Levulinic Acid) plus SDS was
 234 positively tested by several authors against Gram negative bacteria such as *Salmonella* spp. and *E.*
 235 *coli* (Beuchat et al., 2012; Zhao et al., 2009). Inhibition of micro-organisms by organic acids depends
 236 upon several factors including pH reduction, the ratio of undissociated species of the acid, chain
 237 length, cell physiology and metabolism. SDS can denature protein surfaces and damage cell
 238 membranes, and its bactericidal effect can be increased at low pH (Tejaswi Naidu & Prakash Prabhu,
 239 2011; Zhao et al., 2009). Synergism between LA and SDS may be explained by the ability of LA to
 240 increase the permeability of the bacterial cell membrane (Wang, Chang, Yang, & Cui, 2015).

241 These results underline the synergistic effect of the three sanitizing methods. A preliminar LA + SDS
 242 treatment before the ACP treatment may act by improving the overall bactericidal effect of the
 243 combined sanitizing treatment as well as the washing effect. By increasing the number of planktonic
 244 cells detached from the leaf and released into the water, the number of cells damaged by ACP increase
 245 suggesting a combination of LA + SDS + ACP as an alternative and efficient decontamination
 246 treatment of red chicory to chlorine.

247 3.3. *Qualitative assessments*

248 Results of colour measurement, in term of L*, a*, b* and C*, are summarized in Table 1. The different
 249 treatments had no significant effect on colour of red chicory and no differences were observed after
 250 storage. The descriptive statistics shown in Table 2 indicate that the scores for freshness, colour and
 251 texture were not affected by the treatments, but odour and overall acceptability of the samples treated
 252 by ACP slightly decreased during storage. This is in agreement with the results reported by Pasquali
 253 et al. (2016) for red chicory leaves treated by cold plasma and stored for 3 days. About the odour,
 254 some assessors detected the typical ozone odour, as shown in the work conducted by Ragni et al.
 255 (2016) by using the same device. An O₃ concentration of about 7 ppm can be measured in a 0.19 m³
 256 volume chamber after 2.5 min of discharge.

257 After the treatments with (LA+SDS) 15 min + ACP 15 min and SDS 10 min + ACP 15 min, the pH
 258 values of water solutions used to immerge the leaves were 3.23±0.12 and 3.32±0.17, respectively.
 259 Before the treatment with ACP the values of water solution pH were 3.41±0.07 and 7.10±0.12 for LA
 260 + SDS and SDS, respectively. The low initial pH values of LA + SDS water solutions were probably
 261 due to LA residues absorbed by the red chicory samples. As observed, ACP treatments were able to
 262 reduce these values of about 5% and 53% for LA + SDS and SDS, respectively.

263 264 4. Conclusions

265 The results of this work clearly demonstrated that Lactic Acid (LA), SDS and atmospheric cold
 266 plasma (ACP) had a synergistic effect on verotoxin-producing *E. coli* and *L. monocytogenes*. The

267 increased antimicrobial activity of ACP can be related to the perturbation of the bacterial cell
 268 membranes produced by the preliminary treatment with a short chain weak acid (LA) and a surfactant
 269 (SDS). The longer duration of the washing step needed to achieve a similar significant reductions for
 270 the Gram positive species (*L. monocytogenes*) also suggests that the inactivation efficacy and the
 271 magnitude of microbial cell damages depend on the microbial cell wall and membrane structure.
 272 Further optimization of treatment parameters for maintaining fresh characteristics are needed. The
 273 effectiveness of combinations of sanitizers and ACP on other pathogens and fresh produce worth to
 274 be investigated.

275

276 **Acknowledgments**

277 The research received funding from the E.U. Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2012-2014) under
 278 grant agreement n 289262, STARTEC (Decision Support Tools to ensure safe, tasty, and nutritious
 279 Advanced Ready-To-Eat foods for healthy and vulnerable Consumers).

280 **References**

- 281 Akbas, M. Y., & Ölmez, H. (2007). Inactivation of *Escherichia coli* and *Listeria monocytogenes* on
 282 iceberg lettuce by dip wash treatments with organic acids. *Letters in Applied Microbiology*,
 283 44(6), 619–624. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1472-765X.2007.02127.x>
- 284 Alakomi, H., Skyttä, E., Saarela, M., & Helander, I. M. (2005). Lactic Acid Permeabilizes Gram-
 285 Negative Bacteria by Disrupting the Outer Membrane Lactic Acid Permeabilizes Gram-
 286 Negative Bacteria by Disrupting the Outer Membrane. *Applied and Environmental*
 287 *Microbiology*, 66(5), 2000–2005. <https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.66.5.2001-2005.2000>.Updated
- 288 Banach, J. L., Sampers, I., Haute, S. Van, & van der Fels-Klerx, H. J. (2015). Effect of disinfectants
 289 on preventing the cross-contamination of pathogens in fresh produce washing water.

- Intefile:///C:/Users/marcello.trevisani/Dropbox/Food Control 2016/Gill et Al
 2009.pdf
International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health, 12(8), 8658–8677.
<https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph120808658>
- Berardinelli, A., Pasquali, F., Cevoli, C., Trevisani, M., Ragni, L., Mancusi, R., & Manfreda, G.
 (2016). Sanitisation of fresh-cut celery and radicchio by gas plasma treatments in water
 medium. *Postharvest Biology and Technology*, 111, 297–304.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.postharvbio.2015.09.026>
- Bermúdez-Aguirre, D., Wemlinger, E., Pedrow, P., Barbosa-Cánovas, G., & Garcia-Perez, M.
 (2013). Effect of atmospheric pressure cold plasma (APCP) on the inactivation of *Escherichia*
coli in fresh produce. *Food Control*, 34(1), 149–157.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2013.04.022>
- Beuchat, L. R., Mann, D. a., & Alali, W. Q. (2012). Evaluation of Sanitizers for Inactivating
Salmonella on In-Shell Pecans and Pecan Nutmeats. *Journal of Food Protection*, 75(11),
 1930–1938. <https://doi.org/10.4315/0362-028X.JFP-12-133>
- Denis, N., Zhang, H., Leroux, A., Trudel, R., & Bietlot, H. (2016). Prevalence and trends of bacterial
 contamination in fresh fruits and vegetables sold at retail in Canada. *Food Control*,
 67, 225–234. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2016.02.047>
- Ercan, U. K., Smith, J., Ji, H.-F., Brooks, A. D., & Joshi, S. G. (2016). Chemical Changes in
 Nonthermal Plasma-Treated N-Acetylcysteine (NAC) Solution and Their Contribution to
 Bacterial Inactivation. *Scientific Reports*, 6(February), 20365.
<https://doi.org/10.1038/srep20365>
- Friesema, I., Sigmundsdottir, G., van der Zwaluw, K., Heuvelink, A., Schimmer, B., de Jager, C.,
 ... van Pelt, W. (2008). An international outbreak of Shiga toxin-producing *Escherichia coli*

- 313 O157 infection due to lettuce, September-October 2007. *Euro Surveill* : *Bulletin Européen*
 314 *Sur Les Maladies Transmissibles* = *European Communicable Disease Bulletin*, 13(50), 1–5.
 315 <https://doi.org/19065> [pii]
- 316 Gil, M. I., Selma, M. V., López-Gálvez, F., & Allende, A. (2009). Fresh-cut product sanitation and
 317 wash water disinfection: Problems and solutions. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*,
 318 134(1–2), 37–45. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2009.05.021>
- 319 Guan, W., Huang, L., & Fan, X. (2010). Acids in combination with sodium dodecyl sulfate caused
 320 quality deterioration of fresh-cut iceberg lettuce during storage in modified atmosphere
 321 package. *Journal of Food Science*, 75(8). <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1750-3841.2010.01786.x>
- 322 Joshi, S. G., Cooper, M., Yost, A., Paff, M., Ercan, U. K., Fridman, G., ... Brooks, A. D. (2011).
 323 Nonthermal dielectric-barrier discharge plasma-induced inactivation involves oxidative DNA
 324 damage and membrane lipid peroxidation in *Escherichia coli*. *Antimicrobial Agents and*
 325 *Chemotherapy*, 55(3), 1053–1062. <https://doi.org/10.1128/AAC.01002-10>
- 326 Liao, X., Liu, D., Xiang, Q., Ahn, J., Chen, S., Ye, X., & Ding, T. (2016). Inactivation mechanisms
 327 of non-thermal plasma on microbes: A review. *Food Control*, 75, 83–91.
 328 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2016.12.021>
- 329 Lynch, M. F., Tauxe, R. V., & Hedberg, C. W. (2009). The growing burden of foodborne outbreaks
 330 due to contaminated fresh produce: risks and opportunities. *Epidemiology and Infection*,
 331 137(3), 307–315. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0950268808001969>
- 332 Min, S. C., Roh, S. H., Niemira, B. A., Sites, J. E., Boyd, G., & Lacombe, A. (2016). Dielectric barrier
 333 discharge atmospheric cold plasma inhibits *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Salmonella*,
 334 *Listeria monocytogenes*, and Tulane virus in Romaine lettuce. *International Journal of Food*
 335 *Microbiology*, 237, 114–120. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2016.08.025>

- 336 Mir, S. A., Shah, M. A., & Mir, M. M. (2016). Understanding the Role of Plasma Technology in
 337 Food Industry. *Food and Bioprocess Technology*, 9(5), 734–750.
 338 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11947-016-1699-9>
- 339 Oehmigen, K., Hähnel, M., Brandenburg, R., Wilke, C., Weltmann, K. D., & Von Woedtke, T.
 340 (2010). The role of acidification for antimicrobial activity of atmospheric pressure plasma in
 341 liquids. *Plasma Processes and Polymers*, 7(3–4), 250–257.
 342 <https://doi.org/10.1002/ppap.200900077>
- 343 Pasquali, F., Stratakis, A. C., Koidis, A., Berardinelli, A., Cevoli, C., Ragni, L., ... Trevisani, M.
 344 (2016). Atmospheric cold plasma process for vegetable leaf decontamination: A feasibility
 345 study on radicchio (red chicory, *Cichorium intybus* L.). *Food Control*, 60.
 346 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2015.08.043>
- 347 Pasquali, F., Stratakis, A. C., Koidis, A., Berardinelli, A., Cevoli, C., Ragni, L., ... Trevisani, M.
 348 (2016). Atmospheric cold plasma process for vegetable leaf decontamination: A feasibility
 349 study on radicchio (red chicory, *Cichorium intybus* L.). *Food Control*, 60, 552–559.
 350 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2015.08.043>
- 351 Ragni, L., Berardinelli, A., Iaccheri, E., Gozzi, G., Cevoli, C., & Vannini, L. (2016). Influence of
 352 the electrode material on the decontamination efficacy of dielectric barrier discharge gas
 353 plasma treatments towards *Listeria monocytogenes* and *Escherichia coli*. *Innovative Food
 354 Science & Emerging Technologies*, 37, 170–176. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ifset.2016.07.029>
- 355 Söderström, A., Österberg, P., Lindqvist, A., Jönsson, B., Lindberg, A., Blide Ulander, S., ...
 356 Andersson, Y. (2008). A Large *Escherichia coli* O157 Outbreak in Sweden Associated with
 357 Locally Produced Lettuce. *Foodborne Pathogens and Disease*, 5(3), 339–349.
 358 <https://doi.org/10.1089/fpd.2007.0065>

- 359 Song, A. Y., Oh, Y. J., Kim, J. E., Song, K. Bin, Oh, D. H., & Min, S. C. (2015). Cold plasma
360 treatment for microbial safety and preservation of fresh lettuce. *Food Science and*
361 *Biotechnology*, 24(5), 1717–1724. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10068-015-0223-8>
- 362 Tejaswi Naidu, K., & Prakash Prabhu, N. (2011). Protein-surfactant interaction: Sodium dodecyl
363 sulfate-induced unfolding of ribonuclease A. *Journal of Physical Chemistry B*, 115(49),
364 14760–14767. <https://doi.org/10.1021/jp2062496>
- 365 Velázquez, L. d C., Barbini, N. B., Escudero, M. E., Estrada, C. L., & Guzmán, A. M. S. d. (2009).
366 Evaluation of chlorine, benzalkonium chloride and lactic acid as sanitizers for reducing
367 *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 and *Yersinia enterocolitica* on fresh vegetables. *Food Control*,
368 20(3), 262–268. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2008.05.012>
- 369 Wang, C., Chang, T., Yang, H., & Cui, M. (2015). Antibacterial mechanism of lactic acid on
370 physiological and morphological properties of *Salmonella Enteritidis*, *Escherichia coli* and
371 *Listeria monocytogenes*. *Food Control*, 47, 231–236.
372 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2014.06.034>
- 373 Zhao, T., Zhao, P., & Doyle, M. P. (2009). Inactivation of *Salmonella* and *Escherichia coli*
374 O157:H7 on lettuce and poultry skin by combinations of levulinic acid and sodium dodecyl
375 sulfate. *Journal of Food Protection*, 72(5), 928–36. Retrieved from
376 <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19517717>
- 377 Ziuzina, D., Boehm, D., Patil, S., Cullen, P. J., & Bourke, P. (2015). Cold plasma inactivation of
378 bacterial biofilms and reduction of quorum sensing regulated virulence factors. *PLoS ONE*,
379 10(9), 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0138209>

***Highlights (for review)**

Highlights

- Red chicory leaves were treated with Lactic Acid, SDS and ACP to control VTEC and Listeria
- LA and SDS had synergistic effect with ACP in inactivation of VTEC and Listeria
- Freshness, colour and texture of the leaves were slightly affected by the analysed treatments

Figure

Figure 1

A

B

Figure

Figure captions

Figure 1 – Boxplot of microbial counts (Log CFU/cm²) in treated and control samples (verotoxin-producing *E. coli* (A); *L. monocytogenes* (B)).

The summary statistics used to create a box and whisker plot are the median of the data, the lower and upper quartiles (25% and 75%) and the minimum and maximum values (empty dots). Upper whisker = $\min(\max(x), Q_3 + 1.5 * IQR)$; lower whisker = $\max(\min(x), Q_1 - 1.5 * IQR)$; where $IQR = Q_3 - Q_1$, the box length. CFU numbers <1 were assigned a value equal to 0.9.

Table 1. Results of colour analysis of red chicory leaves stored for 1 day.

Treatment	Storage time	lour para			
		L*	a*	b*	C*
(LA+SDS) 5'	B A	32.2 ± 1.4 ^a	22.7 ± 1.2 ^a	7.4 ± 0.5 ^a	23.9 ± 1.3 ^a
		31.3 ± 2.3 ^a	24.0 ± 1.8 ^a	7.4 ± 0.5 ^a	25.2 ± 1.9 ^a
	1 day	32.4 ± 1.1 ^a	23.1 ± 1.6 ^a	7.2 ± 0.6 ^a	24.1 ± 1.6 ^a
(LA+SDS) 5'+ACP 15'	B A	34.5 ± 0.8 ^a	23.7 ± 1.5 ^a	7.0 ± 1.3 ^a	24.7 ± 1.5 ^a
		33.2 ± 1.7 ^a	24.8 ± 2.2 ^a	7.5 ± 0.6 ^a	25.9 ± 2.3 ^a
	1 day	34.4 ± 2.0 ^a	22.7 ± 1.3 ^a	7.9 ± 0.7 ^a	23.7 ± 1.2 ^a
(LA+SDS) 10'	B A	35.8 ± 1.1 ^a	25.5 ± 1.1 ^a	7.9 ± 0.5 ^a	26.7 ± 1.2 ^a
		34.1 ± 2.5 ^a	25.5 ± 2.5 ^a	8.0 ± 0.9 ^a	26.7 ± 1.0 ^a
	1 day	35.1 ± 2.4 ^a	24.2 ± 2.3 ^a	8.9 ± 0.6 ^a	24.2 ± 2.5 ^a
(LA+SDS) 10'+ACP 15'	B A	35.8 ± 1.4 ^a	27.3 ± 1.2 ^a	8.9 ± 0.6 ^a	28.7 ± 1.1 ^a
		34.7 ± 1.3 ^a	27.7 ± 1.0 ^a	8.2 ± 0.5 ^a	28.9 ± 1.3 ^a
	1 day	34.8 ± 1.4 ^a	26.3 ± 1.8 ^a	8.8 ± 0.8 ^a	27.2 ± 1.8 ^a
(LA+SDS) 15'	B A	32.8 ± 2.4 ^a	24.6 ± 1.1 ^a	8.6 ± 1.0 ^a	26.1 ± 1.1 ^a
		32.5 ± 2.5 ^a	25.1 ± 1.0 ^a	9.0 ± 0.6 ^a	26.7 ± 1.6 ^a
	1 day	31.3 ± 1.4 ^a	24.0 ± 1.8 ^a	8.9 ± 0.6 ^a	25.0 ± 0.7 ^a
(LA+SDS) 15'+ACP 15'	B A	33.9 ± 0.9 ^a	24.3 ± 1.2 ^a	7.9 ± 0.7 ^a	25.6 ± 1.2 ^a
		33.0 ± 2.5 ^a	25.5 ± 2.5 ^a	8.1 ± 0.8 ^a	26.8 ± 2.0 ^a
	1 day	34.4 ± 1.9 ^a	23.3 ± 2.3 ^a	8.8 ± 0.8 ^a	25.3 ± 2.3 ^a
SDS 10'	B A	31.0 ± 2.4 ^a	24.4 ± 2.4 ^a	7.4 ± 1.0 ^a	25.5 ± 1.3 ^a
		31.1 ± 1.9 ^a	23.1 ± 1.9 ^a	7.2 ± 0.7 ^a	24.2 ± 1.9 ^a
	1 day	32.2 ± 1.6 ^a	22.9 ± 1.7 ^a	7.5 ± 0.3 ^a	23.9 ± 1.7 ^a
SDS 10'+ACP 15'	B A	31.6 ± 2.6 ^a	23.9 ± 2.5 ^a	7.6 ± 0.5 ^a	25.0 ± 1.5 ^a
		32.0 ± 3.2 ^a	22.8 ± 3.2 ^a	7.4 ± 0.9 ^a	24.0 ± 2.1 ^a
	1 day	31.4 ± 1.4 ^a	24.4 ± 1.3 ^a	7.5 ± 0.5 ^a	25.2 ± 1.3 ^a

Note: B: before the treatment, A: immediately after the treatment. The same lowercase letters denote no significant differences during storage, within the same sample and the same treatment time (Tukey test, P < 0.05).

Table 2. Results of sensory test of red chicory leaves stored for 1 days.

Treatment	Storage time	Sensory attributes				
		Freshness	Colour	Odour	Texture	Overall acceptability
(LA+SDS) 5'	B A	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
		5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
	1 day	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
(LA+SDS) 5'+ACP 15'	B A	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
		5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	4.8 $\pm$ 0.4 ^b	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	8.8 $\pm$ 0.4 ^b
	1 day	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	4.8 $\pm$ 0.4 ^b	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	8.0 $\pm$ 0 ^c
(LA+SDS) 10'	B A	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
		5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
	1 day	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
(LA+SDS) 10' +ACP 15'	B A	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
		5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
	1 day	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	4.8 $\pm$ 0.4 ^b	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	8.8 $\pm$ 0.4 ^b
(LA+SDS) 15'	B A	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
		5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
	1 day	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
(LA+SDS) 15' + ACP 15'	B A	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
		5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	4.8 $\pm$ 0 ^b	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
	1 day	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	4.8 $\pm$ 0 ^b	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	8.8 $\pm$ 0.4 ^b
SDS 10'	B A	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
		5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
	1 day	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
SDS 10' + ACP 15'	B A	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
		5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	9.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a
	1 day	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	4.8 $\pm$ 0.4 ^b	5.0 $\pm$ 0 ^a	8.8 $\pm$ 0.4 ^b

Note: B: before the treatment, A:immediately after the treatment. The same lowercase letters denote no significant differences during storage, within the same sample and the same treatment time (Tukey test, $P < 0.05$).